

**Minutes of the Regular Meeting of the Board of Trustees  
San Mateo County Community College District  
July 24, 2019, San Mateo, CA**

**The meeting was called to order at 4:00 p.m.**

**Board Members Present:** President Maurice Goodman (by telephone), Trustee Richard Holober, Trustee Dave Mandelkern, Trustee Thomas A. Nuris, Trustee Karen Schwarz

**ANNOUNCEMENT OF CLOSED SESSION ITEMS FOR DISCUSSION**

President Goodman said that during Closed Session, the Board will (1) hold a conference with legal counsel regarding two cases of anticipated litigation as listed on the printed agenda, (2) consider public employee discipline, dismissal, release, and (3) hold a conference with the agency labor negotiator as listed on the printed agenda.

**STATEMENTS FROM THE PUBLIC ON CLOSED SESSION ITEMS ONLY**

None

**RECESS TO CLOSED SESSION**

The Board recessed to Closed Session at 4:00 p.m.

**RECONVENE TO OPEN SESSION**

The Board reconvened to Open Session at 6:06 p.m.

**Board Members Present:** President Maurice Goodman (by telephone), Trustee Richard Holober, Trustee Dave Mandelkern, Trustee Thomas A. Nuris, Trustee Karen Schwarz, Student Trustee Jordan Chavez

**Others Present:** Chancellor Ron Galatolo, Chief Financial Officer Bernata Slater, Skyline College Interim President Jannett Jackson, College of San Mateo President Michael Claire, Cañada College President Jamillah Moore, District Academic Senate President-Elect Jeramy Wallace

**PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE**

**ANNOUNCEMENT OF REPORTABLE ACTION TAKEN IN CLOSED SESSION**

Vice President Schwarz said no reportable action was taken during closed session.

**DISCUSSION OF THE ORDER OF THE AGENDA**

None

**PRESENTATIONS TO THE BOARD BY PERSONS OR DELEGATIONS – CONTEMPORARY CONVERSATION REGARDING RACE, CLASS, GENDER, PRIVILEGE AND EQUITY: REAFFIRMING COMMITMENT TO UNDOCUMENTED STUDENTS (19-7-2C)**

Vice Chancellor/Chief of Staff Mitchell Bailey said this topic revisits an issue that has been on the agenda a number of times. He said the Board has expressed its opinions and thoughts on the issue of support and reassurance for students who are undocumented. He said there is an increased level of anxiety and concern on the part of these students and their families, along with faculty and staff, as it relates to some national policies and the unfortunate rhetoric that comes from a number of our elected and public officials throughout the country. Vice Chancellor Bailey said the Board reaffirmed its commitment to educational social justice in a statement issued on December 14 2016. That statement identifies the following as one of the Board's core values and principles: "Ensuring that all students, regardless of citizenship or status, have access to affordable, high-quality education is essential."

Vice Chancellor Bailey said the District has taken that statement, sentiment and mission to heart and has done a number of things to help reinforce that sentiment in supporting our students. The board further demonstrated its commitment to this issue with a resolution adopted on January 25, 2017 affirming the District's commitment to protecting undocumented students and the privacy of all students. The Board adopted an additional resolution on September 13, 2017 regarding the elimination of the Deferred Action for Childhood Arrivals (DACA) program, calling for federal legislation to protect DACA students. As part of that resolution, the Board directed staff to work with the local legislative delegation to bring about change to the administration's policies on this issue. Staff have been in constant contact with Congresswoman Speier, Congresswoman Eshoo, Senator Harris and Senator Feinstein's offices on this issue and continue to push for change to national policy that will protect undocumented students in the District and throughout the state as well. Based upon the Board's position, direction to staff and general attitude and sentiment regarding the essential nature of supporting students, staff believes it is important to revisit the support mechanisms that are in place at the colleges. One of the key things that has been done over the last several years is the development of the Dream Centers which are now proudly located on all three of the campuses. Representatives from each of the colleges presented a brief update on activities that are occurring in the Dream Centers.

Pamela Ortiz, Program Services Coordinator at the Skyline College Dream Center, said more than 250 students were served at the Dream Center during the 2018-19 academic year. She said there are approximately forty undocumented students in the Promise Scholars program at the college. She said the Dream Center collaborates with the paralegal program to provide a free immigration legal clinic every Wednesday during the fall and spring semesters. The legal clinic takes place in the Dream Center and is heavily utilized by students and community members. Appointments are often full a week in advance. Additionally, the Dream Center works closely with SparkPoint to provide assistance through the food pantry, financial coaching, free community market and SparkPoint snacks. SparkPoint also refers clients to the Dream Center when appropriate and the Dream Center refers clients to SparkPoint as well. Because there is often a high level of anxiety and fear about disclosing information, the Dream Center collaborates closely with Financial Aid, particularly during peak times. A Financial Aid technician is available at the Dream Center once a week. Of the 124 Dream Act students enrolled during the 2018-19 academic year, 106 received assistance at the Dream Center when applying for financial aid.

Ms. Ortiz said student engagement has included a week-long series of events aimed at supporting undocumented students through entrepreneurship, financial aid and mental health, as well as a Know Your Rights workshop. There is an undocumented student club, called Undocumented Students and Allies, which is very active and meets once a week at the Dream Center.

In terms of educational goals, Ms. Ortiz said 92 students reported their goal is to transfer to a four-year college and 12 students reported goals related to career advancement.

Ms. Ortiz said she was invited to be a member of the California Community College Chancellor's Office Dreamers Advisory Group which was created to establish best practices for undocumented student support services statewide. The group surveyed all 114 community colleges regarding support, staffing, funding, events and training, as well as conducting regional visits. They compiled a comprehensive report as a result of their research and created recommendations for creating better statewide support for undocumented students. Additionally, UndocuAlly trainings are offered for administrators, staff and faculty every semester and are available upon request for departmental training.

Adolfo Leiva, Director of the SparkPoint Center at Cañada College, said that while college is thought of as a place where students can come and get an education, there are often external factors that are impacting their ability to be successful. Some of those challenges include not having the same entitlements that others have. Students may have fears around disclosing their status and may find it embarrassing because their peers have access to services to which they do not have access. The Dream Center at Cañada College was designed to be a place where individuals can find a safe space and learn about what resources are available and to educate the community about Dreamers, undocumented students and AB 540 students. The Dream Center provides technical assistance for AB540, Dream Act, DACA and scholarship applications. Staff attend national conferences on how

to improve service to undocumented students. Most financial aid opportunities are not available to undocumented students but there are options that students can learn about at the Dream Center. Financial aid workshops, along with study sessions and policy briefs, are held to address the changing landscape, misinformation and half-truths so that individuals are given accurate information. Recognizing that students are part of a family unit, the Dream Center hosts family events to let them know that Cañada College is a safe place where they can find resources. Dreamers have reported that they find it difficult to identify and, as a result, the college is working to create a mural at that helps individuals identify their history and culture. Students can express themselves when professors have storytelling sessions and through open mic sessions. Faculty are critical in terms of this effort, whether it be as faculty coordinators, counselors, support teams or just champions and allies. Faculty have been instrumental in requesting and being awarded grant money to be able to support the Dream Center.

Mr. Leiva discussed other resources available on campus. A satellite food pantry is located at the Dream Center. The legal clinic provides free consultations regarding immigration and family law, tenant rights and domestic violence. These issues are oftentimes taboo and not spoken about at home. Consultations are free and confidential. Between fall 2016 and April 2018, the legal clinic served 104 Cañada College students (unduplicated). SparkPoint is designed to serve low income, at-risk populations and provides access to workshops, trainings and resources for career readiness and financial literacy in Spanish and English. The Dream Center also provides FERPA and student privacy training, emergency response versus emergency preparedness training, and UndocuAlly trainings. There is a Dreamers Student Club and a Dreamer Task Force which is part of the Academic Committee for Equity & Success (ACES). Staff attend the High School DREAMers Unite conference to meet dreamers and their families and let them know about the resources available at the college.

Mr. Leiva said other colleges have approached Cañada College to learn more about the Dream Center. In response, the College is in the process of creating a best practices binder that will help guide a campus by outlining the steps Cañada College took as it developed its Dream Center.

Paola Mora Paredes, Retention Specialist at the Multicultural and Dream Center at College of San Mateo, said the Multicultural and Dream Center has expanded in the last two years with the hiring of an office assistant in fall 2017 and the addition of her position in summer 2018. Services provided include direct services (book service/case management), along with a scholar internship program which provides an opportunity for our students to develop professionally by working on campus to develop programming services that they want to see. Through the scholar intern internship program, the Multicultural and Dream Center was able to hire a student who is DACA eligible. The student helped with organizing the new legal clinic and facilitating Undocu-Circles. With the Undocu-Week, the Multicultural and Dream Center partnered with departments and offices on campus to have a week-long series of events focusing on supporting undocumented students. Center collaborations include the Promise Scholars Program, EOPS/CARE/CALWORKS, student clubs and the Districtwide Task Force. During past year, professional development opportunities were provided for staff, and faculty and administrators throughout campus and included flex day trainings, student panels and intersectionality trainings.

Ms. Mora Paredes said that during the past year, 278 students at College of San Mateo were coded as non-resident/AB540, but only 164 applied for the California Dream Act. She said some students are fearful of applying for resources because of the political climate that exists outside of the campus.

Ms. Mora Paredes said the Migration Celebration, hosted by the Districtwide Task Force, will be held at College of San Mateo this year. She said this is a wonderful event at which the colleges can be in the community with graduating, transferring and/or degree/certificate receiving undocumented/AB540 students and their families.

Vice Chancellor Bailey said it is clear that the campuses have been very busy and that their commitment to students is beyond question. He said they have taken to heart the direction the Board has given and the sentiments the Board has reinforced through their actions and statements. Vice Chancellor Bailey said he applauds the colleges for the great work they do every day on behalf of students, particularly this population of students. He

called the Board's attention to a statement they issued in August of 2017 in the wake of the Charlottesville, Virginia incident, which began:

“There are times when we see or hear something and we know it’s wrong. There is no explanation needed. There’s no context required. There are just some acts and words that have been, are, and always will be just flat out wrong, inappropriate and unacceptable.”

Although the Board’s statement referenced the events in Charlottesville, Vice Chancellor Bailey pointed out that there have been a number of recent events that have fallen into that category as well.

“They brought to light one of the cruel sides of our national nature. It has always been there (though we had hoped it was small), simmering as a dangerous vessel of hate and ignorance. Sometimes it’s overt, other times covert. But no matter how it rears its ugly head, it’s wrong. The hate of racists, bigots, misogynists, homophobes, xenophobes, anti-Semites and all in between who proffer discrimination and prejudice have no place on our campuses, in our community or in our country. This hate and prejudice goes against everything we are and believe as a District and everything we want to create for our students and employees.

“As a Board along with the administration, faculty and staff, we are in solidarity in this resistance. We have and will continue to pursue justice where we live, work and learn, so that our students and their families have safe and welcoming environments in which to thrive and realize their potential. We condemn in the strongest possible way the blatant hate and violence in Charlottesville and at all other places and against all other people by those with this malice in their hearts. We want to assure our students, faculty, staff and all who are part of our District family and community that we will not condone this disgusting behavior and mindset and we will fight any attempt to allow it to permeate our campuses.”

Vice Chancellor Bailey said the presentations tonight highlighting the wonderful work that faculty and staff are doing on the campuses demonstrate that they also have taken that sentiment to heart and it turned into action every single day for their students.

Vice Chancellor Bailey said Congresswoman Speier will be hosting a town hall meeting on Saturday, August 10 at 10:30am at Cañada College to talk about her recent visit to the Mexican border and about the issue of immigration.

Student Trustee Chavez said he believes the things that are being done at each of the campuses do not just fit within the word “sanctuary” but is actual empowerment. He said he appreciates the great things being done.

Trustee Mandelkern thanked each of the staff members from the three campuses and the Dream Centers for their excellent presentations. He thanked them and their colleagues for the compassion, humanity and kindness with which they treat students, which is deserved and what is expected would happen in our environment. He said Dream Act and undocumented students are very vulnerable populations as terrible things are said at the national level about immigrants in general about undocumented immigrants in particular, along with horrible acts that are taking place on our borders. Trustee Mandelkern thanked Vice Chancellor Bailey for reminding the Board of the statement that they made two years ago which made clear that this is not the way that we choose to conduct ourselves as a District and that we choose to take a different path and treat all of our members of our community with the humanity decency compassion and respect that everyone deserves as a human being.

President Goodman thanked District faculty, staff and, most importantly, students for their leadership in ensuring that this continues to stay at the forefront. He also thanked the administration and the Board for continuing the conversation and letting the community know the values that the Board holds as the District continues to protect its students and make sure they have a safe, quality education.

Trustee Nuris expressed gratitude to all who are doing this good work. He said the Board has set the direction and he believes it is the direction most of the community believes is the appropriate one. He said California is different than many other places and it is hard to believe that somewhere in America there is a room full of people who think differently than we do. He said the District must continue to be vigilant and not get comfortable enough to forget the things that are happening in other places around the country. He said the District should support others outside of the area, as well as at the national level, to help carry the message beyond where we live.

Trustee Holoher added his thanks for the excellent presentations and encouraged everyone to keep doing the great work they are doing.

Vice President Schwarz thanked the presenters. She said she has attended the grand openings of the Dream Centers and many of the events described by the presenters. She said there is always more work to do but applauded the dedicated work that is being done on behalf of students on each of the campuses.

**STATEMENTS FROM EXECUTIVES**

None

**STATEMENTS FROM THE PUBLIC ON NON-AGENDA ITEMS**

None

**NEW BUSINESS**

**APPROVAL OF PERSONNEL ITEMS: CHANGES IN ASSIGNMENT, COMPENSATION, PLACEMENT, LEAVES, STAFF ALLOCATIONS AND CLASSIFICATION OF ACADEMIC AND CLASSIFIED PERSONNEL (19-7-2A)**

It was moved by Trustee Nuris and seconded by Trustee Mandelkern to approve the actions in the report. The motion carried, all members voting Aye.

**APPROVAL OF THE ALLOCATION OF TOTAL COMPENSATION AND NEW SALARY SCHEDULES FOR NON-REPRESENTED EMPLOYEES (19-7-3A)**

It was moved by Trustee Mandelkern and seconded by Trustee Nuris to approve the actions in the report. David Feune, Director of Human Resources, summarized the material terms of the proposed allocation of total compensation and new salary schedules, reflecting the agreed upon salary increase, for the non-represented employee group. After his presentation, the motion carried, all members voting Aye.

**APPROVAL OF CONSENT AGENDA**

President Goodman said the consent agenda consists of Board Reports 19-7-1CA through 19-6-4CA. Trustee Mandelkern asked that items 19-7-2CA and 19-7-4CA be removed for further discussion. It was moved by Trustee Nuris and seconded by Trustee Mandelkern to approve items 19-7-1CA and 19-7-3CA. The motion carried, all members voting Aye.

**ACCEPTANCE OF GRANT FOR ONLINE CTE PATHWAYS AT CAÑADA COLLEGE (19-7-2CA)**

It was moved by Trustee Holoher and seconded by Trustee Mandelkern to acceptance the grant as outlined in the report. Trustee Mandelkern said he appreciates the explanation of Calbright, the new online college, but it is not clear to him how Cañada College will actually be using the grant funds. Dr. Tammy Robinson, Vice President of Instruction at Cañada College, said there is a gap with certifying faculty to teach online and also supporting them once they are teaching. She said the grant funds will be used to support faculty in terms of how they continue to teach pedagogically and have pedagogical discussions so that they do not feel alone when they are in that environment. She said there are also several new faculty members who need to go through certification training. The college will also work on its front facing piece with Guided Pathways and other initiatives going forward. Vice President Robinson said the college wants to be sure that students who take online classes understand what it entails. She said the intention is to build an ecosystem so that online students can continue to

be successful and the program can continue to grow even more. Trustee Mandelkern asked for confirmation that the funding is not for a particular course development but is more for general support. Vice President Robinson said it is for general support and to increase the success rate for students. She said Cañada College has very successful faculty learning programs on campus, but they're directed towards STEM. She said one of the goals in writing the grant was to bring STEM to CTE and CTE to STEM. Trustee Mandelkern said he read in President Moore's Report to the Board that one of the college's faculty members has been recognized with a Top Ideas Award for his proposal regarding online learning in preparation for launching Calbright College. He asked if this in any way related to the grant. Vice President Robinson said the award is separate from the grant, but the grant will be used to continue to support the work being done by Professor Nick DeMello, who received the award. After this discussion, the motion carried, all members voting Aye.

#### **DISPOSITION OF DISTRICT RECORDS (19-7-4C)**

It was moved by Trustee Mandelkern and seconded by President Goodman to approve the destruction of obsolete records as detailed in the report. Trustee Mandelkern said he asked that this item be removed in response to a request from a member of the public who raised questions about it. Vice President Schwarz said this is a routine item and Sue Harrison, Director of General Services, will be able to answer questions raised by Maxine Turner. Ms. Turner said there have been issues with the District regarding transparency. She said the board report did not specify which records were being recommended for destruction. She said the report outlined the classes of records but she believes the public needs more information to know what records would be destroyed, how old they are and if they are in Class 1, 2 or 3. Ms. Harrison clarified that the records listed in the board report are Class 3 records which are classified as disposable. Chancellor Galatolo discussed the District's procedure for records management, which is clearly spelled out in Title 5 and which the District follows diligently. He said he disagrees that the District has an issue with transparency and he does not believe this item is connected to transparency in any way. Chancellor Galatolo said he would appreciate questions from the public being forwarded to staff so that they can be prepared to answer the questions. He said this member of the public consistently targets certain departments and staff within those areas. He said he believes her ongoing derogatory attitude toward staff, unchecked by the Board, is alarming.

Trustee Mandelkern said the second question raised by Ms. Turner was whether records relating to the international students program were on the list. He asked Ms. Turner if she had a particular concern about the disposition of those records. Ms. Turner said she is concerned that the international student records may be necessary as part of a follow-on report to the Board and/or the public on the international education program. She requested that the records not be destroyed for that reason. Trustee Holober said the list included in the board report is helpful. He said he disagrees with the Chancellor's ad hominem attack on a member of the public. He said he believes it is important that members of the public to come before the Board and raise questions. After this discussion, the motion carried, all members voting Aye.

#### **Other Recommendations**

#### **APPROVAL OF COLLEGE INSTITUTIONAL SELF-EVALUATION REPORTS (ISERS) TO THE ACCREDITING COMMISSION FOR COMMUNITY AND JUNIOR COLLEGES (ACCJC) (19-7-1B)**

It was moved by Trustee Mandelkern and seconded by President Goodman to approve the reports as presented. Cañada College President Moore said Cañada College is extremely proud of its broad-based, multi-year self-evaluation process in which 83 faculty, staff and administrators actively participated on writing teams and dozens of others pitched in on flex days, retreats and editing workshops. She said these efforts yielded valuable insights, which are already informing and guiding the continuous improvement cycle. She said the college met or exceeded all of its institution-set standards by 2018-19, with the exception of student persistence and growth in FTS. For this reason, the college's areas of strategic focus will continue to be implementing innovative programs and practices that support student persistence and enrollment management. President Moore said the campus has made great strides in its ability to understand and address equity gaps in student outcomes. Over the next five to six years, the college will be scaling the innovative practices launched by the STEM Center, ESL programs, Faculty Learning Program, Academic Committee for Equity and Success (ACES) and Promise Scholars Program

to support and enhance the success of all students. President Moore said Cañada College looks forward to its site visit on September 30 by the ACCJC team.

Skyline College Interim President Jackson said the college has been working on its ISER for two years and has had broad participation, with 88 individuals or writers, two of whom were students. The college used a tri-chair model to make sure there was input from all constituencies. Karen Wong served as the faculty tri-chair; Michele Haggar served as the classified professional tri-chair; and Will Minnich served as the administrator tri-chair. President Jackson said a new aspect of the self-evaluation study is that the ACCJC provides colleges with the opportunity to identify their aspirations through the quality focus essay. This presents an overview of how each college perceives itself and where it wants to go. She said this helped focus her as she came in as interim president. She said the process is more collegial than it has been in the past and the college welcomes the opportunity for the ACCJC to come for the team visit on September 30. She said staff has already been in contact with Dr. Linda Rose, the team chair, who will be coming from Los Angeles. President Jackson said Skyline College has done all the things that it said it would do, and more. She said the college wants to showcase how good it is.

College of San Mateo President Claire thanked the Board and Chancellor Galatolo for their very courageous stance when things were not so good with the ACCJC. He said this District was the only district that was able to take a public stance because of the support of the Board and it started the change that needed to happen. He said he is proud to have been part of that change as he was on the task force that got the change started. He said he has confidence in the ACCJC and will be an official Commissioner as of July 1. President Claire said staff from the colleges have spent a great deal of time informing the Board about each college's innovative programs and practices; however, he said the strategic plan metrics used to measure success and outcomes are identical across the three colleges even though they take different approaches. President Claire said Standards I and II provide a valuable look at how the colleges operate and he hopes the Board will read them because it provides a different view of the colleges than what is discussed at Board meetings. He said Standard I deals with institutional effectiveness and said the colleges ask themselves every day how they can be better. He said they look at data down to the course level and ask themselves how they can make their courses and programs better. He said the ISERs require evidence and College of San Mateo's ISER alone includes fifty pages of references to evidence. President Claire said Standard II addresses instruction and support for students which is the core of what the colleges do and also is documented at a very detailed level. He said Standards III and IV are also very important, with Standard IV covering, in part, the Board of Trustees. President Claire said this is the first time the college has been able to go through an accreditation process and take an inward look at itself and identify ways where we can improve without worrying about being put on sanctions. He said he is, for the first time, looking forward to the accreditation visit.

Trustee Mandelkern thanked the three college presidents and asked that they convey the Board's appreciation to faculty, classified professionals and administrators, as well as District staff who provided materials, for all of their hard work. He said the process seems to have been slightly less onerous than in past years. He said the Board recognizes that that it is still a difficult process, but is a necessary component of what must be done to ensure the quality of the District's educational offerings.

Student Trustee Chavez thanked everybody who was included in the process of writing hundreds of pages and especially for including students in the process.

Trustee Nuris said he is familiar with this process from having served on a high school board. He said he believes going through the process, even outside of being evaluated and accredited, is very valuable because it forces the colleges and district to look at themselves institutionally. He said that were it not for the mandate, it would be easy to let something like this go because of being busy with so many other things. Trustee Nuris said he believes the process is very beneficial. He thanked everyone involved for their work.

Vice President Schwarz said the study session on the ISERs that was held not long ago was helpful. She thanked President Claire for talking about the support of the Board regarding changes by the Commission. However, she

said Chancellor Galatolo was the leader and if it wasn't for leadership, changes would likely not have been made as quickly. She said he led the charge for all the districts and everybody has benefitted from the changes.

After this discussion, the motion to approve the Self-Evaluation reports carried, all members voting Aye.

**ADOPTION OF RESOLUTION NO. 19-11 REGARDING AMENDMENT TO THE SCHOOLS EXCESS LIABILITY FUND JPA AGREEMENT (19-7-100B)**

It was moved by Trustee Holober and seconded by Trustee Nuris to adopt Resolution No. 19-11. The motion carried, all members voting Aye.

**ADOPTION OF RESOLUTION NO. 19-12 REGARDING BOARD ABSENCE (19-7-101B)**

It was moved by Trustee Nuris and seconded by Trustee Holober to adopt Resolution No. 19-12. The motion carried, with Vice President Schwarz abstaining and all other members voting Aye.

**APPROVAL OF CONSTRUCTION CONSULTANTS (19-7-102B)**

It was moved by Trustee Nuris and seconded by Trustee Mandelkern to approve the construction consultants as detailed in the report. Trustee Nuris asked what the role of the consultants is. José Nuñez, Vice Chancellor of Facilities Planning, Maintenance and Operations, said it consists of written consultations, design services in terms of drawings, engineering studies, calculations, etc. After this discussion, the motion carried, with Trustees Goodman, Mandelkern, Nuris and Schwarz voting Aye. Trustee Holober had stepped out of the room and did not cast a vote.

**APPROVAL OF THE SOLE SOURCE PURCHASE OF PORTFOLIUM (19-7-103B)**

It was moved by Trustee Mandelkern and seconded by Trustee Nuris to approve the sole source purchase as detailed in the report. The motion carried, with Trustees Goodman, Mandelkern, Nuris and Schwarz voting Aye. Trustee Holober had stepped out of the room and did not cast a vote.

**INFORMATION REPORTS**

**UPDATE ON STUDENT HOUSING (19-7-3C)**

Vice Chancellor Bailey said the Board has talked about student housing on a number of occasions. He said it is an issue that the District continues to struggle with and evaluate in terms of providing some element of relief and some element of strategy behind how the issue is processed, particularly as it relates to District students. He said the District has a track record of being innovative in the area of housing in this region and throughout the state as it developed the first housing complex for faculty and staff in 2005.

Vice Chancellor Bailey provided a history of discussions relating to the need for student housing:

- June 8, 2016 – Chancellor Galatolo indicated that to allow the international program to grow, student housing would need to be addressed at a future point in time.
- February 11, 2017 – At the Board Retreat, Chancellor Galatolo sought the Board's perspective on exploring student housing opportunities with developers to build affordable housing for students, with the intention of using international student housing proceeds to support domestic students (e.g. incarcerated youth, foster youth, veterans).
- January 10, 2018 – Chancellor Galatolo further discussed the need for student housing and mentioned that 11 of 114 community colleges offer student housing (located mostly in rural areas).
- May 16, 2018 – Chancellor Galatolo once again reinforced the need to build housing to solve international housing demand and, more importantly, generate resources to support foster and incarcerated youth.
- March 16, 2019 – At the Board Retreat, staff delivered a briefing paper; the Board requested additional information regarding other student housing projects.
- April 24, 2019 – Staff provided follow-up information requested by the Board regarding other student housing projects (e.g. Santa Rosa) and the Board gave direction to explore development options.

Vice Chancellor Bailey said staff is now prepared to outline concepts for student housing and to hopefully be able to move forward with the process. He said the concept would be:

- Provide independent, self-contained living spaces for students (no communal living spaces, e.g. restrooms, kitchens).
- Retain a developer to design and construct student housing.
- Hire a third party management operator (not dissimilar from the Housing Board that manages the District faculty and staff housing).
- Leverage, and supplement where necessary, existing college support services for student residents (e.g. cafeteria, physical/mental health, academic support services).
- Identified site is on the College of San Mateo campus, adjacent to the Regional Public Safety Center.
- Facilities size is to be determined, but would likely be several hundred units, to ensure economic feasibility.

Vice Chancellor Bailey displayed an example of a self-contained, 300 sq. ft. unit with a Murphy bed, kitchen area, bathroom and study space. He also displayed a map showing the potential location on the College of San Mateo campus.

Vice Chancellor Bailey discussed the development/funding model for student housing. He said the model is to engage a developer and said that staff has spoken with three potential developers who expressed interest in a project incorporating a long-term land lease and serving as a third-party operator (creating an arm's-length distance as the District does with faculty and staff housing). No out-of-pocket development/construction costs for the District are anticipated, as the developer would bear the full cost burden of the project. The District would apply any profit from the share (from international students) to provide free and/or reduced-cost units to vulnerable domestic students.

Vice Chancellor Bailey said the next steps proposed by staff are to (1) prepare and release a Request for Proposal/Request for Information to better understand the scope and economic parameters of the student housing project, and (2) prepare a project request for the State Capital Outlay program.

Trustee Mandelkern said it was stated that staff did not anticipate any out of pocket development or construction costs because the developer would bear the full cost burden of the project; however, it was also stated that one of the proposed next steps would be to prepare a project request for the State Capital Outlay program. He said these statements seem to be in opposition to each other. Chancellor Galatolo said there are two distinct development concepts. He said one would be to work with a developer who would be willing and ready to move immediately. The other would be to submit an initial project proposal through the state. He said this process takes approximately seven years and would likely require matching funds.

Trustee Nuris said the design shown is for a location at College of San Mateo. He asked if there are areas on the other campuses where student housing could be expanded if developers are willing to build or if state funding is approved in the future. Chancellor Galatolo said sites have been identified at all three colleges. He said the College of San Mateo was identified as the first location because it is shovel ready.

Trustee Holober said the Board just adopted a tentative budget that shows a four and a half percent decrease in international student enrollment, as well as receiving other reports during the past 18 or more months, including one from former Executive Vice Chancellor Blackwood, indicating that international student enrollment is on a decline in the nation as well as in the District. He said the concept being presented is to charge international students more than the fair market value and use the excess to subsidize a small portion of selected local residents, who have been identified as foster care youth and veterans. He said he believes tax advantages would be available to developers in this case. He said this is not a concept that he finds persuasive, particularly in an environment where it appears that international enrollment is flat to declining.

Trustee Holober said another concern has to do with process. He said he believes there are certain occasions where it is appropriate for the Board to bring in its own neutral outside experts to evaluate proposals and to come up with options, looking at best practices elsewhere as well as internal practices. He said he believes this is good example of where it would be appropriate to do so. He said he would be very reluctant to enter into a public/private partnership with a developer in which profit sharing is part of the description without subjecting that concept to a neutral, dispassionate expert review by a consulting firm that the Board would engage. Trustee Holober said the District has had some good luck and some not good luck in the relationships that it has entered into with private businesses and that has led him to be cautious about entering into future private business relationships in areas that are truly outside of the main focus around higher education and job training. He said that getting neutral third party feedback would help him understand better what is in it for the developer. He said he believes developers are looking at certain tax advantages, tax write-offs and profit. He said those are red flags and he would want more information before starting down that path and would also like to consider other options. Trustee Holober added that the District has a very strong statement about local hire local and contracting in San Mateo County and the Bay Area, and that has been applied to construction. He noted that two of the three developers that staff been talking to the most are foreign developers. He said he would question philosophically whether that is where the District wants to be spending its resources.

Trustee Mandelkern said the Board had a number of conversations over the past couple of years regarding housing and housing insecurity issues faced by students, especially more recently regarding homeless students and where they might be housed. He said he believes that all Board members agree that housing in many different ways, shapes and forms is a huge struggle for many students. He said he is excited to see that the Board is actually engaging in discussions about more permanent solutions for housing for students rather than just temporary solutions, including AB 302. Trustee Mandelkern said he shares a number of the concerns that raised by Trustee Holober, particularly regarding the mix of international students versus local students from San Mateo County. He said he believes that as a trustee, he was elected to represent the interests of the people in San Mateo County and not necessarily the interests of families from overseas or students from overseas who come to the colleges to further their education. He said he recognizes that there are some economic benefits as well as some educational benefits of having a robust international student program. However, he is concerned that previous conversations have indicated that this project would be supporting 80 to 85 percent international students and 15 to 20 percent local students. He said this sounds like a wrong ratio to him and does not do enough for domestic students in San Mateo County. He said it seems somewhat disingenuous to propose this as a housing solution when the vast majority of the housing would benefit international students who come to the colleges because they can afford to pay a great deal of money to go to school in the United States. Trustee Mandelkern said he also shares the concern that the small number of domestic students who would be served has been prescribed as incarcerated youth, foster youth and veterans. He said these categories of students are all very worthy, but the issues of housing and housing insecurity are needs that should address students in general and not just these three specific groups. He said he would hate to see the District, either knowingly or unwittingly, supporting a development plan which is by design limited to a certain subset of students because the developers get substantial financing or tax benefits for including those students not others.

Trustee Mandelkern said he would like to get an idea of the proposed rents, e.g. would the project be a market rate development in which students would pay the same amount per month that they would pay for a studio apartment in San Mateo, Redwood City San Bruno, or would the District be able to provide subsidized rents, much like the faculty/staff, housing. He said that providing subsidized rents is one of the reasons that the workforce housing program has been successful. He said he believes that in order for student housing to be successful, substantially below market rate rents for domestic students would have to be provided.

Trustee Mandelkern said he believes the most challenging issues around a student housing project are not who the developer is going to be, what the financing model is going to be, or whether to have a third party manager. He said staff has expertise in these areas and is confident of the well-managed process within the District. He said student housing is a new area for the District and policy/operational issues are the major concerns, including concerns from neighbors, how eligibility would be determined (e.g. full-time versus part-time students, Promise students, students with children, etc.), duration of occupancy, and staffing.

Trustee Nuris said he believes the Board should take a broad view on whether to move forward with housing to find out if it is possible before talking about working out details and to not get bogged down in details before determining if the larger concept is even going to work. He said he does not want to see the project ground to a halt because of details that would be worked out after the project was moving forward. He agreed that it is important that the Board know what proportion of students who would be given an opportunity to living in the housing are domestic as opposed to international students.

Trustee Nuris said he does not have a problem dealing with developers. He said this is not a charity and no one is going to do anything of any value unless they are able to make a profit. Therefore, people will be making money on the project, but in the end the District will also have something that is needed and is of value. Trustee Nuris said that more than 30 years ago, the Jefferson Union High School District closed a high school in Daly City and the Board of Trustees put 99-year land leases together for the site of the former football field. He said there is a large apartment complex and a medical building that pay rent and will continue to do so for 99 years. He said the district has benefited tens of millions of dollars on those two parcels. Trustee Nuris said he believes it is important to take the steps necessary to use the District's excess resources in a way that will be valuable to students and serve specific needs. He said it is known that housing is an important need and he would like to move forward.

President Goodman said he too would like to move forward, but has concerns about how it is moved forward. He said an individual from the San Mateo County Housing Leadership Council was in the audience and asked if that person would like to speak to how the Council might be able to support the District through the process. He said he would also like to reach out to other community partners within the county, including agencies that work with universities on student housing. He said it is important to exhaust all avenues to make sure the District does the best it can as it has done with the faculty/staff housing projects.

Kara Rivera, who works with the Housing Leadership Council of San Mateo County, said the Council is a non-profit organization that advocates for building affordable housing, as well as preserving homes that are already built and protecting the people living there. She said she is present to show support for building student housing on the college campuses. She said the Council works with and has good partnerships with developers as well as other nonprofits that may have more experience with student housing. She said she believes this is something that everyone can work on together to make it a possibility and the Council would like to help in any way it can.

Maxine Turner, a member of the public, said the issue she is concerned about is the growth of the international program and the decline in local students attending the colleges. She said enrollment has been declining for ten years in spite of the billion dollars in bond money taxpayers given to expand the campuses. She said she believes there is clearly work to do to bring more local students into the system. She said she does not understand why the effort has focused on international students while there are local students and their families who are homeless. She said the Middle College programs are a good way to recruit local students to the colleges and she does not believe the high schools should be required to pay the District in order to participate in the programs. She also suggested including consideration of housing for local teachers in the mix of those who would be eligible for a housing project.

Vice President Schwarz said the two greatest concerns and needs in San Mateo County are transportation and housing. She said she was pleased to see that staff have taken into consideration many things that the Board has talked about in the past and put it into perspective so that it can start moving forward and determining how to make it work. She said there will be some negatives and some questions, but she believes the process must move forward because it is extremely important to provide housing for students. Vice President Schwarz noted that the District did not have experience with faculty/staff housing when it was developed and had to determine the mix of residents, e.g. full-time, part-time, percentages of faculty and staff, etc. She said this was all a matter of learning and it has been successful for fifteen years.

Vice President Schwarz said she has always been opposed to student housing being only for international students. She said that local students must be included and the percentage should be a number with which

everyone can be comfortable. She said the Board has heard of incidents in which international students have had very difficult times with their housing and this should be addressed as well. She said she would like to keep moving forward cautiously while taking all of the issues raised into consideration.

Student Trustee Chavez said approximately half of the students in the District are facing insecurity with their rent and do not know if they will be able to afford their rent every month. He said that since the majority of those students are domestic, he would prefer to put the emphasis on them. However, he said he echoes Vice President Schwarz's statement that international students also struggle with housing. He said he would also like to address students who are single parents. Student Trustee Chavez said there is a need for student housing that exceeds the supply and he supports the idea of student housing.

Trustee Mandelkern reiterated the fact that he sees a huge need for housing for District students and is not in any way suggesting that the District not move forward with housing projects, with the focus being on local students in San Mateo County. He said he believes there are some very fundamental issues around the fairness of how this housing, a limited resource where the demand would exceed the supply, would be allocated. He said he believes it is within the Board's purview to make sure policies are in place to determine how District facilities are used and how capital dollars are invested. He said he is not trying to micromanage this project but is suggesting that the Board consider all the implications before moving forward, and this extends beyond choosing a developer and determining a financing model.

Trustee Mandelkern thanked Ms. Rivera from the Housing Leadership Council for her comments. He said that before the District issues an RFP/RFI, he would like to reach to other local resources. He said there are a number of nonprofit developers such as the Housing Leadership Council, HIP Housing, the Housing Endowment and Regional Trust (HEART) of San Mateo County and BRIDGE Housing, and he would like to reach out and solicit proposals from them. He said they might not be interested in being involved with student housing or they may be busy with other things, but the District will have at least asked the question. He said they may be able to present an alternative model which does not rely on developers who have a profit motive or developers who need 80 or 85 percent of the units to be rented to international students at above market rates.

Trustee Holober said he is well aware of and supportive of programs where land is surplus, such the large shopping center located land owned by Mission Community College in the South Bay which has provided a spectacular source of income. He noted that the District owns the land on which the faculty/staff housing was built and, as a result, it is both extremely affordable and profitable, with the profits going into the general fund to help support the academic program. He said there continues to be an unmet need for faculty and staff affordable housing and he suggested that the District consider mixing it with student housing in an overall project similar to the current faculty/staff housing. He said this could produce surplus revenue that could then cover some of the costs for the neediest local San Mateo County students. Trustee Holober said he would feel more comfortable with a thorough neutral, independent review that would help him understand the business and finance relationships and the profit arrangements early on, as well as exploring other options. Vice President Schwarz said it is her understanding that money from the faculty/staff housing does not go into the general fund but goes into Fund 4 to maintain the housing project. Vice Chancellor Bailey some money is transferred into Fund 4 for reinvestment in capital projects.

Student Trustee Chavez said he believes this is a step in the right direction. That this is the solution that students were looking for and it it will provide less stigma to students who are facing housing insecurity than the temporary solution proposed by AB302.

Trustee Nuris thanked Board members for clarifying their positions. He said that while they may view the issue from somewhat different perspectives, they all the same goal. He said that by collaboratively sharing different viewpoints, he believes the Board will find a middle ground and reach a very good outcome. He said he is confident that they can work together because it is something they need to do.

Vice Chancellor Bailey said staff would like to have direction from the Board on next steps so that the District can capitalize on the immediate need and be able to bring this to fruition sooner rather than later. President Goodman said he believes time is of the essence. He recommended that the topic be on the next study session agenda and that the Board and the community come with potential solutions and questions. He said he believes this should be a major priority and he would like to move toward it with a sense of urgency. As it relates to one of the comments that was made regarding experience in dealing with student housing, President Goodman said an individual from Capstone Management Partners reached out via email and he would suggest that staff reach out to them as well as others in that field to address any of the concerns that have been voiced. He said a number of Board members have very clear concerns around how developers and approached and engaged and these concerns should be addressed before it is time to ask for approval of a developer. He also asked that staff reach out to some of the community partners that were mentioned at this meeting. He said he would like to be very deliberate about the next steps as far as making sure that there is some type of timeline and not just continuing to get periodic updates.

Vice Chancellor Bailey said the topic will be on the agenda for the September study session. In the meantime, he asked that Board members send him their suggestions. Vice President Schwarz said a major issues to be solved are who will fund the project, who might be interested in partnering with the District and what can they offer. President Goodman suggested that staff reach out to the parties mentioned earlier and provide information to the Board in writing in preparation for the study session. Trustee Mandelkern recalled that prior to building the faculty/staff housing, the Board held study sessions to hear from different developers who built this kind of workforce housing as nonprofit educational developers. He suggested that people with different perspectives may be able to come in and help educate the Board further before final recommendations are made.

#### **UPDATE ON PUBLIC SAFETY STUDY IMPLEMENTATION (19-7-4C)**

José Nuñez, Vice Chancellor of Facilities Planning, Maintenance and Operations, reviewed the recommendations that the Board approved on May 16, 2018:

1. Reject the recommendation in the Margolis Healy Study to create a sworn police department and reject the recommendation to arm officers.
2. Clarify the mission and role of the Department of Public Safety, focusing on a more community-focused approach to safety that engages the campus communities in creating and maintaining safe environments.
3. Implement, where agreeable and financially and practically feasible, the remaining recommendations of the Margolis Healy study.
4. Explore alternatives to enhance local law enforcement services on or near the District's campuses, including School Resource Officers (SROs), etc.

Vice Chancellor Nuñez said 71 recommendations were included in the Margolis-Healy Study, ranging across all areas of District Public Safety operations, policies, procedures and preparedness. He said the District has completed/implemented 42 of the recommendations to date.

Bill Woods, Director of Public Safety, provided an update on the recommendations that have been completed:

- Developed a Communications Dispatch Center
- Hired a full-time emergency manager
- Made significant additions to the Emergency Annunciation System (EAS)
- Conducted bi-annual in-service training for all Department of Public Safety personnel
- Developed a field training program
- Hosting ongoing meetings with law enforcement partners
- Conducting immediate action / Big Five training
- Formed a District Safety Committee

Mr. Woods outlined Public Safety project on the horizon:

- Threat assessment training for CARES teams. Angélica Garcia, Vice President of Student Services at Skyline College, explained that the function of the CARES teams is behavioral intervention; they assess reports Emergency Management Training Software Program
- Campus CERT (Community Emergency Response Team) training
- License Plate Reader (LPR) based parking system (no permits issued)
- Narcan/Naloxone program
- Forming a staff subcommittee to further evaluate SRO model

Trustee Mandelkern said he appreciates the excellent update provided by Vice Chancellor Nuñez and Director Woods. He said the primary focus is often on an active shooter scenario; however, the more likely threats for the District are earthquakes and wildfires. He said he would like to keep focused on all issues, with the most likely threats coming first. Trustee Mandelkern said he prefers to see evidence-based decision making rather than decision making based on anecdotal evidence or headline gathering. He said evidence must be accurate and it is unfortunate that the Margolis Healy study contained incorrect information, such as the myth that the District is the only one in the Bay 10 without armed officers on campus. He said that when examining incidents around the country, the evidence is not clear that having an armed officer makes a difference in the outcome. He said the SRO model might have merit; however, the college campuses are substantially larger than the high schools and it is uncertain whether SROs would be in the right place on campus and be able to respond faster than local law enforcement agencies. Trustee Mandelkern said that in light of the resources available to deploy and the threats the District must deal with on all issues, the Board made a thoughtful decision to reject the recommendation to create a sworn police department and to arm officers. He said he is comfortable with the decision.

Trustee Mandelkern said improvements that have been made, such as upgrades in communications and dispatch systems, have made a difference in the safety of the campuses. He said the installation of interior locks (“Columbine locks”) is now 100 percent complete and will also make a difference in campus security.

Trustee Mandelkern said he believes license readers introduce some very serious privacy issues if misused. He said policies must be in place regarding how data is gathered and stored and for long it is stored. He said that in the application being discussed, he would hope there is no storage of license plate data. Mr. Woods said the system does not include information on the registered owner of the vehicle; the only information it provides is whether the parking fee is paid or unpaid.

Trustee Mandelkern asked for an update on a previous discussion regarding Public Safety officers engaging more with students and staff. Mr. Woods said the Public Safety Officers’ uniforms are now more casual, letting everyone know that they are not police officers. He said the Public Safety Department has hired officers who are more gregarious and can engage with students and staff more easily.

Trustee Mandelkern said it has been shown that getting information about potential threats posted on social media has value. He asked if the District has a monitoring program in place. Mr. Woods said the District does not have a dedicated person in place to mine social media. However, he said individuals do report threatening posts and the marketing teams regularly look at all social media feeds related to the colleges.

Trustee Mandelkern asked where automated external defibrillators (AEDs) are distributed on the campuses. Mr. Woods said they are located in every building, generally at the first floor main entry, as well as at all athletic facilities. Vice Chancellor Nuñez added that the AEDs are tested on a monthly basis.

Student Trustee Chavez said he believes students on each campus generally feel safe. He said it would be helpful to include Public Safety resources and information on syllabi. He said training is also important, especially with regard to mental health and unconscious bias. Student Trustee Chavez asked if the Public Safety posters have been updated. Mr. Woods said the “911 Zone” posters, containing emergency information, have not been updated pending the completion of updated mapping.

Trustee Holober thanked Vice Chancellor Nuñez and Director Woods for their comprehensive report. He said he believes the campuses are safe and that the Public Safety Department is doing an excellent job. Regarding threat assessment, Trustee Holober said it seems that clues often slip through the cracks. He said that if the District were to employ the SRO model, one potential job of the SRO would be to participate in threat assessment.

Trustee Holober asked about the status of upgrading the public address system. Vice Chancellor Nuñez said there is now 90 to 95 percent coverage. He said a system check is completed every week and ITS works on any dead spots that are reported. He said that all new construction and modernization projects include voice activation.

Trustee Holober said monitoring of social media and license plate readers are sensitive issues but he believes they can be used properly. He said there must be clear policies that restrict the use and sharing of information.

Vice President Schwarz reminded the Board that they appointed a Public Safety Subcommittee. The members who were appointed are President Goodman, Vice President Schwarz and the former student trustee. Student Trustee Chavez will now serve on the subcommittee as the student representative.

#### **DISCUSSION OF BOARD OF TRUSTEES SELF-EVALUATION (19-7-5C)**

Vice President Schwarz said the Board previously discussed the changing the format of the self-evaluation, including the possibility of garnering feedback from external stakeholders. Trustee Mandelkern said the discussion also included the possibility of changing the response scale. Vice President Schwarz suggested that a subcommittee of the Board be formed to assess the current format and make recommendations for changes.

Trustee Mandelkern said he is not opposed to soliciting feedback from individuals who regularly attend Board meetings and from members of the public who come to meetings to address the Board; however, he said he would add a qualifying question asking those individuals if they agreed or disagreed with the Board's action because this would likely affect the feedback they provide. Trustee Holober suggested that if feedback is sought from external stakeholders, it be from a sample of two or three individuals from different groups, e.g. executives, classified representatives, certificated representatives, students and the public. Trustee Nuris said the Board is evaluated every four years at the ballot box. He said it is called a self-evaluation, meaning the Board examines itself from within. He said he believes Board members know best how to evaluate themselves because they know fully the issues they are dealing with, both in open and closed sessions. Vice President Schwarz, Trustee Holober and Trustee Mandelkern said they would tend to concur with Trustee Nuris' comments. President Goodman said the suggestion to solicit feedback was made in an effort to explore best practices which have changed over time. He said this would not necessarily need to be included in the self-evaluation if a better mechanism is identified to help the Board come to a better understanding of how they are perceived and how they can best do their job in a meaningful way.

The Board agreed to appoint Trustee Holober and Trustee Nuris to a subcommittee to study the current self-evaluation process and make recommendations on potential changes. It was also agreed that Student Trustee Chavez will be a member of the subcommittee, pending confirmation that his membership will not violate any provision of the Brown Act.

#### **COMMUNICATIONS**

None

#### **STATEMENTS FROM BOARD MEMBERS**

Trustee Holober said the U.S. Department of Education issued regulations that are of concern in California for students who attend mainly online programs for non-profit colleges that are out of state. He said California currently is not in compliance with the regulation that requires a student complaint process for students to file complaints against non-profit, out-of-state colleges, resulting in students being ineligible for Pell grants and other forms of financial aid. He said the state is working on a response to come into compliance.

Trustee Mandelkern said he was disappointed that no broadcast equipment was used for this meeting. He said he hopes the idea will not be abandoned.

Vice President Schwarz said she received a communication from the Community College League of California regarding the “Food for Thought Act” which is co-sponsored by the League and Congressman Adam Schiff. The bill seeks to establish a meal program to address food insecurity on community college campuses across the country. The League requests that trustees and CEOs consider so-sponsoring the bill with them and Congressman Schiff. Vice President Schwarz said she hopes the Board will consider doing so.

**ADJOURNMENT**

The meeting was adjourned by consensus at 9:20 p.m.

Submitted by

Michael Claire, Secretary

Approved and entered into the proceedings of the September 25, 2019 meeting.

Karen Schwarz  
Vice President-Clerk