

Program Name: **Business and Management**

Program Contact: **Sujata Verma**

Academic Year: **2023**

Status:

Updated on:

## **INTRODUCTION: WHAT IS A PROGRAM REVIEW FOR?**

The goal of program review is to assess how well our programs are doing. Program review asks us to:

- **Reflect on the state of student learning or support in our disciplines and programs, by discussing:**
  - **efforts to achieve equity across student populations and modes of delivery;**
  - **results of assessment activities aimed at improving or researching student learning;**
  - **new challenges or changes to the program.**
- **Identify resources that we need to change and improve.**

Though program review is tied to accreditation we want program review to be meaningful for us. This means we want to use program review to highlight and celebrate what is working, identify what is not and to figure out what we can do about it. Program review also provides a chance to assess how those things work in practice and improve our practices to serve our students even better. It also serves to create cross-campus understanding and dialogue and make more informed decisions in our teaching and programs. Program review is also an opportunity to advocate for change and for resources by showing need and equity issues that we need additional support to be able to address.

### **1. Description of Program (200-400 words)**

- **Provide a brief description of the program and how it supports the following:**
  - [CSM Mission and Values Statements](#)
  - [CSM Statement of Solidarity](#)
  - [CSM's Strategic Priorities](#)
  - [SMCCCD's Strategic Goals](#)
  - [CSM Forward 2028 - Education Master Plan](#)
- **Identify any factors, including federal, state, or local initiatives, that have impacted the program and the students served**

*Guidance Notes:*

*Legislative impacts and other mandates*

- *AB 705/AB1705 and changes to curriculum, course sequencing, and student placement in math, English, and ESL*
- *SB893 (California College Promise) and free community college*
- *AB540 and the nonresident tuition exemption*
- *AB1232 and ESL student resident tuition fees*

- ***Some programming was impacted or supported by CARES funding. For some programs, consider that CARES funding may have impacted the service model or instructional mode including any mandates for applying an equity lens, student access and use of technology and the resources that students were able to access and use in person and remotely.***
- ***QOTL/DE training requirement, for instruction only***
- ***The implementation of the Student Success Link***
- ***SB803***

CSM's Business/Management Department is an integral part of CSM's Business & Technology Division. Business and Management Programs offer an array of certifications and degree tracks and are designed to prepare students seeking to launch a career, start their own business, or diversify knowledge and skills for promotion in their existing career.

Taught by experienced faculty who also have industry experience in various business fields, the business programs offer students a strong academic foundation preparing them for a four-year degree. Additional programs, such as certificates, give non-transfer students the opportunity to learn from applied business courses, such as entrepreneurship and management courses. Our business department has strong ethical values and encourages students to look at the content through a global lens.

Business is one of the most popular declared majors with one of the highest numbers of transfer degrees. We are a small team, with just four full-timers, two of which are in tenure-track. Despite this, the business/management department awards the second highest number of degrees at CSM. Business/Management is a core program/college offering essential to college enrollment and deserves administrative attention and resource allocation.

The department seeks to improve student success by adapting and updating assessment, curricula, pedagogy, and outcomes; promote academic excellence by introducing and enhancing research methodology and academic ethics by integrating and upholding institutional policies with regards to plagiarism; and develop programs and services, such as updated curricula, reassessing degree requirements, and introducing market/workforce-responsive programs, thereby increasing enrollment and retention, and reinforcing fiscal stability. Examples include the launch of three new degrees, A.S. in Business Analytics and A.S. in International Business, in Fall 2022 and Public and Non-Profit Administration in Fall 2023. Further, existing programs, such as Human Resources Management and Project Management, have been updated to current industry standards. All management credentials were made to stack. For example, a certificate of specialization in management, stacks into an achievement, stacks into an associate degree enabling students to receive credentials and continue if they wish.

Our programs are intentionally designed to articulate with local 4-year Universities to increase higher education attainment in San Mateo County. For example, the Business Analytics and International Business AS Degree Programs are CSU/UC and Independent Colleges transferable. The addition of the new programs seeks to enhance institutional dialog by working cross-

disciple/intra-division and integrating campus resources to further enhance the student experience and relevance of curricula to real-world demand.

Students attending the business and management programs reflect the diversity of our community and, per the CSM Diversity Statement; our division fosters a safe environment that encourages the exchange of ideas that promotes equal opportunity including the college-wide influx of international students, which offers unique opportunities to bring a more global perspective to business issues and curricula. In addition to the well-rounded business education, we contribute to the creation of a campus culture that is inclusive, antiracist, and equity-advancing. We strive to make all students feel safe in a learning environment that celebrates their individual identities.

The program also seeks to meet regional economic development needs by providing students with a foundation of core business specifically towards business ownership and gainful employment. This mix of business concepts and training gives students the necessary skills to be successful in the 21st century business environment. Students learn about many aspects of business including finance, marketing, business analytics, international business, management and more. We continue to offer flexible instructional modalities including in-person, hybrid, and online asynchronous to increase student access and success. All the full-time faculty and most of our part-time faculty already have experience with online teaching and continue to upgrade their skills through formal QOTL1 and QOTL2 training.

In response to the rapidly changing contemporary labor market demand, funding from the Strong Workforce Initiative has helped the Business and Management Programs to remain current and create new courses and programs. We have continually been launching new business and management courses, certificates, and degrees. These efforts are made possible through collaboration with California's Strong Workforce Initiative—a CTE-focused funding program that is guiding curricula development/evolution.

Federal and California State financial aid programs like the CARES funding, SB542 etc. benefited specific student populations and provided them with financial support. Gov. Gavin Newsom signed Senate Bill (SB) 893, making community college free for most San Mateo County residents. The bill took effect in spring 2023 to increase student enrollment, student access and equity to college education.

The impact on AB705 was negligible in our department. The Math and English Departments took on most of the weight of the regulation by the Board of Governors. Our prerequisite and recommended preps were realigned to comply with AB705. Similarly, there was no impact of SB803 on the Business/Management department.

## **2. Results of Previous Program Review (200-500 words)**

- a) Describe the results of your previous Program Review's action plan and identified equity gaps.**
  - **Previous Goals**
  - **Results Achieved**
  - **Changes Implemented**

- **Plans still in progress**
- **Any notable or surprising results and outcomes**

***Guidance Notes:***

***Comment on anything you completed or continue to assess, as well as older goals that were potentially interrupted by COVID, and if you still feel that those are worth pursuing or if priorities have changed.***

Our goals in the previous program review, 2021-22, were to:

- a. increase enrollment through employing late start sections, expanding Business Analytics, International Business and Human Resources Programs and effective marketing at the department, college, and district level
- b. to identify and close equity gaps presented by COVID and 100% online modality

We increased enrollments through the vigorous implementation of our action plan. Our enrollments increased from 1599 in 2020-2021 to 1993 in 2022-2023. Offering courses in multiple modalities- in-person, hybrid and online, filled the needs of our diverse students. Our late-start courses fill up consistently and it has been a good strategy to increase enrollments.

A new faculty was hired for teaching Business Analytics and International Business courses starting Fall2022, expanding our course offerings to better align with the job market demands. There was an attempt made by our small department of four full-time faculty to market the new courses by putting up fliers around campus, word-of-mouth promotions and setting up tables at the campus-wide career events. More marketing efforts are needed at the college and district level.

In our previous program review, the department aspired to create sufficient and cohesive physical spaces for teaching/offices. General problems in classrooms were identified including temperature control, audio/visual technology, floorplans, and comfort. Temperature control is still largely a problem that exists in Building 14 and has not been remedied. We recommend temperature control remote control for instructors in the business labs. In rooms 14-101 and 14-105, the computers and chairs were purchased ten years ago and need to be upgraded on a propriety basis. We hope that the classrooms can be remodeled and modernized.

**b) Explain any curriculum or programmatic changes since last program review**

- **To specific courses, or to any discipline as a whole**
- **Includes degree, certificate, or course sequences, program delivery or structure, etc.**

***Guidance Notes:***

***Curriculum or programmatic changes:***

- ***Most changes are related to returning to in-person instruction or continuing with a remote, hybrid, or multimodal environment.***
- ***There are also changes that were part of Guided Pathways degree planning and general curricular and programmatic updates to better meet student needs***

- ***QOTL/DE training requirement, for instruction only***

Instructors were already teaching 100% online courses in our programs before the pandemic. Instructors that were already familiar with teaching online became more proficient through formal training from QOTL (Quality Online Teaching and Learning) and less formal training from peers. Our department has been offering a mix of in-person, hybrid and online courses beginning Fall 2021. Instructors continue to learn and update their online teaching skills through Quality Online Teaching and Learning (QOTL) I and II Courses offered by our fantastic instructional designers.

We continue to develop labor market skillset relevant curriculum by adapting existing programs (certificates, courses, degrees) and developing new ones. We created innovative programs in Associate of Science Degrees in International Business and Business Analytics (Fall 2022) along with certificates and new associated courses. In fall 2022, the Human Resources certificate was updated to Society for Human Resource Management Professionals curriculum requirements standard, new courses and new certificate of achievement was embedded into the AS Degree in Management Program. However, recent programs need to be supported by vigorous and effective marketing at the district and college level to succeed and more needs to be done in this area.

As a response to the California Virtual Campus – Online Education Initiative (CVC-OEI), initiative, all programs in our department can be completed online provided all the GE classes are offered online as well.

**c) Discipline-level and SLO (Student Learning Outcomes) assessment/Student Services and SAO (Service Area Outcomes) assessment: Describe learning or area assessment plans implemented since last Program Review, including any activities undertaken to address equity or delivery mode gaps. Your summary should explain:**

- **SLO/SAO**
  - **What did the assessment focus on?**
  - **Was it discipline/program/service-specific or interdisciplinary/a collaboration between programs or services?**
  - **Why was it prioritized (e.g., equity issue, key disciplinary issue, etc.)?**
- **Assessment results**
  - **What was the activity or intervention?**
  - **What were the outcomes?**
- **Program improvements implemented**
  - **What did you learn from it?**
- **What changed?**

***Guidance Notes:***

***The assessment cycle documents both your efforts to identify ways to improve SLOs (Student Learning Outcomes) and SAOs (Service Area Outcomes) and your evaluation of these efforts. Use your previous SLO/SAO assessment (section 3c in 2021 Program Review).***

- ***Discuss efforts to improve student learning, engagement and/or service delivery***
- ***Focus on collective changes in the discipline or program that were enacted***

- *It also may be helpful to look at documentation, like meeting notes discussing assessment issues, to synthesize the interventions or changes*
- *Discuss the effectiveness of your program’s planning to assess SLOs/SAOs. Was the process collaborative? How do you plan to improve the process?*

Table 1: SLO’s and Assessment Results

SLOs/SAOs	Assessment Results	Program Improvements Implemented
<p><b>1.</b> Business Administration student learning objectives are to</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>a) prepare and analyze financial statements</li> <li>b) prepare and manage an operating budget</li> <li>c) evaluate the impact of current economic conditions on a business</li> <li>d) assess the legal implications of business decisions.</li> </ul>	<p>Student Success Rate is 76.5% and the Student Retention Rate is 89.2%.</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>● Updated SLO’s as needed.</li> </ul>
<p><b>2.</b> Business Management student learning objectives are to</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>a) critically analyze business management concepts and principles as applied to a business situation</li> <li>b) explain the role of human resources in an organization</li> <li>c) apply leadership and team building theories in the workplace.</li> </ul>	<p>Student Success Rate is 66.7% and the Student Retention Rate is 82.1%.</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>● Updated SLO’s as needed.</li> </ul>

Since the last Program Review, all course and program SLOs were streamlined and aligned with courses and course numbers with district colleges. We are streamlining our course SLO’s to align with our Program Learning Outcomes.

For Management, Classroom Teaching FTEF data for 2022-23 shows that only 23% of the courses are taught by full-time faculty. There is a need to hire more full-time faculty to teach management courses.

**3. Current Program Review (200-400 words)**  
**Context**

Over the last several years, we have undergone a collective shift in our understanding of anti-racism, equity, and systemic barriers. We have also seen societal inequities highlighted by COVID in ways that were not as explicit before and have been called collectively to be accountable to recognizing and changing our interactions, teaching, policies, procedures, and engagement with systems of oppression, including our own institution.

- a) **Student population equity: Discuss any gaps in student success, persistence, satisfaction, utilization or enrollment across student populations (statistics provided for ethnicity, first-generation, age, gender, and total enrollment), or student population served.**
  - **Findings: What has changed from the previous program review?**
  - **Analysis: What factors do you feel contribute to these gaps?**
  - **Resources: If you were granted a resource request, please note what that was and the impact it had.**
  - **Plans to address opportunity gaps: What has your program done to address these gaps? Include information on:**
    - interventions implemented
    - any successes in closing gaps
    - ongoing challenges

**Guidance: Things to consider:**

- *Changes to student populations accessing your programs/services because of shifts in modality/access (either return to in-person instruction/service delivery or maintenance of online or hybrid modalities)*
- *Access to free college through AB540*
- *Dual enrollment classes or community-based classes in your program*
- *Societal and contextual impacts on students - access to technology, transportation, need to increase work hours/no longer being able to work*
- *New things you did to engage students, and which student populations in particular*
- *You may use the chart to organize your responses. Alternatively, you can organize your responses in another logical manner to answer the questions.*

Table 2: Current enrollment statistics for Business and Management department (2022-23) compared to the the college statistics as well as for previous Program Review (2021-22)

2022-23	Ethnicity	First Gen	Age	Gender	Total
<b>Business Enrollments (duplicated)</b>	Latinx 34.4% White 26.2% Asian 16.1% Filipino 7.5% African American 2.5% Pacific Islander 2.1% Other 7.3% Unrecorded 3.4% Native American 0.1%	47.9% of our students are the first in their family to go to college.	74.4% 24 yrs. and under  15.9 % Ages 25-34  9.7% over 35 yrs.	45.3% Female  52.8% Male  1.9 % non-disclosed or non-binary	1636 students

<b>Mgmt. Enrollments (duplicated)</b>	Latinx 26.6% White 30.3% Asian 18.2% Filipino 5% African American 6.4% Pacific Islander 1.4% Other 7.3% Unrecorded 4.5% Native American 0.3%	47.6% of our students are the first in their family to go to college.	42% 24 yrs. and under  31.4 % Ages 25-34  26.6% over 35 yrs.	62.2% Female  36.1% Male  1.3 % non-disclosed or non-binary	357 Students
<b>Business and Mgmt. (20-21) duplicated</b>	Latinx 33% White 24% Asian 20% Filipino 6% Multi Races 10% African American 4% Pacific Islander 2% Unknown 1% Native American 0%	48% of enrollments were by students who are the first in their family to go to college	60% Under 24 yrs.  23% Ages 25-34  17% over 35 yrs.	48% Female  50% Male  2% Unknown	1,611 enrollments
<b>College Enrollments (duplicated)</b>	Latinx 35% White 26% Asian 16% Filipino 6% Multiracial 8% Black 3% Pacific Islander 3% Unknown 3% Native American 0%	47% of enrollments were by students who are the first in their family to go to college.	76% 24 yrs. and under  13% Ages 25-34  11% over 35 yrs.	48% Female  50% Male  2% non-disclosed or non-binary	37,014 enrollments

Table 2 shows that student enrollments in Business/Management programs have increased, which reflects the high and growing demand for these disciplines. There has been a huge increase of more than 10% point in the students aged 24 years and under, reflecting the trends in overall college demographics.

In the business program, male enrollment exceeded the female enrollment, while in the management program, the reverse was true.

There is evidence of wide disparities in the ethnic composition of students enrolled in Business/Management department. Latinx, White and Asian students far outnumber the African American, Filipino, Pacific Islanders and Native American students, again mirroring the overall campus-wide student distribution by ethnicity.



Table 3: The following table gives the percent success rates from 20-21 to 22-23

2022-23	Ethnicity	First Gen	Age	Gender	Total
<b>Business Success Rates</b>	Latinx 73.0% White 78.1% Asian 86.5% Filipino 84.4% African American 48.8% Pacific Islander 51.4% Other 74.0% Unrecorded 78.2% Native American 0%	70.8% of our students are the first in their family to go to college.	78% for 24 yrs. and under  68 % for Ages 25-34  73% for over 35 yrs.	76.4% Female  76.6% Male  74.2% non-disclosed or non-binary	1636 students
<b>Mgmt. Success Rates</b>	Latinx 61.1% White 75.0% Asian 75.9% Filipino 66.7% African American 47.8% Pacific Islander 20.0% Other 50.0% Unrecorded 75% Native American 100%	47.6% of our students are the first in their family to go to college.	Around 73% for 24 yrs. and under  60 % for Ages 25-34  65% for over 35 yrs.	62.2% Female  66.7% Male  50 % non-disclosed or non-binary	357 Students

Table 4: Comparison with the previous 2020-2021 Program Review

Division: 4411 – Business BUS.				Division: 4411 – Business BUS.			
INDICATOR	Academic Year			STUDENT SUCCESS INDICATORS	Academic Year		
	17-18	18-19	19-20		17-18	18-19	19-20
Enrollments (Dup. Headcnt)	920	1233	1283	Success %	78.0%	77.3%	76.1%
WSCH	2819.4	3769.0	3945.2	Retention %	90.0%	88.6%	88.0%
FTEs	94.0	125.6	131.5	Withdraw %	10.0%	11.4%	12.0%
LOAD (WSCH/FTEF)*	518.9	491.6	458.7				
Classroom Teaching FTEF				Classroom Teaching FTEF			
Full-time FTEF	1.2	4.7	4.2	Sections	Academic Year		
Adjunct FTEF	3.8	3.0	3.0	Total	17-18	18-19	19-20
Overload FTEF (FT Faculty)	0.4	0.0	1.4	% CTE	100.0%	100.0%	100.0%
Retired FTEF	0.0	0.0	0.0	% Transferable	0.0%	0.0%	0.0%
Total FTEF	5.4	7.7	8.6	% Degree Applicable	0.0%	0.0%	0.0%
Percent Full-time	29.4%	60.9%	65.1%	% Basic Skills	0.0%	0.0%	0.0%

  

INDICATOR	Academic Year			STUDENT SUCCESS INDICATORS	Academic Year		
	20-21	21-22	22-23		20-21	21-22	22-23
Enrollments (Dup. Headcnt)	1341	1447	1636	Success %	81.1%	76.0%	76.5%
WSCH	4444.9	4674.8	5036.0	Retention %	91.6%	89.4%	89.2%
FTEs	148.2	155.8	167.9	Withdraw %	8.4%	10.6%	10.8%
LOAD (WSCH/FTEF)*	435.8	441.0	419.7				
Classroom Teaching FTEF				Classroom Teaching FTEF			
Full-time FTEF	4.4	6.4	7.6	Sections	Academic Year		
Adjunct FTEF	3.0	3.6	3.4	Total	20-21	21-22	22-23
Overload FTEF (FT Faculty)	2.8	0.6	1.0	% CTE	100.0%	100.0%	95.0%
Retired FTEF	0.0	0.0	0.0	% Transferable	0.0%	0.0%	5.0%
Total FTEF	10.2	10.6	12.0	% Degree Applicable	0.0%	0.0%	0.0%
Percent Full-time	70.6%	66.0%	71.7%	% Basic Skills	0.0%	0.0%	0.0%

While the student enrollments have been trending upwards, there is a slightly downward trend noticed in the overall success rates compared to the last program review.

Success rates for African American students continue to be more than twenty percentage points lower compared to Asians and White students. For this program review cycle, there is no noticeable gap in the success rates of males and females. In terms of the age distribution of students, there is an increase in students 24 years and under. Not only has the enrollment gone up for this age group, but also their success rate is the highest.

More needs to be done to recruit African American students and students of other ethnicities to campus. Continuing support is essential for students. Due to limitations of online learning, student-to-student contact in distance education sections has been increased by including peer review assignments, discussion forums, study groups, and group assignments to online and hybrid courses. We reached out to the ITS (Information Technology Services) to loan laptops to students who lacked equipment to access the internet. The department has made a concerted effort to locate and get low-cost textbooks. Beginning in spring 2021, at least 5 sections each semester has offered zero-cost textbooks.

Table 5: Summary of Findings

<b>Findings</b>	<b>Analysis</b>	<b>Resources</b>	<b>Plans to Address Opportunity Gaps</b>
<p><b>1.</b> Records indicate of the 1636 students enrolled in the Business Program, 45.3% were Female and 52.8% were Male</p>		<p>CSM Research Request, Fall 2023 Submission Cycle: Student Success and Core Program Indicators Academic Years 2020/21 to 2022/23</p>	<p>None</p>
<p><b>2.</b> Records indicate that of the 1,636 students enrolled, 74.4 % are under 24 yrs., 15.9 % are ages 25-34, and 9.7 % are over 35 yrs.</p>		<p>CSM Research Request, Fall 2023 Submission Cycle: Student Success and Core Program Indicators Academic Years 2020/21 to 2022/23</p>	<p>None</p>
<p><b>3.</b> Records indicate that of the 1,636 students enrolled, 34.4% are Hispanic White 26.2% Asian 16.1% Filipino 7.5% African American 2.5% Pacific Islander 2.1% Other 7.3% Unrecorded 3.4% Native American 0.1%</p>		<p>CSM Research Request, Fall 2023 Submission Cycle: Student Success and Core Program Indicators Academic Years 2020/21 to 2022/23</p>	<p>None</p>

- b) **Modes of Delivery equity:** Discuss any gaps in student success, persistence, satisfaction, utilization or enrollment, and student population served across different delivery modes. Please comment on in person services/instruction vs hybrid services options/instruction vs completely online services/instruction.
- **Changes since last Program Review:** What has changed, in terms of gaps since last program review?
  - **Analysis of gaps:** What factors do you feel contribute to these gaps?
  - **Plans to address opportunity gaps:** What has your program done to address these equity gaps? Include information on:
    - interventions implemented
    - any successes in closing gaps
    - ongoing challenges
    -

**Guidance Notes:** *We know that modalities of every program have shifted coming out of COVID and returning to in-person instruction and services with long-term and permanent impacts on all our programs and how we interface with students.*

- *Document changes related to and as a result shifts in modality.*
  - *Distance Education/remote service delivery changes*
  - *Gaps in working with students due to the shift to online and remote instruction and services.*
  - *Return to in-person instruction and service delivery*
  - *Shifts in modality because of campus closures, i.e., fires, power outages, etc.*

**Instructional considerations:**

- *New pedagogical practices arising from shifting to distance modes of delivery and/or shifting back to in-person modes of delivery*
- *The uptake of modern technology in instructional practices - did this impact student access, in-class organization, interaction?*
  - *For example, having a planned online course for students who are intentionally taking online courses, vs having online courses for all students, regardless of their modality preference*
  - *For example, implementing/using Canvas as the online course organization tool*
- *Casting new light on existing opportunity gaps*
  - *For example, grading flexibility for students and the impact it may have on them*
- *Course scheduling or offering changes that you may anticipate knowing what you know now.*
  - *For example, are there courses that you would like to continue to offer online that were not previously offered? Or courses that you feel should not be offered online, multimodal, or in-person, given the course material and having had the experience of doing so for the past year?*
- *Having access to technology/multimodal rooms in your department*

**Student Services considerations:**

- ***What strengths or weaknesses were highlighted by the shift to online service delivery? Did you notice that you were able to meet a need/fill a gap with offering a service online that has never been offered that way before?***
  - *For example, having to create online versions and mechanisms for filling out, submitting, and processing forms in ways that are accessible and effective*
- ***What strengths or weaknesses were highlighted by the shift back to in-person services? Did you notice that you were able to meet a need/fill a gap with offering a service in-person that had never been offered that way before?***
- ***Consider the impact of telework plans and mixed schedules (3-2 vs 4-1 remote work schedules)***
- ***Is there an aspect of online/in-person service delivery whose effectiveness you want to assess, and what is your plan for doing so?***
  - *For ex, having online zoom drop-in hours for students to ask questions or get help*

*You may use the chart to organize your responses. Alternatively, you can organize your responses in another logical manner to answer the questions.*

Table 6: Delivery-mode Comparison of Student Success in the Business Program 2021-23

	All Sections	Face-to-Face	Total	Distance Modes		
				Online	Hybrid	Synchronous
#Sections	140	23	117	105	10	2
#Enrollments	3,764	525	3,239	2,946	259	34
%Success	76.9	80.4	76.3	76.4	74.5	79.4
%Retention	89.9	90.1	89.9	89.8	89.6	100.0

Table 7: Delivery-mode Comparison of Student Success in the Management Program 2021-23

	All Sections	Face-to-Face	Total	Distance Modes		
				Online	Hybrid	Synchronous
#Sections	28	3	25	17	1	7
#Enrollments	687	40	647	469	16	162
%Success	73.4	82.5	72.8	67.4	87.5	87.0
%Retention	87.8	92.5	87.5	84.9	87.5	95.1

The impact on our department due to COVID-19 is undeniable and long lasting. Fortunately, most of our sections were already offered as DE (Distance Education) making the transition to remote learning less challenging. We will continue to offer different modes of delivery including online and hybrid course delivery.

The transition to remote learning presented resource challenges for some students. Some students were unable to access the internet due to lack of a computer. Fortunately, we were able to overcome the challenge by requesting loaner laptops from ITS.

Our department implemented proctoring software (Proctorio) to ensure academic integrity for quizzes and exams. There was a need for proctoring software since we increased our online class offering. Also, some Universities require proctored exams for courses to be eligible for transfer.

In our previous Program Review, our department had an enrollment growth strategy to increase enrollment by offering more sections online. In addition to online courses, our department will continue to offer late start online classes to boost enrollment in the department.

Table 8: Key Performance Indicators for Business Program 2022-23

<b>Changes since last Program Review</b>	<b>Analysis of Gaps</b>	<b>Plans to Address Opportunity Gaps</b>
1. Student Success Rate is 76.9%	None	No intervention.
2. Student Retention Rate is 89.9%	None	No intervention.
3. Student Withdrawal Rate is 10.1%	None	No intervention.

**(c) Challenges and Opportunities: Describe any other particular challenges, opportunities, or other factors that impact the success of your program (e.g., natural or health disasters, assessing whether a degree program is meeting its learning outcomes, developing new degree programs or courses, adapting to a changing student population, keeping a flagging program alive, starting a learning community, resources, etc.).**

**Guidance Notes: COVID resulted in unique challenges and opportunities that impacted on our programs.**

- *Shift to remote learning and service delivery*
- *Return to in-person learning and service delivery*
- *Grading equitably and acknowledging the impact of systemic issues*
- *Have you observed/found any changes to student interactions/instruction in the remote environment?*
  - *For ex, changes in access, services to, engagement with evening students or working students*
- *Have you observed/found any changes in collaboration with colleagues/other departments in the remote environment?*

**For ex, increased ability to attend meetings, work on projects, cross/interdepartmental collaboration**

After the 100% online modality in offering courses during the pandemic, we do not anticipate going back to 100% in-person modality. Traditionally in-person instructors learned to adjust to teach in a 100% online modality. Students who never took online classes prior to the pandemic were exposed to 100% online modality. For some instructors and students, their skeptical attitude towards 100% online modality shifted to acceptance. Some students even began to prefer 100% online courses. There is an opportunity to increase enrollments by offering more flexibility to students.

The addition of new Public and Non-Profit Administration AS degree and certificate allows our management program to impart key skills that enable leaders to drive strategy, innovate, and lead change across organizations, whether private, public, or nonprofit. But merely offering new programs in Public and Non-Profit Administration, International Business, and Business Analytics, is not enough. For these programs to succeed, we need more resources in marketing the programs, and hiring full-time faculty to teach; we need state-of-the-art computer labs and the latest software. We need tutoring support and more loaner laptops to close the equity gaps.

#### **4. Planning**

**a) Discipline-level and SLO (Student Learning Outcomes) assessment/Student Services and SAO (Service Area Outcomes) assessment for 2023-2025: Describe learning or area assessment plans for this Program Review cycle, including any activities planned to address equity or delivery mode gaps. Your summary should explain:**

- **SLO/SAO**
  - **What will your assessment focus on?**
  - **Is it discipline/program/service-specific or will it be interdisciplinary/a collaboration between programs or services?**
  - **Why is it prioritized (e.g., equity issue, key disciplinary issue, etc.)?**
- **Assessment plan**
  - **What is the planned activity or intervention?**
  - **Describe next steps and the timeline for your SLO/SAO assessment**
- **Resources for SLO/SAO assessment**
  - **What resources will you need to assess changes (i.e., PRIE support in the form of specific data, surveys, etc.)?**

#### ***Guidance Notes:***

***The assessment cycle documents both your efforts to identify ways to improve SLOs and SAOs, and your evaluation of these efforts. As always, you choose what you feel needs improvement. You might choose to look at a skill or knowledge area specific to your program that seems in need of improvement or investigation, or you might choose to look at an aspect of student learning or outcome already identified in other parts of this Review (e.g., anti-racism, equity, modes of delivery).***

- ***Discuss efforts to improve student learning, engagement and/or service delivery***
- ***Focus on collective changes in the discipline or program that were enacted***

***It also may be helpful to look at documentation, like meeting notes discussing assessment issues, to synthesize the interventions or changes***

No Assessments planned at this time.

#### **b) Program goals**

**Based on your current review of your program's equity gaps, learning assessments, challenges, and opportunities, identify specific goals and plans. Please note that whereas SLOs/SAOs involve assessing and measuring a specific skill or knowledge students will be**

able to do/understand upon successful completion of a course, program, service, and/or degree/certificate, program goals reflect overall aspects of your program or service you hope to improve.

Please note that closing equity gaps is a college-wide priority. If there are significant equity gaps in student success, persistence, satisfaction, utilization or enrollment, and student population served in your program, these should be addressed in at least one of your goals (see 3a and 3b).

For each goal, you should include:

- A brief description of the issue being addressed (equity gap, etc.)
- What actions you plan to take
- What measurable outcomes you hope to achieve
- A timeline
- Who is responsible
- What support do you anticipate needing to achieve your goals and plans, including:
  - Professional development activities
  - Institutional support
  - Collaborations
  - Training
  - Resources

**Guidance Notes:**

*In framing your goals, especially related to closing equity gaps, you may want to reference all the resources noted in section 1. This area is appropriate for commenting on how you will respond to this.*

- *On anti-racism: How exactly does your area plan to respond to the Statement of Solidarity? What might this work look like in your area? Is there a specific anti-racism revision to your curriculum, pedagogy, or service delivery whose effectiveness you want to single out for assessment, and how?*

*We have gone through changes in how we interact with students, teach, provide services, and meet student needs. There is a lot that we do not know, which can inform our planning to investigate for the future.*

- *What opportunities have presented themselves that should continue and what we can learn from this? This is a chance to be innovative in how we make changes to how we have always done things, recognizing that the reality of students, how education takes place, and society has undergone a fundamental shift.*
  - *What aspect of this has solved a problem that we have never seen or acknowledged?*
  - *What can we learn from this that we do not want to just give up or let go of? What things have we discovered in practice that you feel do not work well or must be changed and because of the changes, work better?*
    - *For example, students may not have streamlined, consistent access to the internet at home, especially our most marginalized students. This is not*

*a new problem, but it was highlighted in a novel way due to COVID. This also does not mean we should not increase our options of online and hybrid courses, as those meet the needs of some students in ways, we have never been able to before. How can we respond to this in a way that serves students best?*

- *We also know that the student experience and reality has fundamentally, and permanently, changed. How are we being responsive to that in a way that is also mindful of disproportionate impacts of marginalized students?*

**General guidance on framing your goals:**

- *Focus on what you can change - we know we cannot tackle it all at once*
  - *For example, focus just on student engagement, or differences in how student contact takes place, or moving to open resources or having DE sections of a course available that has never been offered before*
- *Be mindful that you have a 2-year cycle that you are working with - make sure to choose something that is realistic and attainable to address in that timeframe with the resources you have access to*
  - *If you need additional resources, then be sure to note those*
- *Are there things that you implemented since the previous Program Review that you would like to see continue/investigate further to see if it has been beneficial for students?*
- *Have you observed/found any benefits to student interactions/instruction online versus in-person? Changes in access, services to/engagement with evening students, for example*
- *Are there any new PD needs that you have identified?*
- *Opportunities to do something need to be tied to student realities and regional context*
- *You may use the chart to organize your responses. Alternatively, you can organize your responses in another logical manner to answer the questions*

Students attending the business and management programs reflect the diversity of our community and, per the CSM Diversity Statement; our division fosters a safe environment that encourages the exchange of ideas that promotes equal opportunity including the college-wide influx of international students, which offers unique opportunities to bring a more global perspective to business issues and curricula. In addition to the well-rounded business education, we contribute to the creation of a campus culture that is antiracist and equity-advancing. We strive to make all students feel safe in a learning environment that celebrates their individual identities.

It is in our best attempt that we make education accessible for all our students regardless of their race, ethnic origin, cultural background, economic status, or sexual identity. That includes continuing to offer many online sections for convenient access to achieve their academic goals. We also intend to experiment with hybrid and hyflex modalities to increase accessibility to education. We began to offer sections that use ZTC (zero textbook cost) to remove the barrier of costly textbooks that may prohibit access to education. We ensure that students who lack the ability to obtain technology are not left behind. We work with ITS to provide access to loaner laptops and internet hotspots in addition to essential software such as Microsoft Office.



2023-24 Program Review

The Business and Management department urgently requires two faculty lines to support the development of relevant academic program offerings and to meet the academic and industry standards for both transfer and the workforce. The following fulltime faculty (71.7%) to part-time faculty (28.3%) ratio for business program, and fulltime faculty (23.1%) to part-time faculty (76.9%) in the management program underscores the need to hire more full-time faculty in Business and Management.

Since our last Program Review, we have updated all Management Programs approved for deployment in fall 2022. We created new Human Resource classes that are aligned with the Society for Human Resource Management Professionals curriculum requirements. A tremendous need exists for a faculty with HR expertise to expand the program.

Beginning in fall 2022, our department started offering courses leading to stackable certificates up to an Associate of Science degree in International Business. We will be adding additional courses that cannot be taught by current faculty such as supply chain management. With that in mind, we analyzed the need for two full-time faculty members and conclude that they are needed to ensure the successful deployment of new business and management courses and programs in the Fall 2024.

For simplicity, we plan to fold BUSW department into BUS. There is only 1 active course offered in BUSW each semester which does not necessitate its own department.

We reviewed the top codes for all courses in our department and are satisfied with the current labels. We offer career education, and therefore other codes are not available due to COVID.

Table 9: Goals for 2023-2025

<b>Goal</b>	<b>Actions</b>	<b>Measurable Outcomes</b>	<b>Timeline</b>	<b>Responsible Party</b>	<b>Support Needed</b>
1. Increase enrollment	EFFECTIVE marketing at the department, college and district level.	Increased interest in the college and department through effective marketing	Spring 2024	Faculty with the Dean as an advocate	College/District Cabinet / Marketing Department
2. Increase enrollment	Expand Business Analytics, International Business, HR and Public and Non-Profit Admn. programs	Two new faculty to be hired in Fall 2024	Fall2024	Dean	College/District Cabinet

3. Close equity gap	Identify new equity gaps presented by multiple modality	Increased success and retention rates among historically underrepresented groups	Spring 2024	Faculty with the Dean as an advocate	Dean
4. Offer honor's track in business and management	Identify courses that can serve as capstone projects such as participation in entrepreneurship competition, research paper, internship etc.	Increased success and retention rates	Fall 2024	Faculty with the Dean as an advocate	Dean
5. Upgrade business labs	Computers in Business labs are over 10 years old and need to be upgraded	Need more loaner laptops to close equity gaps	Spring 2024	ITS/Facilities	ITS/Facilities

**5. CE (Career Education) Only**

- a) Review the program's available labor market data, as applicable, and explain how the program meets a documented labor market demand. Here are two relevant links:
- [State of California Employment Development Department, Labor Market Information Division](#) (the official source for California Labor Market Information):
  - [Employment data](#) (by Program Top Code) from the State Chancellor's Office
- b) Summarize student outcomes in terms of degrees and certificates. Identify areas of accomplishments and areas of concern.
- c) Review and update the program's Advisory Committee information. Provide the date of the most recent advisory committee meeting and outcomes of the meeting (updates, changes, new members, etc.).
- d) What strategies have you discussed in your recent Advisory Committee's meetings to meet the needs and challenges of getting people retrained and back to work?

***Guidance Notes:***

- *Many CE areas had COVID impacts because ability to do in person instruction changed or was impacted by state boards and mandates*
- *Any exceptions that were granted to run in DE mode*
- *Labor market and workforce development impacts of post-COVID workforce recovery*
- *TOP codes and SAM Codes*

*For the TOP codes and SAM code information, you can find that in the full Course Outlines of Record (COR) information in [CurricUNET](#). To see this All-Fields view of the COR, you will need to be logged into CurricUNET then find the SEARCH header on the left menu and*

*search for the active course. [View a screenshot of the All-Fields icon you need to view the full COR.](#)*

a) From the EDD website, the current (December 2022) top industry employment in San Mateo County are:

Industry Title	Current Employment
Service-Providing	387900
Professional and Business Services	93000
Professional, Scientific, and Technical Services	65000
Trade, Transportation, and Utilities	64300
Information	62500
Private Education and Health Services	59400
Health Care and Social Assistance	44900
Goods Producing	43300
Leisure and Hospitality	41500
Accommodation and Food Services	35900
Government	30800
Retail Trade	30200
Local Government	27300
Manufacturing	25600
Financial Activities	24000
Administrative and Support and Waste Management and Remediation Services	23400
Transportation, Warehousing, and Utilities	23000
Mining, Logging and Construction	17700
Finance and Insurance	17100
Non-Durable Goods	14700
Private Educational Services	14500
Other Services	12400
Wholesale Trade	11100
Real Estate and Rental and Leasing	6900
Arts, Entertainment, and Recreation	5600
Management of Companies and Enterprises	4600
Federal Government	2900
State Government	600

## 2023-24 Program Review

b) From the EDD website, the top 20 projections of estimated employment job growth in industry and occupational employment over time resulting from industry growth, technological change, and other factors in the San Francisco Bay Area are:

<b>Occupational Title</b>	<b>Total Job Openings</b>
Manicurists and Pedicurists	4,040
Skincare Specialists	1,440
Personal Appearance Workers	9,130
Cooks, Restaurant	27,180
Barbers	230
Bartenders	10,180
Hairdressers, Hairstylists, and Cosmetologists	3,380
Massage Therapists	1,970
Fitness Trainers and Aerobics Instructors	6,010
Chefs and Head Cooks	4,350
Dining Room and Cafeteria Attendants and Bartender Helpers	6,160
Sailors and Marine Oilers	370
Cooks and Food Preparation Workers	46,690
Gaming Dealers	920
Solar Photovoltaic Installers	710
Hosts and Hostesses, Restaurant, Lounge, and Coffee Shop	5,020
Food Preparation and Serving Related Workers, All Other	2,470
Other Food Preparation and Serving Related Workers	22,650
Supervisors of Food Preparation and Serving Workers	15,680
Statisticians	840

c) From Lightcast report on Occupational Overview for Business, for Q3, 2023, these are the job categories with the highest average monthly job postings and average monthly hires for 25 occupations (See table below)

## 2023-24 Program Review

Occupation	Avg Monthly Postings (Jan 2022 - Jul 2023)	Avg Monthly Hires (Jan 2022 - Jul 2023)
Management Analysts	920	1,266
Project Management Specialists	925	1,144
Market Research Analysts and Marketing Specialists	796	1,459
Construction Managers	479	342
Human Resources Managers	418	320
Industrial Production Managers	335	141
Transportation, Storage, and Distribution Managers	300	185
Facilities Managers	292	144
Business Operations Specialists, All Other	223	1,752
Administrative Services Managers	255	285
Logisticians	232	277
Cost Estimators	159	264
Compensation, Benefits, and Job Analysis Specialists	148	122
Statisticians	147	51
Social and Community Service Managers	151	197
Chief Executives	104	264
Training and Development Managers	78	67
Compensation and Benefits Managers	70	24
Personal Service Managers, All Other	91	17
Entertainment and Recreation Managers, Except Gambling	5	78

Lightcast Q3 2023 Data Set | lightcast.io

9

In reviewing the Occupation Review from Lightcast for the San Francisco Bay Area, the most posted jobs are for management analysts and project managers. As a department, we are attempting to meet these needs by offering employable skills such as coursework leading up to a certificate in Project Management. In fall 2022, we launched an Associate of Science in Business Analytics degree and certificate program in Business Analytics.

b) According to the Lightcast data, Business Administration and Management continues to be the top program in the Bay Area with respect to completions. (see the graphic below)

## Occupational Programs



CIP Code	Top Programs	Completions (2021)
52.0201	Business Administration and Management, General	9,194
24.0101	Liberal Arts and Sciences/Liberal Studies	8,587
42.0101	Psychology, General	3,668
11.0701	Computer Science	2,858
26.0101	Biology/Biological Sciences, General	2,119
30.0101	Biological and Physical Sciences	2,083
45.1101	Sociology, General	1,873
45.1001	Political Science and Government, General	1,372
45.0101	Social Sciences, General	1,320
52.1301	Management Science	1,282

The Associate of Science in Business Administration transfer degree program is not only the most popular program in our department but also consistently produces the most A.S-T degree graduates in the entire college. In 2022-23, 55 AS-T degrees were awarded in Business Administration, second highest after 154 Social Sciences associate degrees.

We are not satisfied with our success. In fact, we have recently started to offer more sections and programs including the A.S. in Business Analytics, A.S. in International Business and A.S. in Public and Non-Profit Administration to confer more degrees in our department.

Most of our business and management students are transferring to 4-year institutions. However, not all the transfers complete the transfer degree, therefore, the number of awarded transfer degrees is not representative of the actual number of students who transfer, a much higher number.

We will continue to offer and add stackable certificates as they serve as a good marketing and motivational tool.

**Certificates Awarded 2017-23:**

Business Management: 17  
HR Management: 33  
Marketing Management 10  
Small Business Management fewer than 5  
Management: Business Management: 13  
Management: Human Resource Management: 29  
Management: Marketing 8

**Associate degrees Awarded 2012-2023**

Business Administration (Non-transfer) 30  
Business Administration (Transfer) 93  
Business Management 36  
Management: Business Management: 12  
Management: Human Resource Management: 5  
Management: Marketing 6  
Business Administration 13

Associate degree Awarded for Transfer (AS-T)

Business Administration 2.0 19  
Business Administration -Transfer CSU (California State University) GE 58  
Business Administration -Transfer IGTEC, CSU, GE) 69  
Business Administration – Associate Degree Transfer CSU or UC 335  
Business Administration – Associate Degree Transfer CSU 166

c) A new Business and Management Department advisory committee met in March 2023. The advisors consisted of industry professionals in the technology and insurance industries. Our advisors detailed their wish list of professional skills that they seek in young professionals looking to enter the workplace. These skills include critical thinking, interpersonal skills, maturity, being effective in shared environment, data driven decision making, independent research skills, technical knowledge and the ability to work with large datasets.

d) To obtain the desired skillsets of a 21st century professional, the advisory board members recommended the following curriculum be offered in our department:

- Business Analytics
- Data Science
- Digital and Social Media Marketing
- Social Media Management
- Leadership (certificate)
- Sales Marketing
- Business Internship
- Oral and Written Communication
- International Business
- Global Culture
- Business Strategy
- Business Negotiations
- Introduction to Investments
- Business Management Certificate