

**Minutes of the Study Session of the Board of Trustees  
San Mateo County Community College District  
March 8, 2017, San Mateo, CA**

**The meeting was called to order at 5:00 p.m.**

**Board Members Present:** President Thomas Mohr, Vice President Richard Holober, Trustee Maurice Goodman, Trustee Dave Mandelkern, Trustee Karen Schwarz

**ANNOUNCEMENT OF CLOSED SESSION ITEMS FOR DISCUSSION**

President Mohr said that during Closed Session, the Board will (1) hold a conference with legal counsel regarding one case of potential litigation as listed on the printed agenda and (2) hold a conference with agency labor negotiator Kathy Blackwood; the employee organizations are AFT and CSEA.

**STATEMENTS FROM THE PUBLIC ON CLOSED SESSION ITEMS ONLY**

None

**RECESS TO CLOSED SESSION**

The Board recessed to Closed Session at 5:01 p.m.

**RECONVENE TO OPEN SESSION**

The Board reconvened to Open Session at 6:13 p.m.

**Board Members Present:** President Thomas Mohr, Vice President Richard Holober, Trustee Maurice Goodman, Trustee Dave Mandelkern, Trustee Karen Schwarz, Student Trustee Dennis Zheng

**Others Present:** Chancellor Ron Galatolo, Executive Vice Chancellor Kathy Blackwood, Skyline College President Regina Stanback Stroud, College of San Mateo President Michael Claire, Cañada College President Jamillah Moore, District Academic Senate President Leigh Anne Shaw

**Pledge of Allegiance**

**DISCUSSION OF THE ORDER OF THE AGENDA**

None

**ANNOUNCEMENT OF REPORTABLE ACTION TAKEN IN CLOSED SESSION**

President Mohr said the Board took no reportable action during closed session.

**MINUTES**

It was moved by Vice President Holober and seconded by Trustee Schwarz to approve the minutes of the meeting of February 22, 2017. The motion carried, all members voting Aye.

**STATEMENTS FROM THE PUBLIC ON NON-AGENDA ITEMS**

Dylan O'Shea, President of the Associated Students of Skyline College (ASSC), thanked the Board for acknowledging the Holocaust Remembrance event at the last Board meeting. Mr. O'Shea addressed the relationship between ASSC and SMCCCD Rise Up (Rise Up). He said that at the beginning of the semester, the ASSC Council invited Rise Up to attend a meeting to discuss and clarify the demands that were previously presented by Rise Up. At a later meeting, the Council decided to create an unofficial position as liaison to Rise Up; the liaison is Christine Abella. The Council also decided to conduct a study session on the demands. One demand, to create a wellness room or prayer room on campus, has been implemented with the opening of a wellness room. The Council is helping Rise Up find space on campus by co-sponsoring events including the upcoming Know Your Rights event and an Immigration Awareness event. Ms. Abella thanked the Board for supporting the Promise Scholarships; she said the scholarships have helped many students. President Mohr thanked Mr. O'Shea and Ms. Abella for engaging students concerning these important matters.

Roger Nolan said he is a long-time donor and listener of KCSM-FM. He said he is aware of reports of layoffs at the station and of reports of cost overruns. He said he is deeply concerned about the future of the station. He requested that this be placed on the agenda for a future Board meeting so that the community can get accurate information and provide

input. President Mohr thanked Mr. Nolan for his comments and said the Board is aware of the issue. He said he is not aware of plans to do anything major relative to the radio station.

Stephen McReynolds, President of the Associated Students of College of San Mateo (ASCSM), said he has reviewed the demands presented by Rise Up with his advisors and they have identified committees that can address the issues and demands through the participatory governance process. He said he believes it is positive that members of Rise Up speak regularly at Board meetings but noted that this is separate from ASCSM, which is advisory to the Board and representative of students. Mr. McReynolds said that while it is important to keep the lines of communication open between ASCSM and Rise Up, it is also important to note that ASCSM represents 10,000 other students at College of San Mateo. He said he will do everything possible to make sure the campus remains inclusive and open to all students. He said he is not sure it is appropriate to give preferential treatment to a single small group through liaisonship. That being said, Mr. McReynolds said he will do everything in his power to make sure Rise Up's voice is heard.

Colby Riley, ASCSM Cultural Awareness Board Chair, said the campus is very invested in the demands presented by Rise Up, which he believes will help all students. He said an Immigration Awareness event on campus is being planned and attorneys will be present at the event. President Mohr thanks Mr. McReynolds and Mr. Riley for the comments. He said they helped bring clarity and coherence from the student point of view.

## **NEW BUSINESS**

### **APPROVAL OF PERSONNEL ITEMS: CHANGES IN ASSIGNMENT, COMPENSATION, PLACEMENT, LEAVES, STAFF ALLOCATIONS AND CLASSIFICATION OF ACADEMIC AND CLASSIFIED PERSONNEL (17-3-1A)**

It was moved by Vice President Holober and seconded by Trustee Mandelkern to approve the actions in the report. The motion carried, all members present voting Aye.

## **STUDY SESSION**

### **DISCUSSION OF MASTER AGREEMENT BETWEEN SAN MATEO COUNTY COMMUNITY COLLEGE DISTRICT AND SAN MATEO COUNTY COMMUNITY COLLEGES FOUNDATION (17-3-1C)**

President Mohr said the Master Agreement (Agreement) is being studied because it calls for the parties to review the terms at least every five years.

Foundation Executive Director Stephani Scott introduced Foundation Board members and staff who were present: Executive Vice Chancellor Kathy Blackwood, Treasurer/Secretary; Gus Petropoulos, former Board President; Sapna Singh, Board President; Penelope Greenberg, Board member; Chris Brousseau, potential future Board member; Tykia Warden, Development Director; Prusela Phillips, Alumni Relations Manager; Kelsey Harrison, Program Services Coordinator; and Jeff Peterson, Business Manager.

Vice President Holober said the Agreement does not have an expiration or renewal date, but specifies a five-year period for review, which would occur in July 2017. He said the Agreement contains a good narrative but an old narrative regarding growth of revenues, etc. He said he would like to receive an update that would provide more recent information on assets, endowment growth, growth of contributions made for student success, etc. President Mohr said the purpose of this initial discussion is for the Board to review the stipulations in the Agreement and begin reacting to them. For example, he said the District contributes \$600,000 annually to the Foundation; this supports most Foundation staff members who are District employees but who work for the Foundation.

Trustee Mandelkern expressed appreciation to Ms. Scott, noting the Foundation has experienced good growth. He said that at the previous presentation by the Foundation at a Board study session, there was reference to a strategic plan that was being developed. He said that as part of renewing the Agreement, he would like to see the strategic plan and understand the goals and objectives for growing the Foundation in terms of financial goals and goals that support funding other than traditional scholarship funds. He said this would include funding other programs and/or increasing the amount of scholarship funds more in line with the KASP scholarships that support full-time students. Ms. Scott said the Foundation currently has a draft of a mission and vision statement. She said staff will move toward strategies to accomplish the goals and to more firmly articulate to the Strategic Planning Committee what the goals are. She said the

strategies will include metrics as well. Ms. Scott said the Foundation's strategic plan will mirror the District's strategic plan. She said she anticipates that the strategic plan will be complete by July 2017.

Trustee Goodman asked who serves on the Foundation's Strategic Planning Committee. Ms. Scott said the members are President Mohr, Cañada College President Moore, Gus Petropoulos, Sapna Singh, Penelope Greenberg, Executive Vice Chancellor Kathy Blackwood, and the Foundation staff. Trustee Goodman said it is important to the District Board of Trustees that the District and Foundation strategic plans be aligned. Ms. Scott said President Mohr's presence makes it easier to reach consensus on this point.

President Mohr said he is a strong proponent of having a strategic plan as it provides direction on what to expect with regard to the progress of an organization. He said a strategic plan usually includes goals, which in this case will hopefully be aligned with the goals of the District strategic plan, along with strategies to go with the goals. He suggested that if progress on the Foundation strategic plan is too slow, it could be helpful to have staff present a draft to the Foundation Board, incorporate their input, and bring it back to the Board.

Trustee Schwarz said she has seen forward progress in the Foundation. She noted that there are several staff members and she asked for an explanation of their roles. Ms. Scott provided a brief synopsis of the duties of each staff member.

Trustee Schwarz said the District contributes \$600,000 annually, which is used to pay Foundation staff members. She said she hopes that the Foundation will eventually stand alone financially. She asked if there is a plan in place to pay employees if the District discontinues its financial support. Ms. Scott said this would depend on timing. She said her recommendation would be to wait until after completion of a comprehensive campaign. She said the Foundation would hopefully double its assets and could start increasing the reimbursement by twenty percent over five years. She said the Foundation then would have built an endowment sufficient to support its internal operations and the funds raised can be used instead for scholarships. Ms. Greenberg asked if the Foundation staff would remain District employees or if they would be Foundation employees if the District discontinued its support. President Mohr said his comments to follow would hopefully address this question.

President Mohr said he believes there are overarching issues/criteria the Board of Trustees needs to understand if the District is to continue its contribution to the Foundation:

1. The stasis of the organization – is it really advancing and interfacing well with the affluence of the community.
2. Board engagement – defining the Board's role; what authority it has in relation to giving direction to the Executive Director and staff, as well as in shaping the direction of the Foundation; having the opportunity to engage in the discourse on the strategic plan.
3. Accountability – because the Foundation staff are employed by the District, it is important to have in place a system whereby the Executive Director is evaluated by the Chancellor; this could be done in collaboration with the Foundation Board.

President Mohr said his recommendation would be that the Agreement between the District and the Foundation be extended for one year, up to July 2018, so that the criteria could be advanced and the Board could have a more realistic sense of the Foundation's goals and how the organization is moving forward. After that time, the Board of Trustees could decide whether to keep funding the Foundation or to provide the funds for students in some other way. Trustee Mandelkern said he believes this recommendation to be a reasonable approach; however, since the Foundation is a 5013(c)(3) organization, it is important to adhere to the requirements in terms of lines of control.

Trustee Mandelkern said he evaluates the District's contribution to the Foundation by calculating whether there has been a positive return on the investment; if not, he believes it would be prudent to look at whether there is a more efficient use of the capital. Mr. Petropoulos said he does not look at the District's contribution strictly in terms of monetary return. He said a large number of today's students do not pay for tuition because they are eligible for BOG waivers and programs are available to help with book expenses. He said students need money for rent, gasoline and auto repairs. He said he is not sure that the District could use public funds to give money to students for these expenses. Trustee Mandelkern said the District's contribution comes from the general fund, which provides the most flexibility. He agreed that it might not be possible to write a check to a student for these expenses; however, there are a variety of other programs such as transportation shuttles, housing programs and offsetting scholarship dollars that free up dollars that can be used for other purposes.

Trustee Mandelkern said that since the time he and Trustee Schwarz were the Board of Trustees representatives on the Foundation Board approximately seven year ago, he believes there has been tremendous effort on the part of the Foundation Board to be more coordinated with the District Board's goals. He said there is now a greater sense of working together with a common vision and a common ideal of making students successful and helping them achieve the academic goals.

Mr. Petropoulos said there is recognition that the Foundation staff are District employees and that the Master Agreement does not address a process for evaluation of the Executive Director. He said this can and should be corrected. He said he would recommend that the Foundation Board be involved in this process as much as possible. Trustee Mandelkern agreed with allowing the Foundation Board to be involved in the evaluation process.

Ms. Singh said she believes that in addition to considering a monetary return, it is important to think about the future in terms of interfacing with the community. She said she believes the Foundation will be able to accomplish this. She said the Foundation is at a crucial point, with the development of a strategic plan and new staff and she agrees that more time is needed. Ms. Singh said she would like to see the Foundation become financially independent but believes that attempting to hurry the process could lead to loss of some value. President Mohr said the District is located in one of the wealthiest places in the world and it is important to determine what the Foundation is doing to be in and of that community. He said that extending the Agreement until July 2018 would provide time for development of a strategic plan that engages the community and includes metrics to evaluate success.

Vice President Holober acknowledged and thanked Ms. Scott, the Foundation Board members, staff and donors for the important work they do for students. He said he wants to see the Foundation continue to flourish. Vice President Holober said with the strategic plan, the District has defined measurable goals and measurement of progress toward those goals and he would put the conversation about the Agreement with the Foundation within that context. He said he supports President Mohr's suggestion regarding an extension of the Agreement. He said he would also look for feedback from Chancellor Galatolo during that time period as the person who is ultimately responsible, without violating autonomy, for the expenditure of District funds.

Mr. Brousseau said the emphasis now is on using funds to drive student success. He said the goal for the Foundation to become financially independent was worthwhile ten years ago but might not be today. He also said it would be helpful to know for what purposes Foundation and District monies can and cannot be used. Trustee Mandelkern said that with the strategic plan, the District is moving to the point where investments and programs can be evaluated with measurable and quantitative results. He said the District wants to have an evidence-based and data-driven decision making process rather than making decisions based on anecdotal evidence or emotional appearances at Board meetings. Trustee Mandelkern said that when considering where to invest \$600,000, the Board will consider what metrics will be set up to measure the results and whether the investment will advance the District's goal of educating students in San Mateo County and allowing them to achieve their academic goals. Ms. Greenberg said she believes the direction being described – data-driven and metrics-based decision making – is exactly what is needed to attract Silicon Valley investors.

Trustee Schwarz said this study session was the beginning of the discussion regarding renewing the Agreement and there was beneficial dialogue on both sides. She said the District and Foundation have worked well together over the years and she looks forward to continuing to do so.

Trustee Goodman said he believes there should be a sense of urgency. He said that while funding is important, it is also crucial to not lose sight of students and their relationships with their communities. He said Goal #2 of the District strategic plan is to expand relationships with high schools, communities and colleges with the goal of educating students in San Mateo County. He said he has attended numerous meetings recently and when he mentioned the KASP Scholarship program, he was told that no one had reached out to talk about the program. Trustee Goodman said he believes Foundation staff needs to understand the communities, identify areas where there are students who have tremendous potential but are underserved, and proactively contact superintendents and counselors to make sure they are aware of the scholarships.

President Mohr thanked everyone for attending the meeting, including Foundation staff and Board members.

#### **UPDATE ON COMMUNITY, CONTINUING AND CORPORATE EDUCATION (17-3-2C)**

Tom Bauer, Vice Chancellor of Auxiliary Services and Enterprise Operations, asked the Community, Continuing and Corporate Education (CCCE) team to introduce themselves: Jonathan Bissell, Executive Director; Julie Elmquist,

Community Education Coordinator; Derrick Banks, Project Director-Silicon Valley Intensive English Program; Yuri Goda, Program Services Coordinator-Silicon Valley Intensive English Program; and Kanjana Srisupatpongsa, Assistant Project Director.

Vice Chancellor Bauer said the District Strategic Plan has been the team's guide as they continue to identify courses and programs that will complement, and in many cases serve as an incubator and gateway to, the college academic programs. The team also takes seriously the Board's commitment to educational social justice through access, affordability, individuality, diversity and inclusion as outlined in the Board's Affirmation approved on December 16, 2016. Vice Chancellor Bauer said they believe that this affirmation supports all learners – those seeking credit as well as those who choose non-credit and not-for credit classes and programs. He highlighted some of the successful CCCE programs that affirm CCCE's commitment to the goals of the strategic plan and the Board's Affirmation:

- The Silicon Valley Intensive English Program is designed specifically to reach out to students who do not have the language proficiency to be accepted into one of the District Colleges. The program offers these students an opportunity to stay connected with the Colleges while undertaking a program on site at Cañada College and Skyline College designed to increase their proficiency to a level that affords them guaranteed acceptance into one of the three Colleges. Vice Chancellor Bauer said that enabling these students to enter the classroom as matriculated students is an excellent example of how this program complements the academic program.
- The Clinical Medical Assisting Program offers an opportunity to serve students who would otherwise not be served and to inform these students of future learning opportunities in credit bearing programs. It offers learners an opportunity for entry-level instruction that prepares them to sit for the National Health Career Association Certified Medical Assistant exam. The program is offered on evenings and weekends at College of San Mateo and is tailored to those students who, for any number of personal reasons or educationally desired outcomes, cannot take or do not wish to take the Clinical Medical Assisting credit program at Cañada College. The program is a great entry point for learners and, marketed properly, could be a pathway to the credit program. To that end, the credit program will be advertised in the Community, Continuing and Corporate Education offering brochure.
- The partnership with NOVA Workforce Development, a nonprofit, federally funded employment and training agency that provides customer-focused workforce development services and the International Advertising Bureau Education Foundation has led directly to the creation of the new Digital Advertising Program, a credit-bearing program at College of San Mateo. This program is the result of Mr. Bissell's initiative in working with NOVA and College of San Mateo faculty member Diana Bennett. This is the nation's first college-based digital advertising training program. The first certificate class graduated in December and more than 90 percent passed the certification examination.
- The new Multi Media Arts Summer Academy, created by CCCE along with faculty and administration at Cañada College and set to launch this summer, is a program designed for young learners in grades 10-12 providing a hands-on opportunity to develop digital skills for future career pathways. The program will introduce these young learners to the outstanding multimedia arts program at Cañada College and provide opportunities to increase concurrent enrollment and inspire these young learners and their parents to consider Cañada College as the place to begin their higher education.
- The Bay Area Pathways Academy, which is entering its second year this summer at College of San Mateo, offers young learners a full day, grade appropriate choice of academic programs, personal enrichment and athletic classes designed to stimulate students academically during the summer months when "brain drain" is common. The 350 young learners who participated in the program last summer have now been exposed to College of San Mateo and the chance that they and their parents will consider College of San Mateo as a college choice is most likely higher than it was before they participated in the program.

In summary, Vice Chancellor Bauer said CCCE puts students first and creates opportunities for students to make better lives for themselves and their families. CCCE's goal is to serve all learners who are interested in their courses and programs, complement the college academic programs, provide gateways and pathways for entry, and serve as an incubator for programs to determine their ultimate viability as college academic programs.

Vice President Holober thanked Vice Chancellor Bauer for his presentation and written report. He said he believes the goal of CCCE is to offer appropriate programs that provide opportunities to students and bring proceeds to the District at the same time. He said many of the programs do this well. Vice President Holober said it appears that the processes for program suggestions and review are done by CCCE staff and at some point, a College president is asked to report on his/her point of view. He said this differs from the curriculum review process used for credit courses. He said he believes

there needs to be additional early participation by people who are involved in the curriculum review process for them to weigh in on the appropriateness of programs that could be for credit or not-for-credit. He said this would require a change in Board policy. Vice Chancellor Bauer said he is in the process of making potential revisions to the Board policy and they will be brought to the Board. He said the revised policy will include providing information on programs to the Academic Senate.

Vice President Holober said the information provided indicates that CCCE instructors can be District employees or independent contractors. Noting that the Pharmacy Technician and Clinical Medical Assisting programs are offered in partnership with Condensed Curriculum International (CCI), he asked if the instructors are employees of the District or of CCI. Ms. Elmquist said the instructors are contractors and their contracts are with CCI. Vice President Holober asked if the contract between CCCE and CCI was brought to the Board for approval. Mr. Bissell said the relationship has been in place since 2011 and it would require research to determine if and when the contract was brought to the Board. Vice President Bauer said he will research this. Vice President Holober said he is concerned about contracting out to a private firm the selection and employment of people who are instructing students under the District's auspices; he said he would like more information about this practice.

Vice President Holober asked CCCE instructors, other than those who have contracts with CCI, are employees or independent contractors. Executive Vice Chancellor Blackwood said the majority of instructors are not District employees but are independent contractors who are bringing their expertise in the subject they teach. She said they are paid based on the number of students in the class. She said those instructors who are District employees are covered by the same terms and conditions as other employees.

Trustee Mandelkern said the Board has previously expressed concern about proprietary, for-profit education providers. He said he is concerned about the Pharmacy Technician and Clinical Medical Assisting programs' relationship with CCI because of CCI's poor Better Business Bureau and Yelp ratings. He asked about the vetting process for CCCE instructors and organizations with which CCCE has relationships. Mr. Bissell said he, too, is concerned about Trustee Mandelkern's report of poor ratings and will look into it further. He said CCCE's relationship with CCI has been in place since 2011 and the experience has been very positive. He said that even though the instructors are hired by CCI, CCCE examines the qualifications and résumés of instructors. In addition, evaluations are conducted at the end of every course and student reviews for the two programs have been very positive. Students in the Medical Assisting program are being prepared to sit for the National Health Career Association Certified Medical Assistant exam and eighty-eight percent of students in the CCCE program have passed the exam to date. Vice President Holober asked if those who pass the exam are then certified to work in California hospitals. Mr. Bissell said certification is not required to work as a medical assistant in California, but becoming certified can help individuals become more employable. Trustee Mandelkern agreed that certification is not required in California and said that many medical assistants receive on-the-job training. He said the issue of certification for medical assisting is controversial. He said there are several certification bodies and he recommended that research be conducted to make sure that the National Health Career Association is a legitimate organization. Ms. Elmquist said this is one of four national organizations and is rated highly. Mr. Bissell said CCCE is discussing conducting an employment survey of students who complete the program to ascertain outcomes. Trustee Mandelkern said he believes this is a good approach. He said if the results are positive, they could be used in the marketing program.

Trustee Mandelkern asked how it is determined whether CCCE programs or certifications, such as the Clinical Medical Assisting and Pharmacy Technician programs, are in competition with for-credit programs offered in the District. Vice Chancellor Bauer said that when the Clinical Medical Assisting Program was first discussed in late 2014 or early 2015, the then-president of Cañada College asked him whether it might compete with the for-credit program at the College. Vice Chancellor Bauer said he explained that the CCCE program would be offered at night and on weekends and would be marketed for students who do not fit the traditional for-credit model. He also noted that the prerequisites for the for-credit program would make it a longer process for non-traditional students who want to get through in a more timely manner. Vice Chancellor Bauer said that after this explanation, the then-president agreed that the CCCE program would not compete with the for-credit program. Vice Chancellor Bauer said that during the past weekend, he received a flurry of emails regarding concerns about this program. However, he has never been invited, as the person who is ultimately responsible for CCCE, to discuss the program and address concerns.

Trustee Mandelkern said Vice Chancellor Bauer raised a valid point about the different audience of students who are able to attend classes only at night or on weekends. He asked if the process for determining whether a CCCE program would compete with a for-credit program is to engage the College president only, or if there is involvement of faculty and deans

whose programs might be affected. Vice Chancellor Bauer said the process, which predates his tenure with CCCE, is to engage the College president and if a conflict cannot be resolved at that level, to assign the Chancellor as the ultimate arbiter. Trustee Mandelkern asked the College presidents about the internal processes they use to make a determination. President Stanback Stroud said it depends on the particular situation. She said that when it is obvious that there is no potential to compete with a College program and she does not need additional information, she will make the determination without consultation. In other cases, she will use a consultative process. For example, she initiated a request to have a Silicon Valley Intensive English Program (SVIEP) at Skyline College, recognizing that the students who would participate in this program would not be eligible to attend Skyline College and would have to go to other programs and pay for them. She asked the Dean of the relevant department to work with faculty to make sure they would approve the recommendation to initiate the SVEIP.

President Stanback Stroud said she is not in favor of having CCCE courses move in the direction of going through the Academic Senates and curriculum committees. She said she is aware, as a former State Academic Senate President, that the guidelines regarding not-for credit, non-credit and for-credit education are not governed by the same criteria and regulations. She said there is not a single community college in the state that takes community education courses through curriculum committees or Academic Senates. She said this is not in the purview of the Academic Senate and it is not appropriate for an Academic Senate to determine whether a community education course should meet the same criteria as a transfer level, articulated or credit-bearing course.

President Claire said he has a unique perspective because as a faculty member, he served on the Curriculum Committee for ten years and served as chair for three years. As a dean, he had overall responsibility for the Community Education program. He said the vision that Vice Chancellor Bauer and his team have presented is the same vision that was shared while he held those positions. President Claire said there are diverse learning needs in San Mateo County and many lifelong learners are looking for a different experience and have no interest in registering for credit courses. He said that if a CCCE course seems to have the potential to compete with a College course, he engages the appropriate dean who in turn engages faculty. He said he believes that putting too much structure on the process could stifle creativity and detract from the ability to respond quickly.

President Moore said more dialogue is needed at Cañada College, largely due to substantial turnover at the administrative level, to make sure that everyone is in agreement. She said the issue of social justice and disparity of opportunity are of great importance at the College. She said CCCE is a vehicle that addresses these issues as many students have the need to get in and out of a program quickly and get to work. President Moore said for many students, CCCE can be a pathway to come back and pursue a full-credit program.

Trustee Schwarz asked the Presidents if they have ever come to a decision not to approve a CCCE course or program because of competition with a credit-bearing course. President Stanback Stroud said Skyline College has not participated in CCCE to a large degree to date. She said she welcomes the expanded role and vision that Vice Chancellor Bauer has brought to CCCE. President Claire said the only program that he questioned was the partnership with the Interactive Advertising Bureau (IAB) to offer a Digital Advertising Certificate Program. However, he was told that the program would begin in CCCE and, if successful, would transition to a credit-bearing program. He said this is what happened and there were no costs to the District.

Trustee Goodman said he believes CCCE provides a gateway to the Colleges. He said it can give students a boost of confidence, proving to them that they can be successful on a college campus. He requested that Board members continue to be invited to observe CCCE programs.

Trustee Goodman encouraged CCCE staff to look closely at CCI because a relationship with a less than reputable organization can negatively affect how the District is perceived in the community. Mr. Bissell agreed that further examination is warranted. He said he will follow up on this, along with the survey regarding employment outcomes. Vice President Holober said he is pleased that employment surveys will be conducted. He cautioned against using standards that allow for-profit colleges to use dubious data with regard to their students' securing of jobs.

Vice President Holober said the Board has previously discussed the need for intensive programs for students who need to complete programs quickly. He said he believes there should be an attempt to fulfill this need within credit programs, e.g. six-week programs, so that students can pay less and get academic credit.

Vice President Holober said he wants to see the CCCE program grow. He said that in the past there was a practical understanding of what would be considered appropriate for Community Education. He said he became concerned when a report that was submitted approximately one year ago included programs that are similar to for-credit programs, particularly programs such as the Pharmacy Technician program for which students sit for a state license. He said he believes this type of program should rightly be a credit-bearing program, which is less expensive and is transferable. Vice President Holober said he believes the review of programs should be more intensive than it is currently in order to get clarity about where programs belong.

President Stanback Stroud said she is sensitive to cultivating relationships with the community and she believes that having community education opportunities on the campus is helpful to this endeavor. She said she believes that some of the confusion regarding competition is due to moving some credit instruction into community education during the time of severe budget challenges, resulting in some for-credit and CCCE classes having the same name.

Trustee Mandelkern said he believes there is a real need for CCCE and he is a fan of what is being accomplished. He said there are four areas which cause him no concern: (1) enrichment classes, (2) contract education, (3) “teaser” classes that are designed to be gateway classes, and (4) classes that fill a hole in the curriculum and fill an identified gap. He said the one area that causes him concern is where there is a for-credit program in existence and CCCE offers a program for the same purpose. He said the Clinical Medical Assisting program is an example of this. Trustee Mandelkern said it is true that the students in the two programs are different audiences and the need for the CCCE program may be valid. However, he said the fact that the two programs are very distinct and are not equivalent should be made very clear in the marketing to students. He said the pros and cons of each program should be presented clearly. Vice Chancellor Bauer said the upcoming CCCE catalog will show the two programs side-by-side with the distinctions presented clearly.

District Academic Senate President Shaw said the key concern of faculty is the reputation of the District. She said that while it is true that CCCE programs are not part of the purview of the Academic Senate, the curriculum and stewardship of the institution is their purpose. She said she believes that the Academic Senate should be invited to participate in the conversation. President Shaw said communication is key; she said that when there has been communication and collaboration, there has been success.

President Mohr said the depth and expanse of CCCE offerings is remarkable. He said a Board goal is to serve the community and during the recession, the District was not serving the needs of a large segment of the community. He said CCCE stepped in to help fill the gap and Vice Chancellor Bauer’s report makes it clear that the CCCE team collaborated with the Colleges.

President Mohr said that what the Colleges do is deliver curriculum and faculty are expected to be protectors of the academic institution. He suggested that faculty and CCCE leaders meet periodically with the intent to protect the integrity of the curriculum and the reputation of the institution. President Mohr said he is impressed with the fact that Vice Chancellor Bauer investigated what other districts are doing in terms of community education, as well as the guidelines established by the State Chancellor’s Office. He said he agrees with the need to examine the Board policy and believes that faculty should be involved in this.

Trustee Schwarz complimented Vice Chancellor Bauer on his well-written report. She said CCCE has expanded program offerings and hired key people. She said she believes that revising the Board policy will help and she is pleased that Vice Chancellor Bauer intends to interact with the Academic Senate. Trustee Schwarz said she believes that placing programs side-by-side in the CCCE catalog will help provide clarity. She said students who come to the campuses for CCCE classes often gain confidence and come back to the Colleges to pursue further studies.

Chancellor Galatolo said Vice Chancellor Bauer and his team prepared an outstanding report. He said the Board policy provides guidance moving forward. He said proposed policy revisions normally go through the Participatory Governance Council and then to the Board. He asked if the Board would like to see the proposed revisions first in this case. The Board agreed that they would appreciate receiving the proposed revisions and Vice Chancellor Bauer distributed the document to them. The Board said they would like to discuss the policy at a future meeting.

Doug Hirzel, President of the Cañada College Academic Senate, said there seems to be an issue regarding process. He said the College Academic Senate met with Mr. Bissell in 2015 and raised concerns about potentially competing programs but there was no natural process for how to work out disagreements. He said that if a revised policy gives guidance on a process for how to address disagreements, he believes it will be a step forward. Professor Hirzel added that

any duplication of courses could affect credit programs that might not get the enrollments they need to add night and weekend classes, for example.

Diana Bennett, Digital Media Professor at College of San Mateo, suggested that some programs might be offered in a hybrid format, keeping the rigor of the academic side while CCCE offers other components such as soft skills. Professor Bennett said she believes that the credibility and vetting of faculty who teach CCCE classes is a concern of faculty.

Professor Danielle Behonick, Curriculum Committee Chair at Cañada College and Chair of the Districtwide Curriculum Committee, said it is not clear how much overlap between programs is acceptable, i.e. at what point there is too much similarity. She also said that many credit programs are trying to support lifelong learners as well. Mr. Bissell said there is discussion about including a dedicated colleges' page in the CCCE brochure and the Colleges would be welcome to highlight any program they wish for the community to see.

President Stanback Stroud said that at times the same word is used to describe different things. She said that while courses might have the same or similar titles, credit-based curriculum is designed to meet certain standards and faculty is responsible for the integrity of this curriculum. She said the integrity of CCCE courses has a different standard for which Academic Senate is not tasked to review, maintain or approve.

Regarding enrollment management, President Stanback Stroud said that Vice Chancellor Bauer and his team made it very clear to Skyline College that if the College wishes to offer a credit course that could compete with the a CCCE course, perhaps on nights and weekends, CCCE will immediately stop offering its course.

President Mohr said it is not surprising that this dialectic would arise. He said this is natural in a professional setting and professionals embrace it and work together to solve the issues. He said that at some point, there must be a decision-maker whose judgments will be based on values and insight. President Mohr said the District is serving a large and diverse community with varying needs and they do not all fit into the same box. He said the District takes great pride in delivering as much equity as possible and that is central to this question. He said he is confident that working together as professionals, the issues in question can be resolved.

Trustee Mandelkern said he believes that all involved are professionals with good will who are approaching this with the best of intentions. He said there are things that can be done from a matter of policy that will improve the decision-making process and the flow of communications. Trustee Mandelkern said he looks forward to having the proposed policy revisions brought to a future meeting. He said he hopes the representatives of the Academic Senates will participate in the discussion because he believes their input will help get to the right solution. He said he is encouraged that Vice Chancellor Bauer and his team want that cooperation as well.

President Mohr thanked Vice Chancellor Bauer, Mr. Bissell and the CCCE staff for their excellent report.

### **STATEMENTS FROM BOARD MEMBERS**

Student Trustee Zheng congratulated Vice Chancellor Bauer on the official adoption of his son.

Trustee Mandelkern noted that this is International Women's Day and he said he appreciates the efforts and contributions of all women who work in the District. Trustee Mandelkern encouraged everyone to attend the Skyline College President's Innovation Fund Breakfast on March 16 from 7:00 to 9:00 a.m.

Vice President Holober said the State Supreme Court issued a ruling last week concerning the use of private email addresses. The ruling specifies that the public has a right to see emails about public affairs on public officials' personal devices.

Trustee Schwarz said she hopes the District sends responses to members of the community who are concerned about KCSM-FM. President Claire said there has been a great deal of confusion. He said he is working with Chief of Staff Mitchell Bailey and they are responding thoughtfully to individuals who have expressed concern. He said information has been posted on the KCSM's Facebook page and will likely be included on the station's website as well. Trustee Schwarz asked Student Trustee Zheng to convey her appreciation to the Associated Students of College of San Mateo and Skyline College for keeping SMCCCD Rise Up included in their discussions. She said she is pleased to hear that student leaders are working cooperatively with other student groups.

President Mohr said he recently met with members of the Student Senate at Cañada College. He said they were articulate and expressed concern in a very caring way about the anxiety and trepidation felt by many students because of steps being taken by the current presidential administration. President Mohr said he was taken by the level of insight and concern these students have for people they love. He said the students are aware that the District, their College and faculty care deeply about them.

President Mohr said the Board would reconvene to closed session to hold a conference with legal counsel regarding one case of potential litigation as listed on the printed agenda.

**RECESS TO CONTINUATION OF CLOSED SESSION**

The Board recessed to closed session at 9:15 p.m.

**RECONVENE TO OPEN SESSION**

The Board reconvened to open session at 10:05 p.m.

**ANNOUNCEMENT OF REPORTABLE ACTION TAKEN IN CLOSED SESSION**

None

**ADJOURNMENT**

The meeting was adjourned by consensus at 10:07 p.m.

Submitted by

Ron Galatolo, Secretary

Approved and entered into the proceedings of the March 22, 2017 meeting.

Richard Holober  
Vice President-Clerk