

**Minutes of the Regular Meeting of the Board of Trustees  
San Mateo County Community College District  
April 24, 2019, San Mateo, CA**

**The meeting was called to order at 3:00 p.m.**

**Board Members Present:** President Maurice Goodman, Vice President Karen Schwarz, Trustee Richard Holober, Trustee Dave Mandelkern, Trustee Thomas A. Nuris

**ANNOUNCEMENT OF CLOSED SESSION ITEMS FOR DISCUSSION**

President Goodman said that during Closed Session, the Board will (1) hold a conference with legal counsel regarding two cases of anticipated litigation as listed on the printed agenda, (2) consider public employee discipline, dismissal, release, (3) hold a conference with labor negotiator as listed on the printed agenda, (4) consider ratification of confidential district warrants, and (5) conduct a public employee performance evaluation as listed on the printed agenda.

**PUBLIC COMMENTS ON CLOSED SESSION ITEMS ONLY:** None

**RECESS TO CLOSED SESSION**

The Board recessed to Closed Session at 3:02 p.m.

**RECONVENE TO OPEN SESSION**

The Board reconvened to Open Session at 6:15 p.m.

**Board Members Present:** President Maurice Goodman, Vice President Karen Schwarz, Trustee Richard Holober, Trustee Dave Mandelkern, Trustee Thomas A. Nuris, Student Trustee Gabriela Topete Eng Goon

**Others Present:** Chancellor Ron Galatolo, Chief Financial Officer Bernata Slater, Skyline College Vice President of Student Services Angélica Garcia, College of San Mateo President Michael Claire, Cañada College President Jamillah Moore, District Academic Senate President Leigh Anne Shaw

**PLEDGE OF ALLEGIENCE**

President Goodman said today is Administrative Professionals Day. He thanked all administrative professionals in the District for their work.

**ANNOUNCEMENT OF REPORTABLE ACTION TAKEN IN CLOSED SESSION**

President Goodman said the Board approved confidential District warrants. He said the Board will return to closed session at the conclusion of the open session to continue consideration of the remaining items as listed above.

**DISCUSSION OF THE ORDER OF THE AGENDA:** None

**STATEMENTS FROM EXECUTIVES AND STUDENT REPRESENTATIVES**

Chancellor Galatolo said Alan Miller, who was a Programmer Analyst in the ITS Department, passed away unexpectedly. He said Mr. Miller will be sorely missed and asked that the Board adjourn this meeting in his memory.

Juyi (Johnny) Yang, President of the Associated Students of Cañada College (ASCC) and Vice President Gabriela Ramirez presented the student report. They reported on two housing initiatives:

- International Housing – students are grateful to the District for working with them in fall 2018 to develop a thorough process and new form for resolving student home-stay issues and educating students about home-stay guidelines.
- Emergency Housing – surveys indicate that 470 Cañada College students are homeless/housing insecure. The Student Senate reviewed campus data and spoke to many students living in their cars. They currently are creating a list of places students can park safely with access to restrooms. Students presented the idea of an emergency housing room on campus to Chancellor Galatolo. ASCC fully supports housing being built on campus for students.

President Yang and Vice President Ramirez highlighted the following fall 2018 and spring 2019 ASCC events: participation in the Redwood City Fourth of July parade; Campus Movie Fest; LatinX Celebration; 50<sup>th</sup> Showcase; Black Excellence; Demystifying Social Media and Sexual Harassment; and First Mobile Night. Students attended the National Student Leadership Conference and NASPA Conference and will attend the upcoming National Conference on Race and Ethnicity. President Yang and Vice President Ramirez outlined Student Senate highlights. The Senate provides free printing for students, \$1.00 per ride bus tokens, subsidized meal bundles and a child care resource list. The Senate hosted an Alternative Spring Break, during which students sorted and packaged food for Second Harvest Food Bank. President Yang and Vice President Ramirez said student leaders have learned that they must acknowledge and challenge privilege, that student voices can actually lead to change, and that students can truly give back to the community. They thanked Misha Kealoha, Student Life and Leadership Manager, for her leadership and support.

### **STATEMENTS FROM THE PUBLIC ON NON-AGENDA ITEMS**

None

### **PRESENTATIONS TO THE BOARD BY PERSONS OR DELEGATIONS**

#### **REPORT ON ACTIVITIES OF PHI THETA KAPPA CHAPTERS AT CAÑADA COLLEGE, COLLEGE OF SAN MATEO AND SKYLINE COLLEGE (19-4-3C)**

Dalila González Mejía, Co-President of Beta Zeta Nu, the Cañada College PTK Chapter, said PTK Honors in Action projects are research-based projects in which students collaborate with administrators to address a need in the community. Beta Zeta Nu's latest project focused on behavioral economics and how it can make a difference in terms of bolstering student success rates via student participation in programs that are already in place, such as the Bridge to Opportunities peer mentoring program and STEM Ambassadors.

Anna Mokkaapati, Beta Zeta Nu Vice President of Scholarships, said the Chapter's College Project tested student knowledge on Student Learning Outcomes (SLOs) and faculty compliance with SLOs. To do this, students gathered evidence to establish whether the college met Accreditation Standard 2A. Ms. Mokkaapati said Beta Zeta Nu received a Distinguished College Project award and a Continued Excellence award. It was also named the fifth most distinguished chapter nationwide out of 1,400 chapters.

Ariana Davarpanah, new president of the PTK Chapter at College of San Mateo, said the Chapter previously received a Distinguished Honors in Action project award and a Distinguished Theme award. They are now working on their newest Honors in Action project.

#### **CONTEMPORARY CONVERSATION REGARDING RACE, CLASS, GENDER, PRIVILEGE AND EQUITY (19-4-4C)**

President Goodman said the topic for this discussion is disability resources and services for students with special needs. Dr. Aaron McVean, Vice Chancellor of Educational Services and Planning, said the colleges' Disability Resource Centers are an important part of the commitment to equity and student success.

Max Hartman, Dean of Counseling at Cañada College, said serving students with disabilities is equity work and he is pleased that the Board is including it as part of the ongoing discussion on race, class, gender, privilege and equity. He said education can and should be the solution to close societal gaps and the work being done on the campuses can serve as a model for addressing inequities. Dean Hartman said counselors at the three colleges work every day with students with disabilities through an interactive process that modifies the educational environment so that students can succeed to the best of their abilities.

Melissa Matthews, Counselor and Coordinator for the Disability Resources Center (DRC) at Skyline College, highlighted three areas that serve students with disabilities at the college:

1. Guiding Your Path to Success (GPS): Funded by a President's Innovation Fund grant, GPS supports students as they go from high school to college, a transition which can be particularly challenging to students with disabilities.
2. High satisfaction rates: A recent satisfaction survey of students and faculty, mandated by the State Chancellor's Office as part of program review, indicated that 94 percent of student respondents strongly agree or agree that the DRC contributed to their success and that the DRC provided a welcoming environment.

3. Focused math support: Recognizing that math can be a barrier in terms of college completion, the college offers one-on-one intensive math tutoring, as well as a class focusing on skills and strategies in the affective domain of math.

Carol Newkirk, Director of the Disability Resource Center at College of San Mateo, said the results of the satisfaction survey for College of San Mateo indicate that 95.2 percent of respondents feel that the DRC provides a welcoming and positive environment, makes it comfortable to request services, is responsible for students with disabilities and contributed to their success. Faculty responses were also very favorable. Ms. Newkirk said she is particularly proud of the survey results because the program has had a 29 percent increase over the last three years and it can be difficult to scale a program with such rapid growth. There has also been a 43 percent increase over the last three years in assistive technology and alternative media. Ms. Newkirk outlined some of the assistive technology products used to help students and ensure equity and inclusivity.

Regina Blok, Interim Director of the Disability Resource Center at Cañada College, said the college's DRC offers the same services described by colleagues from College of San Mateo and Skyline College. She said the DRC is noticing more requests to have service animals in the classroom and faculty have been supportive of this. She highlighted trainings and in-service programs, particularly with regard to the autistic population which has grown exponentially and currently represents eight to nine percent of DRC students. Ms. Blok said the student satisfaction survey indicates a 99 satisfaction rate. The faculty survey will be administered next week.

Tina Watts, Faculty Coordinator for the Child Development Center at Skyline College, said the area of expertise in the Child Development Centers at both Skyline College and College of San Mateo is early intervention and assessment. All children in the programs receive developmental screening upon entering, at 60 days and every six months. The Centers provide home visiting and conferences on a regular basis as well as referral to community agencies when there are suspected delays or when parents have concern about some aspect of their child's development. Staff also meet regularly with support services and participate in individual family service plans or individual education plans. Representatives from support services, such as Occupational Therapy, Physical Therapy and Applied Behavior Analysis, come into the classrooms and work with staff to make sure there are enough resources and appropriate curriculum to meet children's needs. President Goodman noted that the early childhood educators are very well versed in supporting parents.

President Claire said the services offered at the colleges for students with disabilities or learning differences make a tremendous difference. He said this is definitely an equity issue.

Student Trustee Topete Eng Goon said the DRCs do an excellent job in making sure students get appropriate help. She said she appreciates the work they do with veterans, particularly those with traumatic brain injuries and post-traumatic stress disorder.

Vice President Schwarz said the presentations were excellent. She said it saddens her that educational institutions beyond community college do not continue to offer the same services to students. She complimented the Child Development Centers on continuing to help parents with their struggles as the population of children needing services has increased.

Dr. Angélica Garcia, Vice President of Student Services at Skyline College, said race and class can have an impact on placing students on tracks without recognition of their academic abilities. She said this is an equity issue and the colleges are doing good work trying to rectify it.

Trustee Holober said the work being at the colleges is vital and life changing. He asked the presenters to think about what more the Board can do to support their work.

President Goodman thanked the presenters. He said the Board is committed to continuing the discussions on race, class, gender, privilege and equity.

**ADOPTION OF RESOLUTION NO. 19-6 IN RECOGNITION OF NATIONAL AUTISM MONTH (19-4-100B)**  
It was moved by Vice President Schwarz and seconded by Trustee Mandelkern to adopt Resolution No. 19-6. The motion carried, all members voting Aye.

**NEW BUSINESS****APPROVAL OF PERSONNEL ITEMS: CHANGES IN ASSIGNMENT, COMPENSATION, PLACEMENT, LEAVES, STAFF ALLOCATIONS AND CLASSIFICATION OF ACADEMIC AND CLASSIFIED PERSONNEL (19-4-2A)**

It was moved by Trustee Holober and seconded by Trustee Nuris to approve the actions in the report. The motion carried, all members voting Aye.

**RE-EMPLOYMENT OF CONTRACT AND REGULAR FACULTY FOR THE 2019-20 ACADEMIC YEAR (19-4-3A)**

It was moved by Trustee Mandelkern and seconded by Trustee Holober to approve the actions in the report. The motion carried, all members voting Aye.

**APPROVAL OF CONSENT AGENDA**

President Goodman said the consent agenda consists of Board Reports 19-4-1CA through 19-4-4CA. It was moved by Vice President Schwarz and seconded by Trustee Nuris to approve the items on the consent agenda. The motion carried, all members voting Aye.

**Other Recommendations****ADOPTION OF RESOLUTION NO. 19-7 HONORING DR. REGINA STANBACK STROUD AND NAMING HER AS “PRESIDENT EMERITA” OF SKYLINE COLLEGE (19-4-101B)**

It was moved by Vice President Schwarz and seconded by Trustee Holober to adopt Resolution No. 19-7. The motion carried, all members voting Aye.

**APPROVAL OF REVIEW AND REVISIONS TO BOARD POLICIES: 1.45 AGENDAS FOR MEETINGS; 1.60 RULES OF ORDER FOR BOARD MEETINGS; 2.06 BOARD POLICIES AND ADMINISTRATIVE PROCEDURES (19-4-102B)**

It was moved by Trustee Nuris and seconded by Trustee Holober to approve the revisions as detailed in the report. Vice Chancellor/Chief of Staff Mitchell Bailey said minor changes are recommended for Policy 1.45 and no edits are recommended for Policy 1.60. He said a minor, technical update is recommended for Policy 2.06; because position titles can change and/or the positions can be vacant, the recommendation is that all policies will reference only the “Chancellor (or designee)” as the responsible party for implementing Board policies and developing administrative procedures. The motion carried, all members voting Aye.

**INFORMATION REPORTS****REVIEW OF BOARD POLICIES: 1.01 DISTRICT MISSION; 1.35 BOARD MEMBER CONDUCT; 1.50 MINUTES OF MEETINGS (19-4-5C)**

Policy 1.01, District Mission: Vice Chancellor Bailey said a thorough review and discussion of this policy is warranted, including an added emphasis on equity. However, in light of the accreditation cycle and the fact that the policy is due for review in accordance with the six-year cycle specified in Board policy, staff recommends approving the minor edits at this time. In the future, staff recommends that the District Mission be reviewed every three years in conjunction with the strategic planning process. In addition, it is recommended that it be reviewed annually through the participatory governance process.

Trustee Mandelkern asked if the mandatory annual review would add significantly to the District Participatory Governance Council’s workload. Vice Chancellor Bailey said the Council discussed this issue and is very comfortable with the approach, believing that it will help focus the group and add perspective to the other things they do. District Academic Senate President Leigh Anne Shaw, who is co-chair of the District Participatory Governance Council, agreed that the Council is comfortable with the annual review. She said it will provide a more intentional approach in general. Student Trustee Topete Eng Goon said the student members of the Council agree with the need for an annual review and feel strongly about adding more focus on equity, which the colleges have already added to their missions.

1.35, Board Member Conduct: Vice Chancellor Bailey said the two recommended edits deal with the accreditation standard regarding the Board speaking with one voice and with coordination of the Board speaking to the media, which has been discussed over time.

Trustee Holober said he disagrees with the first sentence in the recommended new language in item #4: "Members of the Board will coordinate with the Chancellor on any requests from media seeking comment about issues pertaining to Board or District matters." He said he believes Board members by and large exercise a reasonable and balanced amount of self-censorship in dealings with the media. He said he believes there is a point at which it becomes an infringement on their rights as individual elected officials. For example, he received calls and had candid conversations during his campaign for re-election to the Board and it would have been stifling if he had to coordinate with the chancellor.

President Goodman said he would support striking all of the language in the proposed item #4 because he believes Board policy already states that the Board President shall speak on behalf of the Board. Trustee Mandelkern said this has been the practice but it might not be stated in a policy. He said he believes it is good policy to have the Board President speak to the media on behalf of the Board unless the President gives approval for another trustee to have the conversation. Trustee Mandelkern said he informs the Chancellor or Chief of Staff if he has received an inquiry that should be addressed by the District as well. He said he believes the issue involves advising the administration rather than having them speak for the Board or going through them before the Board can speak.

President Goodman said Dr. Stephanie Droker, Senior Vice President of the Accrediting Commission for Community and Junior Colleges, recently stated her belief that a Trustee who is not the President should not express his/her point of view either before or after a vote is taken. President Goodman said that before any revisions to the policy are approved, he believes legal advice should be sought on what a Board member can say before the Board votes on an item. Vice Chancellor Bailey said staff will seek legal counsel. He said staff will also determine whether there is current policy language designating the Board President as being the spokesperson for the Board.

Trustee Mandelkern said he believes it is important to delineate between decisions that have been reached by a vote of the Board versus discussions prior to a vote. He said he believes Dr. Droker's statement that a Board member speaking to the media prior to a vote might be a violation of the Brown Act is a misinterpretation of the law. Trustee Mandelkern said Accreditation Standard IV.C.2 states, "The governing board acts as a collective entity. Once the board reaches a decision, all board members act in support of the decision." He said this statement is simpler and less prescriptive than the proposed language in item #3 and he would like to see the language in the standard followed more closely in the policy. Student Trustee Topete Eng Goon said her understanding of the Brown Act concern is that when a Board member speaks with the media prior to a vote on an issue that is likely to come before the Board, it may be interpreted as sending a message to fellow Board members about how that trustee is going to vote and potentially attempting to influence the votes of other members.

Student Trustee Topete Eng Goon expressed concern about whether the student trustee discussing a decision with the District Student Council (DSC) a decision that has already been made by the Board would violate the policy on speaking as one voice. Trustee Nuris said he believes it would be appropriate for the student trustee to report back to the DSC and to discuss the impact of the decision. However, he said he believes it would be best for students and any others to come to Board meetings when they see items of concern or interest on the agenda and express their opinions before a decision is made.

Trustee Mandelkern said that speaking as one voice affects elected Board members as well because they all represent different constituencies in the community. He said the student trustee is expected to support decisions as part of the Board in the same way as all Board members.

Vice President Schwarz said that if all Board members do not stand together once a vote is taken, all is lost and discord goes out into the community. She said she believes the student trustee should explain the vote of the Board but not advocate against it. She said there is opportunity for everyone to come to Board meetings to express their views and there are also ways to reach individual Board members. Student Trustee Topete Eng Goon said her intention is not to suggest that the student trustee would say that he/she is opposed to the vote. However, she said it is not always logistically possible for the DSC, which is composed of students from each of the campuses, to meet after the board packet is published and before the date of the meeting. Therefore, when the student trustee reports back to the DSC on decisions, the students might raise points and express opinions that were not considered prior to the Board's vote. Trustee Mandelkern said he is not opposed to having other opinions brought back to the Board, but agreed that it would be more effective to bring concerns before a vote is taken.

President Goodman said it is important that student trustees feel they can do their job without fear of being removed because of their stance or because of being seen as an agitator. He added that if he opposes a decision of the Board on moral grounds, he will not respect or support it. He said that is a choice that each Board member must make.

Returning to the discussion on the proposed new policy language, Trustee Holober said he believes the language in Accreditation Standard IV.C.2 covers the issue of speaking with one voice and should be used in place of the new language in item #3. He said this connects to the next agenda item regarding board meeting minutes in that detailed minutes shed light on how and why Board members decided to cast their votes the way they did. He said this goes beyond a Board member stating that his/her vote speaks for itself and allows the press to get an idea of how the Board arrived at a decision.

Chancellor Galatolo said his understanding is that for item #3, the language in the accreditation standard will be followed more closely. He said two options have been proposed with regard to item #4: strike the language altogether or revise to read:

Members of the Board will coordinate with the Board President on any requests from media seeking comment about issues pertaining to Board or District matters. Individual members of the Board shall not speak on behalf of the Board or the District unless authorized by the Board President to do so.

President Goodman said he does not object to keeping this modified language in the policy. Trustee Mandelkern suggested adding language about informing the District regarding media requests.

Trustee Holober said the new proposed language is related to accreditation concerns. He suggested deleting the proposed new language in items #3 and #4 and simply stating that the Board will act in accordance with Accreditation Standard IV: Leadership and Governance. Trustee Mandelkern agreed with this suggestion.

It was agreed that Vice Chancellor Bailey will bring this policy back at a future meeting and include options based on the Board's discussion.

Policy 1.50, Minutes of Meetings: Vice Chancellor Bailey said the minutes are very detailed and not in compliance with the Board's policy on minutes, Robert's Rules of Order or the City Clerks Association of California's *Guidelines for Preparing Minutes for Governmental Agencies*. He said the proposed changes reflect the current standard practice of documenting actions of the Board, i.e. the "what" versus the "how."

Trustee Holober said he finds the current method of presenting minutes extremely useful and does not support the changes. He said he has used the detailed minutes to track and review the history on a number of items. He added that there are no guidelines for public education that are similar to the City Clerks Association's guidelines.

Trustee Nuris he believes the purpose of minutes is to record actions of the Board rather than documenting everyone's thoughts. He said the preparation of detailed minutes takes a great deal of staff time. He said meeting agendas are public documents and the media and members of the public can attend and hear what everyone has to say. In addition, anyone can request to receive an audio recording of a meeting. Trustee Nuris said the Board could decide to extend the length of time that audio recordings are preserved beyond the current thirty days.

Vice President Schwarz said change is difficult but she believes that having a recorded documentation of a meeting is the most accurate format and makes better use of staff's valuable time. She said she supports the proposed revisions and is open to extending the length of time that audio recordings are stored.

Trustee Mandelkern said the minutes are not a verbatim transcript. He said he believes the minutes are currently well done and the format is useful for purposes of review. He said he does not understand the motive for the suggested revisions and asked if it is overwhelming to prepare the minutes in the current format. Chancellor Galatolo said the current method of preparation takes a substantial amount of time. Ginny Brooks, Executive Assistant to the Board, confirmed that the preparation is very time consuming. She said that because the current format includes transcribing the comments of individual Board members, it is important to record their statements accurately and requires listening to the recording of the meeting several times while preparing the minutes.

Student Trustee Topete Eng Goon suggested that the policy maintain the statement allowing a Board member, including the Student Trustee, to request that the reason for his/her vote be included in the minutes.

Trustee Mandelkern said he believes the District could be more transparent and he believes that broadcasting meetings would increase transparency. Trustee Holober said the last item in the City Clerks Association's document makes a distinction between whether or not meetings are being recorded and are available to members of the public: "The legislative body may wish to choose more substantive (summary) minutes if there's no archival audio/video backup recording available of its proceedings. If audio/video recording is available for future reference, minute notations can be more limited (action)." Maxine Turner, a member of the public, said she believes transparency is key. She said holding an audio recording for 30 days does not give the public adequate access. She said that if a change is made in the format of the minutes, she believes it should be accompanied by a substitute such as livestreaming.

Trustee Nuris reiterated that he considers the purpose of minutes to be the reporting of actions. He said that to include all comments almost verbatim goes beyond the scope of what minutes should contain. He said anyone can attend the public meetings and the District is not hiding anything. Trustee Nuris said audio recordings are available and could be stored for a longer time. Vice President Schwarz agreed that the Board exercises transparency and does not turn anyone away. She said that having almost verbatim minutes does not serve the intent of Government Code 53232.3(d): "Members of a legislative body shall provide brief reports on meetings. . ." She said she supports a move to briefer minutes and is open to keeping the audio recordings for a longer time. Trustee Holober said the District is governed by the Education Code rather than the Government Code and he does not believe the Education Code includes similar language.

President Goodman said he agrees that there should not be verbatim minutes but that there should be some compromise, whether it be livestreaming or making files available online. He said he believes the Board should send a supportive message to staff about a reasonable workload and he believes the current workload regarding the reporting of minutes is not reasonable. President Goodman said he agrees with making changes to the policy but said this should come at the same time as a parallel policy on the recording and archiving of meetings. He asked that both items be brought back simultaneously for discussion at a future meeting.

#### **DISCUSSION OF 2019 COLLEGE INSTITUTIONAL SELF-EVALUATION REPORTS (ISERS) (19-4-6C)**

Vice Chancellor McVean said the processes used to create the ISERS were discussed at a previous study session. He said the ISERS presented at this meeting are in draft form and the final ISERS will be brought for consideration of approval at the July 24 meeting.

President Moore said that in order to maximize the potential of student success, Cañada College has rededicated itself to the critical cycle of data-informed strategic planning, guided by the insights and shared learning of the previous cycle. She said everyone involved worked collegially and collaboratively to address all of the requirements of Accreditation Standards I through IV and to look at areas of continuous improvement. Significant reform efforts include Guided Pathways, collaboration on the District strategic plan, replication of the CUNY Accelerated Study in Associate Programs (ASAP) and Promise Scholar models, and full implementation of AB705 to make sure students are enrolled in college level math and English. President Moore said she believes Cañada College has met all of the standards and is on the right path.

President Claire said he is pleased with the process College of San Mateo used to create the ISER. He said there was ample opportunity for the college community to comment on the accuracy of the ISER. He said he is confident that the college has met all of the standards. President Claire said the goal of accreditation visiting teams is to help the colleges and each of the colleges will receive recommendations in this spirit. He said College of San Mateo is not concentrating on graphic design for the ISER as the ACCJC has stated it does not want pictures but wants an emphasis on substance.

Vice President Garcia said each of the colleges engaged in multifaceted work to produce the ISERS. She said Skyline College is proud of the tri-chair model which promoted participation by faculty, staff and administrators. She said the ISER highlights the good work that is taking place at Skyline College on teaching and learning. She said there is a direct connection to the District strategic plan and the statewide Vision for Success, while maintaining Skyline College's mission to empower and transform a global community of learners. Vice President Garcia said she is confident the all of the standards will be met and that some will be exceeded.

Vice President Schwarz thanked all of the presenters. She particularly complimented College of San Mateo for including an informative and engrossing twelve minute audio summary of the ISER on its accreditation website.

**DISCUSSION ON STUDENT HOUSING (19-4-7C)**

Chancellor Galatolo said this topic has come before the Board previously and a white paper on the topic was presented at the Board's annual retreat in March. He said staff also gathered data on other community colleges' programs at the request of the Board.

Vice Chancellor Bailey said eleven California community colleges offer student housing and almost all are in rural areas. Nine of the eleven run the housing programs themselves and the other two use outside providers. Student housing at Columbia College is privately run through a lease agreement with the college. The Cerro Coso Community College Foundation owns and operates the student housing at the Mammoth campus. In addition, Santa Rosa Junior College, which had student housing at one time in the past, has released plans for a \$43 million complex which is designed to be a public/private partnership with a national student housing corporation.

Vice Chancellor Bailey said the experiences of the colleges with which he has communicated have been largely positive and have enabled the colleges to recruit and maintain students. The majority of issues revolve around disputes between students who share rooms. Trustee Holober said he appreciates the information about other colleges' experiences. He said he would like additional information on how the housing is paid for and who is served.

Chancellor Galatolo said the best way to address the issue of student housing is to ask what problem the District is attempting to solve. He said the greatest issues for international students are housing and transportation. These students generally have the ability to pay for housing but appropriate home stays are becoming more and more difficult to find. Housing is also a major issue for some domestic student populations, particularly foster youth and formerly incarcerated youth who do not have the financial resources to pay for housing. One solution to help these domestic students would be to draw from the general fund and take money away from the entire domestic student population. Another solution, which has been discussed previously, would be to have international students pay a fair rate for housing units and free up other units that could be provided to vulnerable students at low or no cost. Chancellor Galatolo said this combined solution would provide workable outcomes for student populations who otherwise have both transportation and housing problems. He said staff seeks direction from the Board on whether staff may continue to explore economic models and report back at a future meeting.

Andrew Young of the Associated Students of College of San Mateo said forty percent of undergraduates in the United States are educated by community colleges. In California, 2.1 million students attend community college and three out of ten individuals between the ages of 18 and 24 are enrolled in community colleges. Mr. Young said he believes community college students should lead by example and support the bill that would allow students who are housing insecure to sleep in their cars on campus until a housing project can be utilized. He said he believes this is a viable short-term solution.

Trustee Mandelkern said he appreciates the report that provided data on how some other districts are addressing the issue of student housing. He said he believes everyone recognizes the vast need for housing on the campuses but it should be addressed in a thoughtful and sensible manner. He said he is confident that the District knows how to plan and develop projects. However, he said a myriad of policy issues have not yet been addressed, such as how units would be allocated, how roommates would be assigned, how disputes would be resolved, whether part-time students would be eligible, whether there would be co-ed or single gender pods, etc. Trustee Mandelkern said he would like staff to come back with detailed proposals on policy issues before moving forward and he hopes this can be done quickly. He said that in the meantime, he believes short-term steps should be taken to more quickly meet the needs of students, such as Assemblymember Berman's Assembly Bill 302.

Vice President Schwarz said she feels the need to move forward with developing student housing and is confident that policy issues can be addressed at the same time, as they have been with the employee housing. She said she does not want to mix this issue with the conversation about temporary solutions. She said potential short-term solutions require a detailed conversation which she believes should take place separately.

Trustee Nuris said he agrees that these issues need to be addressed as soon as possible. He said the District can continue to seek information from others who have already offered student housing. He said the administration is asking for direction from the Board and he supports moving forward on exploring student housing and bringing additional information back to the Board.

Trustee Holober thanked Mr. Young for his comments. He said part of the starting point around the discussion was the issue of homelessness among District students and he would like to see the District find a way to begin to address this problem. He said he is concerned about coming back to an idea that has been floated more than once but about which the Board has yet to hear any of the economics, e.g. who would be served, the cost of the project, and who would pay. He said the Board has been told that the District was approached by a wealthy individual who has an interest in housing construction and wants to team with the District to build student housing. He said he would like to dissect that proposal because the District has had some good partnerships and some that have not worked out so well. He said he would like to have a third party expert review of all of the implications and to look at an array of options rather than just one in which an individual might work around particular targeted populations for tax advantage purposes.

Student Trustee Topete Eng Goon thanked Chancellor Galatolo for working closely with students and including them in the conversation. She said she is an international student, has moved six times in four years, and has found herself sleeping in her car. Moving forward, she said she would like to see a breakdown of the percentages of international students and domestic students who would be offered housing. She said she believes it is important that international students get a fair deal while still helping to subsidize vulnerable populations. Student Trustee Topete Eng Goon said there are good resources in the community that address housing and educate people about fair housing practices.

Trustee Mandelkern said there is a difference between providing housing to students versus faculty and staff in terms of the maturity of the renters and other issues. He said there are also different models to consider, such as apartment based models and dormitory based models. He said he is also interested in the ratios of populations. He said he is concerned about economically impacted students who cannot afford housing and this could include incarcerated youth, foster youth, veterans and students suffering from housing insecurity, as well as some international students. He said he believes the residents of San Mateo County are the District's core constituency.

President Goodman said there have been discussions about housing for both international and domestic students for some time and it is commendable that the conversation is taking place. He said sleeping in cars is a reality for some District students. He said a temporary solution can go on for too long if long-term solutions are not considered at the same time. President Goodman said the problem is a countywide issue and not one that a community college district should shoulder on its own. He said the District's students belonged to a community before they came to the colleges and those communities should be accountable and share responsibility for them. He said officials at the city, county and state levels must be held accountable and focus on real solutions such as navigation centers and perhaps opening school gyms. He said that when elected officials do not take responsibility, there is the perception that the message is, "We don't want to see you; go sleep on the campus." President Goodman said that if Assemblymember Berman's bill passes, it needs to be accompanied by funding and students must be provided with additional resources and services.

President Goodman said Student Trustee Topete Eng Goon requested that the conversation on Assemblymember Berman's bill be placed on the agenda for a Board meeting as a focus of the series on contemporary conversations regarding race, class, gender, privilege and equity. However, it was not included under that category because there was not enough time to make sure that students were aware of the topic and that Assemblymember Berman or his representative could be present.

Trustee Mandelkern said he believes it is important to move forward with solutions as quickly as possible. He said that opening gyms might be a better solution than having students sleep in their cars in parking lots. He said he recognizes that these are not permanent solutions but he cannot feel good knowing that there are students who are looking for places to park their cars, some of which might not be safe. He said he believes short-term and permanent solutions must be discussed simultaneously.

Trustee Mandelkern said that at the Board study session of April 10, he reported Assemblymember Berman's consternation at news story from KTVU Channel 2 with a quote stating, "This approach is one the District's Board of Trustees explored in 2018 and concluded that it was not a dignified, humane or appropriate solution to best serve the housing needs of at-risk students." He said he has determined that the quote came from the white paper prepared by the administration. He said he does not agree with this statement. He said Board members expressed strong feelings and agreed to continue the discussion but did vote on any proposal. Therefore, the quote does not represent an official position of the Board.

Chancellor Galatolo said the District's core competency is educating students. He said one short-term solution could be for student services to introduce and refer students to providers of services in the community whose core competency is

to provide such services. Chancellor Galatolo said staff ran numbers and determined that the cost of opening a parking lot to allow students to sleep in cars would be in excess of \$7 million annually, including costs for security, restroom facilities, issues around ADA accessibility and operational issues. Chancellor Galatolo said that when he first came to the Board asking to explore student housing, the intent was to address the needs of the most vulnerable students, some of whom do not even have cars. He said his request was to come back not only with information on developers, but with potential policies, mixture of students, fees, etc. He said there are now six developers who are interested and he would like to bring back options if the Board gives direction to do so. Trustee Mandelkern said he does not agree with the cost figures provided by Chancellor Galatolo because he is aware of other entities that have opened parking lots at a lower cost. Chancellor Galatolo said public agencies have a different set of regulations they must follow.

Vice President Schwarz said she is in favor of moving forward and receiving additional information and data. She said vulnerable students are often susceptible to others who would do them harm, such as human traffickers.

Trustee Mandelkern said he believes Board members have always been open to receiving proposals but want more detailed information to inform their decision and want to hear more than one option. He agreed with the need to get other agencies involved, but noted that they also are dealing with the housing crisis throughout the County.

Trustee Holoher said the option brought to the Board previously involved having international students who are able to pay for housing subsidize the cost of housing for needy domestic students. He said he would like to make sure the Board is aware of all of the dimensions of this option as well as other options that may be brought forward.

Chancellor Galatolo said there are many options. He said there must be a way to pay for student housing and he is attempting to leverage resources and make the housing cost-effective.

Trustee Nuris said it is clear that the Board is giving direction to move forward and develop a plan that is consistent with what Chancellor Galatolo outlined and which addresses the needs of the Board in order to evaluate the plan properly.

Student Trustee Topete Eng Goon said she would like to see the conversations continue. She asked that the District Student Council continue to be included. Chancellor Galatolo said students have been amazing on the issue of food insecurity and the wonderful initiatives could not have come to fruition without their involvement.

President Goodman summarized the discussion on District student housing by saying the Board would like a clear understanding of the mix of students, comparison of working with a non-profit versus for-profit developer, the motivation in terms of which populations of students to serve, and how need would be determined in terms of geographic area, by college, etc.

#### **DISCUSSION ON NAMING OF FACILITIES (19-4-8C)**

President Goodman said that during the recent event honoring former Trustee Tom Mohr and Sandy Mohr, Congresswoman Jackie Speier suggested renaming Cañada College in honor of Tom Mohr. President Goodman said he was then approached by faculty and staff at Cañada College who support this idea. He said the college Academic Senate subsequently placed the item on a meeting agenda. Chancellor Galatolo said the process for awarding honorary degrees, which is a similar proposal, is usually initiated by the college. He said that in this case, staff would like to determine if there is interest on the part of the Board to pursue the item. If so, it would go back to the college community to work through the process. President Goodman said that if this moves forward, he, Chancellor Galatolo and President Moore would comprise the committee that would work to bring a recommendation to the Board.

Vice President Schwarz said she was approached some time ago by a Cañada College faculty member who talked about renaming the college because of the confusion caused by its name. She agreed that the college must be involved in the conversation.

Trustee Holoher said he will not speak to the specific proposal, but will speak to the current Board policy. He said the policy was developed several years ago when the question of the naming of a facility was raised in connection with a major donor. The policy was modeled after policies of other government agencies, including the City of San Mateo. Trustee Holoher said he believes it is a good policy which allows for consideration when a former employee or trustee has been separated for a minimum of five years. He said he believe this gives time for more reflection and time to look

from the perspective of dispassionately analyzing the lasting impact. He said he does not believe the current policy should be revised. He said there will be a time when this discussion would be appropriate.

Trustee Mandelkern said he believes there is value in the passage of time as it allows for a sense of perspective and for unemotional discussions of pros and cons. He said he believes five years is a reasonable length of time and he is comfortable with the current policy.

President Moore said the Cañada College Academic Senate met on the question of renaming the college for Tom Mohr and had a robust conversation. She said Academic Senate President Hyla Lacefield reported that the Senate will continue the discussion in the fall to allow time for more input from the campus community, including students.

President Goodman said the Board will allow the Cañada College Academic Senate to go through its process and will take the item up again at the conclusion of the Senate's actions.

**COMMUNICATIONS:** None

**STATEMENTS FROM BOARD MEMBERS**

Student Trustee Topete Eng Goon said an event on Human Trafficking was held today at College of San Mateo. She thanked Vice President Schwarz for attending and said her presence was greatly appreciated by students. She said this is an important topic and the next goal is to have an event held at Skyline College.

Trustee Holoher said the State Legislature is currently considering a package of bills that would address abuses in the student loan industry. One of the bills would extend the same rights as people have when they take out mortgages. He said he will bring more information if the Board is interested in considering the question and perhaps taking action. President Goodman asked that Trustee Holoher provide additional information to the Board.

Vice President Schwarz said she is proud of students for bringing forward the issue of human trafficking. She provided each member of the Board a handout from the bay area anti-trafficking coalition.

President Goodman thanked Student Trustee Topete Eng Goon for her guidance and leadership. He assured her that a discussion of Assemblymember Berman's bill will be on the next meeting agenda. He advised her to feel free to reach out to Board members if she would like a trustee to attend an Associated Students meeting.

**RETURN TO CLOSED SESSION**

The Board returned to closed session at 9:50 p.m. to continue consideration of the items listed on the printed agenda.

**RECONVENE TO OPEN SESSION/ANNOUNCEMENT OF REPORTABLE ACTION TAKEN IN CLOSED SESSION**

The Board reconvened to open session at 11:03 p.m. President Goodman said the Board voted unanimously to terminate the employment of the Vice Chancellor of Human Resources and General Counsel.

**ADJOURNMENT**

The meeting was adjourned by consensus at 11:05 p.m. in memory of Alan Miller.

Submitted by

Michael Claire, Secretary

Approved and entered into the proceedings of the September 11, 2019 meeting.

Karen Schwarz, Vice President-Clerk