

Mana Learning Community  
Dr. Finausina Tovo  
AY 2021-2022  
Active Learning Community (ASLT)  
9/30/2021

## **Mana Retention, Research & Opportunity: A 7-Year Reflection and Review**

The goal of this 7-Year Reflection and Review is to assess the wellness of our unique program model. To do this, a full review will need to reflect on the current state of student learning and support in Mana, our Village structure department and our ASLT division. Please accept this reflection as part of our formal review of the Mana Learning Community of College of San Mateo.

As the first of its kind, The Mana Learning Community (MLC) is a Pacific Studies Ethnic Based Success Support program where both instruction and student focused resources are braided into a guide pathway for Native Hawaiian Pacific Islanders to complete courses for their college certificates, degrees and requirements to transfer to a 4-year University. In their attempt to achieve equity success, MLC centers the students' lived experience as a basis to understand student learning and its environment. As the only 100% staff of Mana, the Mana Coordinator's role is to support college faculty, first time families and new students in understanding the process of attending college, for the first time. In addition to specialized workshops, one-on-one onboarding meetings, MLC provides 2 instructional courses for NHPI students to register every semester. For example, Ethnic Studies, Communication, Film, History, and Counseling departments have all played a significant part in supporting our MLC students inside the classroom. Working together across departments, divisions and cultural differences, MLC has opportunities to grow and expand while also changing outdated policies that do not fit the current campus (both in person and virtual) climate. Lastly, because MLC is the first of its kind in the California Community College Ed system, Mana has also been the model in which other California Community Colleges have established a friendship between their NHPI student support spaces to CSM's MLC.

Because of the important roles that Mana has to play both on campus and off campus to California Statewide, there is a need to increase the resources for Mana both through instruction, coordinating and specific research resources. This review will end with an ask for a Full-Time Professor /Tenured track in Interdisciplinary (IDST) Studies and a Full-Time Faculty/Tenured Track position in Counseling to support MLC.

### **1. Mana History & Enrollment Trends**

#### **Mana's History / Community College Enrollment Trends**

CSM's Mana Learning Community provides Native Hawaiian Pacific Islander (NHPI) students with a bridge to higher education and a transition support program that centralizes intrusive retention strategies throughout their academic journey in community college. Mana adopted the cohort model as it guides its students towards transfer success using specialized curriculum, and a wraparound support community offering academic support through the college's many learning

support centers and a variety of student services including admissions, financial aid, and counseling, among others. The Methodology motto of the program is adopted from Tongan scholar 'Epeli Ha'uofa's (1994) concept of, "We Are Ocean ", as in we are all connected through the water that nourishes us into life. This program is designed to increase the number of Oceania students who complete requirements for an AA degree and/or transfer into a four-year university by using their dual-identity (Valakahi, 2009) strength as a source to draw knowledge from to support academic success.

Since that foundational period, the college has expanded its commitment to our Oceania student community adding a certificate in [Critical Pacific Islands & Oceania Studies](#), a Mana advisory board (which includes CSM administration, faculty and staff) that meets monthly, two student led organizations, and regular events which incorporate indigenous Pacific Islander values and invite family and community to engage with the college. Within the introductory College and Academic Success course (LCTR 240), instructors use culturally sustaining pedagogy (Ladson-Billings, 2007; Gay, 2000; Paris, 2012) that privileges Pacific Islander values (Faith, Culture, and Community) and encourages students to generate and contribute to knowledge to their classrooms. While the Mana program utilizes culturally affirming and sustaining practices, many of our Pacific Islander students still may not feel they “belong”.

As over half of California's reported college enrollment is ethnically and racially diverse, addressing enrollment decline and completion rates is connected to how public institutions address these unique communities. According to a Campaign for College Opportunity (2015) report, demographics alone qualifies many California colleges and universities as Hispanic-serving institutions (HSIs) or Asian American, American Indian, Pacific Islander Institutions (AANAPISIs), meaning they have a significant representation of Latinx, AANHPI, and AI/AN populations. Additionally, this same Campaign for College Opportunity report revealed 69% of students enrolled in college in California are from ethnically or racially diverse backgrounds, yet over 60% of college faculty and senior leadership on California's campuses and 74% of academic senators are white. While student demographics begin to change with little change in leadership, the experiences of these diverse communities are often not given voice. Given the lack of diversity in educational leadership, it is no wonder NHPI communities have been largely invisible in the development of campus services and programs (Teranishi et al., 2019). Thus, a critical lens to make visible the relationship between Oceania epistemology and its relationship to western education captures a unique story that creates awareness of the NHPI community in U.S higher education.

## **2. Results of Mana Program Review 2017**

In our previous program review (Tovo, 2017), we discussed the importance of connecting MLC students to the campus and community. Although my report was not uploaded to the database online, I did present and report on our Mana program in 2017 (please see my reference page to gain access to my 2017 report for Mana). This then became our driving force to create more culturally responsive activities both inside and outside the classrooms. In our last review, we were only serving 50 NHPI students out of the 200 total attending CSM. Today, Mana serves 113 NHPI out of 250 registered for CSM this academic year. In addition to our instruction path, some of these specialized activities included:

## 2021-22 Program Review

- specialized Financial aid, Scholarship, and Personal Statement workshops,
- the establishment of the Vakatasi Student Organization
- Supporting Faculty who teach Mana cohort courses.
- Implementing the Critical Pacific Islands and Oceania Studies Certification of Specialization, Fall 2017.

Since then, Mana has become a sustaining education model. For example, Pacific Scholars/Practitioners in California, the United States and across the Pacific Ocean would seek support with instruction design, pedagogy tools, and research opportunities to understand their NHPI student community more deeply. Because of this newly formed role, MLC is in need of a full time professor that can help expand MLC's instruction coordination that can support not just CSM students, but all Community College MLC programs in California and across the U.S. MLC has become a hub for all NHPI related research, academia resources, and community.

Mana being a global hub for NHPI diaspora students, is one of the inspirations for us to submit a request for a Full-Time Tenure Track Professor in Interdisciplinary Studies which is under the Academic Support and Learning Technologies Division. This full time- position faculty member will build the IDST department through research, culturally sustaining topics and heritage history that is often ignored in most faculty/instruction spaces. MLC can be one of the topics for IDST to explore and support, but there also includes Puente La Raza Studies, Black History (Regional focus like California, Laws/Policies, Texas, or research topics like Education, Policing, Labor) and etc. All Learning Communities need to re-think about the role of research and inquiry in their community and the benefits/tensions of allowing just quantitative data to speak to our needs.

### **3. Current Mana Program Review (Data/Profile)**

**Figure 1: Data Provided by PRIE for CSM Mana student profile**

<b>College Stats 2020-21</b>	<b>Ethnicity</b>	<b>Student Profile</b>	<b>Age</b>	<b>Gender</b>	<b>Total</b>
<b>Headcount (unduplicated )</b>	Latinx 32% White 26% Asian 19% Filipino 7% Multi Races 7% African American 3% Pacific Islander 2% Unknown 4% Native American 0%	48% of our students are the first in their family to go to college.	66% Under 24 yrs. 20% Ages 25-34 15% over 35 yrs.	50% Female 47% Male 2% Unknown	10,910 students

2021-22 Program Review

<b>Enrollments (duplicated)</b>	Latinx 32% White 25% Asian 19% Filipino 7% Multi Races 8% African American 3% Pacific Islander 3% Unknown 3% Native American 0%	47% of enrollments were by students who are the first in their family to go to college.	73% Under 24 yrs. 16% Ages 25-34 11% over 35 yrs.	48% Female 50% Male 2% Unknown	32,761 enrollments
<b>Unduplicated Headcount for Mana (2018-2019)</b>	Asian 5.6% Filipino 2.8% Hispanic/Latino 8.3% Pacific Islander 75% Multiracial 8.3%	100% of our Mana students reported as degree/transfer students	Age Under 18 22.2% Age 18-22 75.0% Age 23-28 2.8%	55.6% Female 44.4% Male	36 Cohort Students
<b>Unduplicated Headcount for Mana (2019-2020)</b>	Asian 3.8% Filipino 1.9% Hispanic/Latino 3.8% Pacific Islander 84.6% Multiracial 1.9%	88.5% of our Mana students reported as degree/transfer students	Age Under 18 26.9% Age 18-22 71.2% Age 23-28 1.9%	46.2% Female 51.9% Male 1.9% Unreported	52 Cohort Students
<b>Unduplicated Headcount for Mana (2020-2021)</b>	Asian 3.7% Filipino 3.7% Hispanic/Latino 3.7% Pacific Islander 85.2% Multiracial 1.9% Unreported 1.9%	98.1 % of our Mana students reported as degree/transfer students.	Age Under 18 3.7% Age 18-22 90.7% Age 23-28 5.6% Unreported 1.9%	46.2% Female 51.9% Male 1.9% Unreported	158 Cohort Students

The Mana Learning Community is the first Pacific Studies Learning Community in the state of California and was created at CSM. As one of the first of its kind, the Mana Learning Community was put in place to provide intensive academic support by adopting the cohort model to guide students on a clear pathway to transfer success while offering a Critical Pacific Studies & Oceania Certificate, specialized curriculum, and a wraparound support community. In the 2013- 2014 academic year, data analysis at CBA confirmed NHPI students represented 2.4% of all students at CSM, roughly mirroring their participation rate in Bay Area County public schools (2.2%) and presence in San Mateo County (2%; San Mateo County, California Department of Education, 2015). NHPI students at CSM demonstrated the lowest course completion rates and high withdrawal rates (60.6% and 17.3%, respectively), which was similar to African American and Hispanic students at CSM.

## 2021-22 Program Review

According to CSM PRIE's (2021) report provided for this review, Mana student's Annual Success and Retention for 2018-2019 was at 48.1% success rate with a 18.0% withdrawal. Then during the 2019-2020 year, data demonstrated an increase of a success rate at 64.3% with a 14.1% withdrawal rate. For 2020-2021 was 70.1% success rate with a 3.9% withdrawal rate. This shows a small incremental growth of completion rates after dropping in 2018. Since our last Mana program review, there has been a 10% increase in retention in the last 2 academic years (2018-2019, 2019-2020) with an increase in the number of Mana students CSM serves. The total number of CSM Mana students our program serves today is 158. Using research literature that highlights NHPI students and/or Mana students will help inform how to strengthen the capacity of our institution to continue to respond to our Mana student/program needs.

### (a) Student population equity:

Findings	Analysis	Resources	Plans to Address Opportunity Gaps
<p>1.</p> <p>There is a gap in the Mana students who are cohorted, and the Mana students who are no cohorted but receive support</p>	<p>This does not support Mana in our data because on one hand, we show a high retention rate in our cohorts, but it does not always reflect in our Mana students who use our resources but not in the active cohort</p>	<p>The new system of cohorting and grouping students on Banner or the other system we use for counseling.</p>	<p>Schedule a meeting with PRIE to see if there are ways that Mana can do a double cohort, or a sub cohort inside a cohort code?</p> <p><b>Goal Continuing</b></p>
<p>2.</p> <p>All Learning Communities do not have instruction that is focused on their lived experiences and therefore fall into the other disciplines' category to understand their realities</p>	<p>Mana's LCTR 240/COUN 240's class is a prime example of why Learning communities should have courses that are taught to help support the development of metacognitive skills with culturally sustaining pedagogical praxis. These courses are designed to provide an academia lens to help students of marginalized communities build confidence in their student identity.</p>	<p>Honor's Project uses IDST as a research component/seminar for their students to receive support in their research/field of study and project.</p> <p>Mana Program offers LCTR 240, Academic Success where students are asked to discuss their socio-emotional experiences in being to process their history, their purpose in college and their success aspirations</p> <p>Year 1/Promise offers IDST 110 as a</p>	<p>These courses show there is opportunity for a braided version where the IDST Professor is also a researcher/practitioner that can utilize their prior knowledge/experience to help develop AA degrees, 4-year transfer resources and agreements, and help publish research that relates and focuses on our learning communities.</p> <p>We, Learning communities, need someone to help us mobilize in looking for outside grants, outside resources and networks to help us strengthen our learning communities. In addition, there is a lot of funding available for people of color and building</p>

2021-22 Program Review

		<p>similar/parallel class to LCTR 240 in motivating metacognitive processes to deepen critical thinking skills and self-esteem.</p>	<p>AA/AS/CA/CS certificates and degrees.</p> <p>I would foresee this IDST Faculty/Researcher position as an extension of both PRIE, Learning Communities and Instructional Design/Pedagogy. Additionally, this faculty/research position would also help the learning communities publish their articles/projects to share with the wider California community colleges.</p> <p style="text-align: center;"><b>Goal Continuing</b></p>
<p>3. There is a lack of permanent positions in the MLC overall support structure.</p>	<p>At the moment, Mana only has a 1 100% Full Time Coordinator and 1 33% Retention Specialist. Mana is also supported by 1 adjunct Counselor (20 hours a week) and 1 adjunct Professor (20 hours a week).</p> <p>Mana is the hub for all NHPI practitioners (including CSM alumni) to utilize our classroom spaces as their first place of teaching. We need to increase the representation of NHPI community in our faculty/staff spaces</p>	<p>There is a Puente Full Time Counselor who has %50 of their faculty position as coordinator for the Puente program. This is the support that Mana needs to have more faculty members serve their college aspiration needs.</p>	<p>To request a Counselor Full Time Tenure track that can have %50 percent faculty coordinating to support Mana and Mana, Village students that mirrors Puente’s counseling/faculty support.</p> <p style="text-align: center;"><b>Goal Continuing</b></p>

As is widely known, the Great Recession of 2007-2009 led to a dramatic spike in community college enrollment (Juszkiewicz, 2015). Since then, reports have revealed a decline in community college enrollment. Juszkiewicz (2015) reported there has been a continuous decline nationwide in community college enrollment since the 2010 peak. Once at its peak, the decrease in student enrollment has been the highest and most consistent from 2014 through 2017. A deeper look into the enrollment decline shows alarming numbers in degree completion from 2-year colleges. A National Student Clearinghouse Research Center (NSCRC, 2016) report highlighted, at most, 39% of all community college students earned a credential, while the U.S. Department of Education official graduation rate is 25%. The new U.S. Department of Education 8-year outcome measure for full-time, first-time students is 33% completing at the same

## 2021-22 Program Review

institution; the NSCRC (2016) tracks students for 6 years rather than the U.S. Department of Education’s 3 years. To add to this, the NSCRC report found the highest percentage of completers at the same institution were full-time, *non-first-time students*, almost 36%, which is slightly higher than their first-time counterparts. As data continue to unfold, it is vital institutions are aware of the ongoing trends related to the decline in enrollment. A deeper look into disaggregated data has the potential to uncover more than surface-level findings.

In order to equitably respond to our Mana Students and all Learning Community students, there has to be a shift in the way our Learning Community visions and missions are carried out inside the institution. As research continues to influence policies and systems in our community college spaces, our learning communities’ unique programs have an opportunity to become a hub of where we produce and reproduce our communities’ epistemologies and ontologies through research, curriculum and collaborations. First, there is a need to sit with PRIE and better understand how to read our retention/persistence data so that we can have a better understanding of what the data shows and does not show. Second, there needs to be an instruction department that unites all learning communities’ needs for a culturally responsive instruction design, research seminars and finally, attaching certificates, degree and transfer opportunities to our “department”.

Currently, we do not have a full time professor in our learning community/village division. I see that this a need for us to create a new professor tenure/department position as an Interdisciplinary Studies Professor/Researcher that can build a certificate/degree program for all learning communities (including Mana) can explore their Oceania heritage as a major (IE: AA in IDST with an emphasis in Critical Pacific Islander Studies, La Raza Language Studies or Black History- Gender, Law, and Society just to name some potential examples). This new position has the opportunity to build both capacity and support for all student organizations that are involved with the Village. Lastly, the last point to this section is that there is a lack of permanent positions in the MLC overall support structure. Mana students identified a need to have a full-time counselor that will be available to them without the barriers of going through a program like Scholars Program, EOPS, and other fund 1 supported programs. Oftentimes, these fund 1 supported programming overshadows the unique needs of our Mana/Village students. There is room for our ASLT division to build out our programming and departments while braiding our outcome goals using our Learning community students’ voices as a guiding light.

Changes since last Program Review	Analysis of Gaps	Plans to Address Opportunity Gaps
1. Hired 2 new Adjunct Faculty to teach LCTR 240/CRER 155/FILM 140	There was a lot of moving around with staff/faculty changing their roles on campus	Request for full time- tenure track staff/faculty members to increase more validating agents (Rendon, 2014) in Mana and other learning communities in our CSM Village.

2021-22 Program Review

		<b>Goal continuing</b>
2. There has been an exponential increase in U.S. education literature that centers NHPI communities and their unique educational/college needs.	Before 2018, there were hardly any research done on NHPI students in education much less any research that highlighted HPI students in California end spaces, Community College spaces and/or in retention and persistence	Mana Coordinators and faculty Joined a NHPI Scholars network that houses all literature and research that centers NHPI communities in the U.S. and abroad.
3.		<b>Goal Met/Continuing</b>

**(c) Discipline-level and SLO (Student Learning Outcomes) assessment/Student Services and SAO (Service Area Outcomes) assessment:**

<b>SLOs/SAOs</b>	<b>Assessment Results</b>	<b>Program Improvements Implemented</b>
1. MANA students will be monitored for persistence, retention and completion in Mana guidance courses in 18FAL and 19SPR	80% of Mana students in LCTR 240 will complete the course with a “C” or better.	Continue to monitor guidance courses throughout the year. Monitor Mana student success in other Mana supported courses in 2021-2022.  <b>Goal Continuing</b>
2. Mana students will organize/participate in multiple campus and organization sponsored events.	75% of all Mana students will attend/complete at least one (virtual) campus activity within their first year at CSM.	Mana Research Symposium/Winter Showcase, Fall Dia De Los Muertos, Fall Earth Day, Spring World Gala, Spring Speaker Series, Spring Film Festival, Spring Mana Graduation, Spring  <b>Goal Met</b>
3. Mana students will be surveyed regarding what they learned and felt in studying ethnic centered teaching.	Mana students have participated in many different research studies (Andrade, 2018; Smith, 2018; Conaway, 2019; Tovo, 2020) that focused on their learning and studying experience at the College of San Mateo. These studies all focused inside the classroom and provide both qualitative and quantitative insights on Mana students’ academic experiences	All studies have voiced a need for institutions to respond equitably to support the Mana students at CSM.  <b>Goal Met/Continuing</b>



2021-22 Program Review

<p>4. Mana students will be surveyed regarding their understanding and what they learned regarding Mana Pedagogical Practices</p>	<p>Tovo's (2020) and Andrade's (2019) study highlighted qualitative and quantitative insight that focused on the model of the Mana and the need for a statewide resource to support all NHPI communities across California Community Colleges. These studies center the Mana Learning community's student voice as a way to understand students who constantly navigate a dual-identity of being both American born with parents born in the Pacific.</p>	<p>Studies have validated (Rendon, 1994) that the academic support approach towards MANA students' needs to be addressed in the instruction curriculum and support to align with the CSM Equity updated plan (CSM Student Equity Report, 2017)</p> <p style="text-align: center;"><b>Goal is Continuing</b></p>
<p>5. Mana students will increase participation in the Village space and the Learning Center to increase academic success.</p>	<p>Tovo's (2020) study explored Mana's students need to connect with the wider community of their peers who are often first in their family to attend college. Tovo (2020) identified specialized staff/faculty to support their academic journey and registration needs.</p>	<p>Mana will request for 2 full-time faculties to help support the retention and degree attainment of both the Mana students, and the overall Village student community. Using Research and Networks, Mana will connect its needs to other Village groups (i.e.: Puente, Umoja, Project Change, Honors, Katipunan).</p> <p style="text-align: center;"><b>Goal is continuing</b></p>

**4. Planning**

**Figure 2: Program Goals -Mana Learning Community Coordination**

Goal	Actions	Measurable Outcomes	Timeline	Responsible Party	Support Needed
<p>1. Increasing NHPI representation in CSM curriculum and programming inside the CSM Equity Plan</p>	<p>Working and attending the ECC meetings to learn more about the Equity Plan for CSM</p> <p>Increase the Mana responsive curriculum on CSM campus.</p>	<p>How many times is Mana mentioned in the Equity Plan?</p> <p>How many times has Mana used an Equitable program to support first generation college students?</p>	<p>By Summer 2022</p>	<p>Mana Coordinator</p>	<p>Need Admin Support to propose a responsive curriculum to support NHPI student's /Mana students' at CSM and abroad.</p> <p>Need Admin to hire/create a position that helps coordinates instructional pipelines for</p>

2021-22 Program Review

	Write a report on NHPI/Mana students at CSM.	How can Mana help to increase the NHPI representation in curriculum and programming for CSM and its Equity Plan?			Mana and other Learning Communities
2. Establishing the CSM Mana Learning Community as being a Statewide resource hub for Pacific Island Studies of California in Education	Work with El Camino College, Mira Costa College, Chabot College, Long Beach City College to establish a full Mana program at their respective colleges.  Create a Digital Library for all literature of NHPI history and/or their U.S. experiences	Propose Mana Learning Communities' Model to the California Community College Chancellor's Office  Propose a Digital statewide library that all Mana established programs can have access to our Mana digital library.	By Summer 2022	Mana Coordinator	I need Guidance of being able to work with the Chancellor's office of the California Community College system.  Mana needs to increase its staff/faculty personnel to help the Mana coordinator complete these statewide and local goals for Mana and NHPI students.
3. Strengthening institutional capacity for Native Hawai'ian and Pacific Islander Students (NHPI) in higher education	Explore the current climate of NHPI/Mana students in community college.  Interview and Ask Students on their experience in college at CSM.	PRIE's report of completion rates, Withdrawal rates, Student Voices, Surveys	By Fall 2022	Mana Coordinator	The need to have data include both Mana students and/or the active cohorts of Mana  There are students who are Mana students and receiving mana resources but are not currency in the courses that Mana offers.

**5. CE Only**

- a) Review the program's available labor market data, as applicable, and explain how the program meets a documented labor market demand. Here are two relevant links:

## 2021-22 Program Review

- a. [State of California Employment Development Department, Labor Market Information Division](#) (the official source for California Labor Market Information):
  - b. [Employment data](#) (by Program Top Code) from the State Chancellor's Office
- b) Summarize [student outcomes](#) in terms of degrees and certificates. Identify areas of accomplishments and areas of concern.
- c) Review and update the program's Advisory Committee information. Provide the date of most recent advisory committee meeting and outcomes of the meeting (updates, changes, new members, etc.).
- d) What strategies have you discussed in your recent Advisory Committee's meetings to meet the needs and challenges of getting people retrained and back to work.
- e) Only for 2021-22 Program Review, please review the TOP codes, SOC codes, SAM codes, and CIP codes for your courses to ensure that they are aligned, and provide any updates below.

## Reference

Gay, G. (2000). Culturally responsive teaching theory, research, and practice. New York, NY: Teachers College Record.

Juszkiewicz, J. (2015). Trends in community college enrollment and completion data, 2015. Retrieved from American Association of Community Colleges website:  
[https://www.aacc.nche.edu/wp-content/uploads/2017/11/CCEnrollment\\_2015.pdf](https://www.aacc.nche.edu/wp-content/uploads/2017/11/CCEnrollment_2015.pdf).

Ladson-Billings, G. (2007). Pushing past the achievement gap: An essay on the language of deficit. *Journal of Negro Education*, 76, 316-323. Retrieved from  
<http://www.jstor.org/stable/40034574>.

## 2021-22 Program Review

National Student Clearinghouse Research Center. (2016). *Term enrollment estimates: Fall 2016*. Retrieved from <https://nscresearchcenter.org/wp-content/uploads/CurrentTermEnrollment-Fall2016.pdf>.

Paris, D. (2012). Culturally sustaining pedagogy: A needed change in stance, terminology, and practice. *Educational Researcher*, 41(3), 93–97. doi:10.3102/0013189X12441244

Rendón, L. I. (1994). Validating culturally diverse students: Toward a new model of learning and student development. *Innovative Higher Education*, 19, 33-51. doi:10.1007/bf01191156

Tovo, F.T. (2017). Annual Review of Current College Initiatives: CSM Mana Program. *Report put together for CSM Institutional Planning Committee*, Dec. 2017.  
[https://drive.google.com/drive/folders/1Km21B1Wj\\_6Hj3t2Cbgj-TooLLaHJUFH6](https://drive.google.com/drive/folders/1Km21B1Wj_6Hj3t2Cbgj-TooLLaHJUFH6)

Vakalahi, H. F. O. (2009). Pacific Islander American students: Caught between a rock and a hard place? *Children and Youth Services Review*, 31, 1258–1263.  
doi:10.1016/j.childyouth.2009.05.011