

## 2023-24 Program Review

Program Name: Career Services (Counseling/Student Services)

Program Contact: Christine Su

Academic Year: 2022-2023

Status:

Updated on: 9-28-2023

### **1. Description of Program (200-400 words)**

Within Student Services, the Counseling Division houses four programs that collaborate to support students from matriculation through transfer and/or graduation. These programs are: 1) the **Welcome Center** (previously Assessment Services), which manages onboarding and matriculation; 2) **Career Services**, which works with students on the front end of their academic and career journeys to help them determine their “why” and outline appropriate pathways to get there; 3) **Student Success**, which provides support for students who are struggling academically; and 4) **Transfer Services**, which assists students in planning their next steps after CSM, if those plans include transfer to a four-year college or university.

While the shelter-in-place order and the mandated shift to remote service delivery that took place with the pandemic in 2020 had been lifted by 2022, our programs and the ways in which we serve students were indelibly changed. Much student interaction that had become virtual was requested to remain virtual, and counseling and student services had to operate within a hybrid type of framework. That is, we returned to the office but also maintained much of our virtual operations.

Together, whether in-person or remotely, these four programs offer information, support, and resources toward fulfilling the following CSM Educational Master Plan (EMP) Strategic Priorities:

**Priority #1:** Supporting our Students’ Aspirations;

**Priority #2:** Creating Equitable Opportunities for all Students;

**Priority #3:** Committing to Progressive and Innovative Teaching and Learning

**Priority #4:** Building on a Tradition of Service to the Community; and

**Priority #5:** Enhancing a Culture of Participation and Communication.

#### **Career Services’ support for the EMP priorities: Summary**

Career Services supports students’ aspirations by providing a “landing place” for students who are unsure of their major or career goals, or who just want to explore different major and career options before embarking on a defined path. Rather than waiting until the final semester of classes or even later, students are encouraged to visit Career Services and take advantage of its resources early on. Career Services’ three-part mission is to assist CSM students in: 1) developing career awareness; 2) exploring related professional opportunities; and 3) outlining related academic and career pathways. Career Services pursues this mission through:

- **programming**, including development and facilitation of workshops (Choosing a Major; Finding Your Purpose; Writing an Effective Resume; Maximizing Your LinkedIn Profile, How to Network, etc.); highlighting immediate employment and internship opportunities

## 2023-24 Program Review

through posting on CSM's job search platform and disseminating information through social media and email; facilitating a micro-internship program intended to help early-stage students gain experience; and facilitating student interaction with career counselors through CRER classes and individual appointments;

- **events**, including career awareness and exploration fairs, internship fairs, volunteer fairs, alumni panels/networking opportunities, and speakers on topical interests (e.g., "What can I do with a major in liberal arts?"; "I Love My Job!"; "How I Became a \_\_\_\_\_");
- **material and online resources**, including a complete overhaul of the CSM Career Services website and social media platforms (e.g., Facebook, Instagram), facilitating access to assessments, such as Eureka, Myers-Briggs Type Indicator, and many others, and until recently, providing handouts on various helpful topics and fliers for events (we have since gone paperless);
- **outreach**, including presentations to faculty, staff and students in various departments to highlight services; building relationships with local employers and volunteer organizations seeking to engage CSM students. Career Services is very intentional in its outreach to community members, focusing not only on ways the community can help CSM students, but how CSM students can help community members and organizations through volunteering, short-term programs, and other collaborations;
- **classes**, in collaboration with counseling faculty, including COUN 120, CRER 126, CRER 127;
- **individual assistance**, in partnership with our career counselors.

The introduction and enactment of SB893 (California College Promise) and free community college helped CSM to recoup some of the reduction in numbers of students that occurred during the pandemic, and likewise, led to a slight increase in use of Career Services by students.

We are still rebuilding, but feel confident about how our offerings positively impact the student journey.

## **2. Results of Previous Program Review (200-500 words)**

Below is Career Services' previous Program Review action plan. The results and assessment appear in the far-right column. (please see next page)

SAO	Assessment Measures	SMCCCD District Goal addressed	Results
<p><b>1. Increase awareness among CSM administration, faculty, students and community about the availability of Career Services Programs.</b></p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Revise/revamp Career Services website and update social media, which had been stagnant for more than 18 months; track usage to measure success</li> <li>• Increase and maintain communication with students and faculty (which was extremely limited for the past 18 months) through email correspondence and classroom visits, marketing, and on-campus presence in Counseling Services</li> <li>• Collaborate with divisions/departments to plan events related to careers in the academic disciplines represented</li> <li>• Launch and maintain <i>What's Your Why?</i> campus-wide campaign: invite and involve students, faculty, and staff to participate in the campaign, sharing their stories of how they discovered and articulated their purpose; share results through posters, rack cards, web features, etc.</li> </ul>	<p>Strategic Goal #1: Develop and Strengthen Educational Offerings, Interventions, and Support Programs that Increase Student Access &amp; Success;</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• We revamped our entire website to make it more user-friendly, and to more clearly delineate which sections were for students and which for employers. Specific additions included: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>○ The addition of a “What’s Your Why?” section, in which CSM faculty and staff “whys” (purpose/ikigai) for working at CSM were displayed. (follow-up to <i>What’s Your Why?</i> Campaign)</li> <li>○ The addition of a section and pages specifically for <i>internships</i>, as that was one of the needs expressed by students.</li> <li>○ Of note is that the job search board, JobSpeaker, is a program of and maintained by our Strong Workforce Hub. As such, we added links to JobSpeaker to our site for both students and employers; however, JobSpeaker itself was overseen by SWH.</li> </ul> </li> <li>• In addition to a more targeted email campaign, Career Services also launched a Canvas shell, which has not only modules explaining Career Services’ services, but also lists upcoming events, describes internships, and provides updates and announcements. We also had drop-in career counseling in Bayview Dining Room on most Tuesdays (when a career counselor was available). We did notice that in-person attendance was still low, but online attendance to events</li> </ul>

## 2023-24 Program Review

			<p>was much higher (this speaks to the changing needs/preferences of our students)</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>As outlined in our plan, Career Services engaged in intentional collaborations with many CSM divisions and departments, including:           <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Active Minds</li> <li>Associated Students of CSM</li> <li>Diversity in Action (DIAG)</li> <li>EOPS</li> <li>Ethnic Studies</li> <li>Promise</li> <li>Science-in-Action</li> <li>SMCCC Foundation/alumni outreach</li> <li>Safe Zone Alliance</li> <li>Transfer Services</li> </ul> </li> </ul>
<b>2. Provide opportunities for students to learn and engage in discussions about majors and career pathways, with both CSM staff/faculty and prospective employers.</b>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Create and administer intake survey and follow-up for new (and continuing) students regarding career awareness and resources available (e.g., “Career Check-up” in Bayview Dining Room; presentations in classrooms)</li> <li>Facilitate on-campus events: e.g.,           <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Career Awareness and Exploration Fair (note: this differs from a job fair--students can feel free to ask questions and not feel they are being evaluated at that moment, as they might in a recruiting or job fair);</li> </ul> </li> </ul>	<p>Strategic Goal #2: Establish and Expand Relationships with School Districts, 4-year College Partners, and Community-based Organizations to Increase Higher Education Attainment In San Mateo County; (specifically, Career Services reached out to <b>community-based organizations</b>, such as Bridgegood, that connect students, especially from underrepresented groups, to professional opportunities, as well as local public entities, such as the County of San Mateo, which always has different departments</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Career Services did host several “Career Check-Ups,” plus drop-in career counseling in our Bayview Dining Room on Tuesdays, at the same time as our Employer Tuesday Tabling. This attracted a LOT of students, and the career counselors were busy the entire time.</li> <li>We hosted not only general job fairs, volunteer fairs, and major fairs, but a career and internship exploration fair with more than 40 employers and 350 student participants as well.</li> <li>We brought in numerous speakers, including several CSM alums, to engage with students about their career trajectories, as well as professionals who spoke with students about how they got to where they are today.</li> </ul>

## 2023-24 Program Review

	<p>Volunteer Fair, in collaboration with local organizations;</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>○ Weekly employer tabling to make students aware of job openings;</li> <li>○ Guest speaker series, including speakers from 4-year colleges in the Bay Area to help our students understand career pathways in a given major</li> <li>● Obtain evaluations (e.g., surveys) of events by attendees and participants</li> <li>● Bulk upload of student data to College Central Network job search platform to increase number of students who have access and engage in related student-employer interaction</li> </ul>	<p>represented in Career Services' fairs, outreach materials, etc.) Strategic Goal #3: Increase Program Delivery Options, including the expanded use of instructional technology to support student learning and success.</p> <p>In addition to reviving the College Central Network through outreach to all enrolled students, rather than relying on students finding the information via website, we renewed contracts for proven platforms and instruments such as Eureka, Myers-Briggs, and Strong Interest Inventory. Students could make appointments to take assessments through the Program Services Coordinator, either in the Counseling Services area or at home, and the PSC would then compile the results and make them available to the student's counselor in preparation for follow-up individual appointments.</p>	<p>These opportunities to talk to people who are doing certain jobs or are in certain fields are vital as students navigate their journeys. Our hope is to waylay these and other contacts into a job-shadowing program.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>● Toward strategic goal #3, we actually had a change in the job search platform provider just prior to the previous program review. At the request of Strong Workforce, CSM had changed from the College Central Network to JobSpeaker. The attraction of JobSpeaker was it was to take information from the CSM catalog, and for the classes a given student was taking, put the career-related skills and knowledge information into the student's JobSpeaker profile. For example, if Student A was taking Accounting 100, JobSpeaker was to pull from the catalog description and enter into the profile things such as knowledge of accounting cycle, preparation of journals, ledgers, adjusting journal entries, and financial statements, etc.</li> <li>● Unfortunately, student feedback about JobSpeaker has not been very positive. They found it awkward to use and did not receive a lot of offers from the employers. In Fall 2022 there was discussion about switching again to Handshake, which is used by most of the UCs; however, there has been turnover in the Strong Workforce office (3 employees left) and a new supervisory</li> </ul>
--	---	---	---

## 2023-24 Program Review

			<p>structure, so this has not yet been addressed. Career Services is on board with moving to Handshake, should Workforce decide that is what they would like to use.</p>
<b>3. Increase access to and usage of Career Services resources</b>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Maintain an active presence on committees or other meetings to ensure Career Services information is included in overall campus planning (e.g., Career Counselors and Career Services participating in Guided Pathways discussions to ensure the career components of each Academic and Career Community (ACC) pathway carried equal consideration and would be implemented in a way that supports student success.)</li> <li>Collaborate with EOPS, Umoja, MANA, Puente, and other learning communities; these have extensive outreach; Career Services leveraged that outreach both to disseminate information and to provide customized events, workshops, etc. for</li> </ul>	<p>Strategic Goal #1: Develop and Strengthen Educational Offerings, Interventions, and Support Programs that Increase Student Access &amp; Success;</p> <p>Strategic Goal #3: Increase Program Delivery Options, including the expanded use of instructional technology to support student learning and success.</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Career Services' staff joined the Classified Senate and the Retention Work Group so that they could contribute to overall campus planning, and continued to be involved in discussions regarding the ACCs (although the Director of Pathways and Promise was out on leave)</li> <li>As mentioned, the introduction of a Canvas shell was helpful for maintaining records and providing another, familiar access point for students (who use Canvas for classes); however, maintaining Canvas became labor-intensive and we are analyzing whether or not this is the best use of hours, given that our entire team consists of two career counselors and one program services coordinator. The latter manages all of the events (fairs, workshops), outreach, etc. in addition to fielding inquiries from both employers and students by phone, email, and in-person.</li> <li>Of note is that the ACCs also have their own canvas shells, and Career Services often posted announcements about jobs, internships, and workshops related to each ACC; however, I am not certain how high the numbers of students who are signed up to</li> </ul>

## 2023-24 Program Review

	<p>target populations and elicit feedback.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>• Create online calendar of events, workshops, and opportunities accessible from Career Services home page to centralize knowledge about Career Services offerings</li><li>• Collaborate with Promise Program, with career-related events embedded into the Promise milestones</li><li>• Collaborate with Learning Center to provide workshops for target populations (e.g., athletes) during their assigned time at the learning center</li></ul>		<p>receive announcements from each ACC are. This is something to be investigated.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>• Career Services developed workshops specifically for Middle College, EOPS, Promise, College One, and Active Minds/Mental Health Peer Educators.</li><li>• A monthly PDF calendar with links to both on-campus and local career-related events was produced and distributed. Some recipients liked the format, as you could link directly to registration sites and such; some others, particularly faculty, preferred that all of the events be listed in an email. The PDF was also time-consuming to put together (though visually appealing), so we may explore these or different options in more depth to see which is most efficient.</li></ul>
--	---	--	---

In concluding this section, I have two overall comments. First, the introduction of the Student Services Link (SSL) was not helpful to career services. First, the SSL allows students to make more than one appointment. Some students made 7 or 8 appointments in a row, but because of this other student were unable to get even one appointment. Also, in the SSL, there is a “dropdown” for students seeking career counseling to select that; however, students rarely paid attention to that. If they saw an open time, they grabbed it, whether or not they really wanted career guidance. This led to those who definitely wanted career guidance to not have any specific (i.e., reserved) times for career counseling, and they often voiced their disappointment. Furthermore, while students could see all available counseling times, the PSC could only see the career counseling times, and so attempted to schedule for those times. However, within seconds those times were taken by students who saw an open space.

Second, I would like to reiterate a previous comment that Career Services underwent a shift from its previous identification as a sort of job/employment agency located on-campus to a *career services department* that offers students opportunities to learn about what is out there,

## 2023-24 Program Review

explore different possibilities, and outline various academic and career options before making an informed decision, and importantly, collaborates with instructional faculty and administrators to do so. This presentation is much more aligned with CSM's strategic priority #3, as it seeks to create synergy and shared responsibility between instruction and student services to promote student success.

### **3. Current Program Review (200-400 words)**

Please use the statistics below, which are college-wide, as a reference. Please refer to the Program Review website for individual program data.

<b>College Stats 2022-23</b>	<b>Ethnicity</b>	<b>First Gen</b>	<b>Age</b>	<b>Gender</b>	<b>Total</b>
<b>Headcount (unduplicated)</b>	Latinx 32% White 26% Asian 20% Filipino 7% Multiracial 7% Black 3% Pacific Islander 2% Unknown 3% Native American 0%	45% of our students are the first in their family to go to college.	66% 24 yrs. and under 18% Ages 25-34 17% over 35 yrs.	49% Female 48% Male 3% Non-disclosed or non-binary	13,180 students
<b>Enrollments (duplicated)</b>	Latinx 35% White 26% Asian 16% Filipino 6% Multiracial 8% Black 3% Pacific Islander 3% Unknown 3% Native American 0%	47% of enrollments were by students who are the first in their family to go to college.	76% 24 yrs. and under 13% Ages 25-34 11% over 35 yrs.	48% Female 50% Male 2% Non-disclosed or non-binary	37,014 enrollments

## 2023-24 Program Review

Findings	Analysis	Resources	Plans to Address Opportunity Gaps
<p><b>1. Our student demographics:</b></p> <p>Latinx 32%          White 26%          Asian 20%          Filipino 7%          Multiracial 7%          Black 3%          Pacific Islander 2%          Unknown 3%</p>	<p>Community-specific career-related programming will help ethnically diverse students to both engage more with career services and succeed in their career pathways.</p>	<p>LatinX: We have arguably made the most progress with our LatinX students. We both partnered with Puente and engaged the services of Oscar Garcia of Aspira Consulting to help address our career- and job-related equity gaps within our LatinX student population. Mr. Garcia specializes in culturally relevant career and leadership training for LatinX and also first-generation and minority students. He gave both stand-alone workshops on career topics with a LatinX component or focus, hosted by Career Services, and gave presentations to certain classes. Neither of the career counselors nor the PSC identifies as LatinX, and so we decided it was in students' best interest to consult with someone connected to the LatinX identity and community. Notably, his content can be adjusted to be appropriate for other groups, especially if they have in common the challenge of being first-gen.</p>	<p>We realize that while we have made strides in providing services to our LatinX students, we have gained less ground with our African American, Asian American, and FilipinX students. We are currently working to institute similar workshops for Asian American students, as doing so will be relatively straightforward. All three of the current Career Services staff, plus a current intern, identify as Asian American, and thus culturally-specific services for the AA population can take place in-house. Furthermore, the Career Services PSC is also involved with a new Asian American and Native American Pacific Islander Serving Institution (AANAPISI) grant, whose resources can be used to support Asian American programs and services. We are excited about plans in this area.</p> <p>However, we still have a long way to go, particularly with our Pacific Islander and African American students. In our career resource fairs, we are diligently trying to engage employers and organizations that center these groups to help reach students in these communities. We also hope to identify resource persons in those communities who can help us to make our services more culturally-appropriate.</p>

## 2023-24 Program Review

			<p>Another factor that must be addressed is the disaggregation of data, especially that of “Asian Americans.” The experience of a student from a Southeast Asian refugee family is very different from that of a third-generation, well-established East Asian family. Right now, the differences in experience are not captured by the data, leading to the generalization that “Asians are doing fine,” or that their experiences are similar to that of European Americans.</p>
<p><b>2.</b> The numbers of students in our CRER courses waned slightly (from 21-22 to 22-23) across groups, but the persistence/retention rates increased slightly.</p>	<p>Overall, the enrollment in CRER courses was low, and in 22-23 the numbers were slightly lower than in 21-23 for all groups.</p>	<p>The majority of our CRER classes have been held online, with a few in-person. We have noted that all of the online classes tend to fill and have waiting lists, whereas some of the in-person classes have had to be cancelled.</p> <p>One speculation is that students appreciate the convenience of online learning, and so choose those class options, but members of certain ethnic communities would benefit more from face-to-face (or perhaps hybrid learning). As but one example, a study by the Urban Institute finds that Latinx, Indigenous, and Black students are consistently more likely to face remote learning challenges.</p> <p><a href="https://www.urban.org/urban-wire/students-color-remote-learning-environments-pose-multiple-challenges">https://www.urban.org/urban-wire/students-color-remote-learning-environments-pose-multiple-challenges</a></p>	<p>One challenge we have been faced with is that the CRER courses are not UC-transferrable. Many students are reluctant to take classes that are not UC-transferrable if UCs are in their future plans. Of note is that COUN 120, which IS UC-transferrable, nearly always fills and has a waiting list.</p> <p>Something that would be helpful is to perhaps include a CRER class as part of a learning community. This is something that has been working well for Katipunan, which includes COUN 120 in its cohort offerings, and while a 3-credit COUN 120 course might not fit all schedules, a 1-credit CRER 126 or .5 credit CRER 127 might fit well with other courses geared toward other learning communities or ethnically-affiliated groups.</p>

	<p>More research needs to be done on modalities with regard to effectiveness as well as preference. However, the feedback from students regarding career <i>counseling</i> that occurs virtually has been positive. Many students who work or who have family obligations find it helpful when they can ZOOM with career counselors and do not have to come to campus.</p>	
--	--	--

## **4. Planning**

### **Program goals**

This program review provides an honest evaluation of both successes in program development and execution and gaps in access and service. Career Services supports cross-campus collaboration and reduced “academic/career separation” to improve practices and more equitably serve students.

The current Program Services Coordinator’s strength is in the execution of programming and events; she needs additional assistance in outlining specific metrics and capturing progress toward overall program goals and SAOs via quantitative data collection.

In collaboration with the Student Success Program Services Coordinator and other Student Services staff, Career Services can serve to make the student experience, particularly during the first year, one in which students feel supported and valued and part of a campus community.

A major challenge at present is that the PSC’s time is now divided between two jobs: Career Services Coordinator and Coordinator of the new AANAPISI grant. While both assignments are supposed to be .5FTE, truthfully, the work required is equivalent to 2 1.0 FTE positions. Maintaining each as a half-time position was a lofty but unrealistic goal. Furthermore, neither program can adequately address equity gaps with divided attention. Additionally, with our full-time career counselor now in the Interim VPSS

## 2023-24 Program Review

position, it would be great if the PSC and/or other counseling faculty/staff could be supported to undertake the training to interpret the MBTI and SII assessments, so that all of the burden does not fall on the adjunct career counselor.

Goal	Actions	Measurable Outcomes	Timeline	Responsible Party	Support Needed
1. Establish ways to better capture demographic (and disaggregated) data of students who use Career Services	Work with PRIE or other appropriate personnel to determine the best way to capture DISAGGREGATED data when or directly after usage occurs	Quantitative data for Career Services' resources and activities analyzed for student population equity and modes of delivery equity	23-25	PSC	<p>Training on how to use PRIE data – how do we best determine what reports to ask for? PRIE is great at providing reports, but if we don't know what we're looking for, it's hard to ask for the right report.</p> <p>Assistance determining which methods best capture the data (i.e., can this be done in the SSL? Do we continue to use Formstack and try to capture it that way?), and how to retrieve and analyze the information.</p> <p>Training on a) how to input/capture information; b) how to run reports and retrieve data; and c) how to interpret data and draw conclusions/make recommendations</p>
2. Embed career-related milestones into student-facing resources and platforms, e.g., individual course syllabi, WebSmart, and Canvas, and engage faculty in promoting use of career resources, and	Work with individual departments: get faculty input about what milestones they feel are important for students in a given major and ask that these be incorporated into the syllabus or have Career	Presence and usage statistics, including how many faculty/classes incorporate career milestones appropriate to their disciplines; Qualitative information about how these	23-25	PSC for Career Services in collaboration with Director of Pathways and Promise and faculty liaisons for the Academic and	Assistance from and support by decision-makers (administration, faculty, staff) regarding this collaboration; oftentimes pursuing academics and careers are viewed as separate occurrences; i.e., that students should focus on

## 2023-24 Program Review

assisting in the development of career milestones for given academic and career communities	Team present on topics as appropriate.	embedded elements benefit students (focus groups?) Number of appointments made specifically for assessments and career counseling		Career Communities	coursework now, and think about career plans later. Faculty buy-in is essential.
3. Establish better process for capturing and interpreting satisfaction levels of students who use Career Services, and analyzing them for equity	Institute training on data collection measures, especially for qualitative data; include focus groups or other student representations to gather qualitative information about Career Services		23-25	PSC; PRIE	Professional development in research methods;  Compensation for student participation in focus groups (e.g., Paws for Coffee gift card?)
4. Streamline the CSM experience arc for students: from matriculation to academic and career planning, to student success assistance, to transfer information and options	The four programs (welcome center, career services, student success, and transfer services) within Counseling Services can meet on a regular basis to ensure information and best practices are shared	Ease student transition from each part of the experience to the next; perhaps following the Promise model of monitoring and support for students (but especially for students who are not in Promise or other learning communities). (We need to serve all students, not just select groups).	23-25	Career Services PSC/First-Year Planning Coordinator?	Support for a CSM First-Year Experience program, informed by all four programs but with emphasis on career services and student success planning.  This might require a new hire, or perhaps the existing staff of the four programs (or at least three, excluding transfer services) could dedicate part of their time to the FYE.