

**Minutes of the Regular Meeting of the Board of Trustees
San Mateo County Community College District
September 21, 2011, San Mateo, CA**

The meeting was called to order at 6:04 p.m. by Vice President Mandelkern

Board Members Present: President Richard Holober (arrived at 6:25 p.m.), Vice President-Clerk Dave Mandelkern, Trustees Helen Hausman, Patricia Miljanich (arrived at 7:00 p.m.) and Karen Schwarz, Student Trustee Barry Jointer

Others Present: Chancellor Ron Galatolo, Executive Vice Chancellor Kathy Blackwood, Skyline College President Regina Stanback Stroud, College of San Mateo President Michael Claire, Cañada College President Jim Keller and District Academic Senate President Diana Bennett

Pledge of Allegiance

DISCUSSION OF THE ORDER OF THE AGENDA

None

Executive Assistant to the Board Ginny Brooks said an error was found on Board Report No. 11-7-108B (Approval of Revised Non-Subsidized Tuition Fees for Child Development Centers at College of San Mateo and Skyline College) which was approved by the Board on July 27, 2011. The phrase above the chart on page 1 should read, “The following shows the proposed fees based on *daily billing*” rather than *hourly billing*.” The correction will be made to the official record.

MINUTES

It was moved by Trustee Hausman and seconded by Student Trustee Jointer to approve the minutes of the study session of September 7, 2011. The motion carried, all members voting “Aye.”

STATEMENTS FROM EXECUTIVES AND STUDENT REPRESENTATIVES

President Claire encouraged the Board to read the Student Success Story in his written report about a former College of San Mateo student who will begin attending Boalt Law School in fall 2011. President Claire distributed a handout titled “Student Campus Climate & Satisfaction Survey – 2010-2011 Comparative Data.” He emphasized the planning and research capacity that has been built over the past two years and the extent to which the College relies on data to make decisions. Survey results show that there is very strong overall student satisfaction on the campus, with 90-95% of respondents expressing satisfaction on most indicators.

President Stanback Stroud said Skyline College enjoyed “Asian Culture Week,” with talented dancers of all ages providing entertainment. President Stanback Stroud said that, beginning with her opening day address and continuing weekly in *Skyline Shines*, she has called for conversations throughout the campus about the College’s level of student success, number of degrees and certificates awarded, transfer rates, and number of international students. Conversations are taking place among faculty and in governance committees about what the benchmarks should be and about ways to improve in these areas.

President Keller said that the three Colleges continue to look for ways to improve revenue, including applications for grant funds. Cañada College was recently notified that it has been awarded a five-year, \$5.9 million grant from the Department of Education for the Transfer Engineering Program, aimed at maximizing the likelihood of success among underrepresented and educationally disadvantaged students. Cañada will partner with San Francisco State University and Los Angeles Pierce College on this project. President Keller said the Artistry in Fashion event will be held on Saturday, September 24 and the Art & Olive Festival will be held on Sunday, October 2.

President Bennett said the Academic Senate will be talking with Rob Johnstone, Dean of Planning, Research and Institutional Effectiveness at Skyline College, to clarify some data from the plus/minus grading pilot; they will then meet with the Associated Students before making a recommendation to the Board of Trustees. President Bennett said the Academic Senate has a process to identify a selection committee for the Performance Evaluation Review Committee and to write the guidelines and responsibilities for members of that committee. Within the next couple of

weeks, faculty will be notified about submissions of applications to serve on the committee. The committee will be working on performance evaluation review in the spring.

BOARD SERIES PRESENTATION – INNOVATIONS IN TEACHING, LEARNING AND SUPPORT SERVICES: ELECTRICAL PATHWAYS; ELECTRONICS EDUCATION IN THE 21st CENTURY – COLLEGE OF SAN MATEO (11-9-2C)

Vice Chancellor Jing Luan introduced Kathy Ross, Dean of Business/Technology at College of San Mateo. Dean Ross introduced Professor Roy Brixen as a leader and visionary who has been with the Department for 30 years. Accompanying Professor Brixen were instructor Steven Gonzales and student Andrew Guinn.

Professor Brixen said that prior to 2000, students coming out of community colleges as technicians were employed primarily by the communication and semiconductor industries. There was a strong focus on quality over quantity, with little or no focus on industrial interface.

Professor Brixen said there was recognition that changes in the curriculum were needed for the following reasons:

- the communication industry evolved into machine manufactured processing, requiring fewer technicians
- the semiconductor industry has dried up and moved offshore
- the failing infrastructure of the power grid and transmission capability of utilities
- utilities in the region will be experiencing a “Gray Tsunami” as baby boomers retire and there is a need to fill the void

In response, the focus of the Electrical Pathways Program is to provide (1) basic and advanced electronic fundamentals; (2) understanding of power factor and power transmission; (3) understanding of industrial interface control and measurement; and (4) hands on experience in labs to reinforce theory. The Electrical Pathways Program is focused primarily on retraining a displaced workforce, such as the former employees of the Nummi Auto Plant. The Program has partnerships with major Northern California utilities (Pacific Gas & Electric, East Bay Municipal Utility District, San Francisco Public Utilities Commission). The Program offers a broad core curriculum focused on jobs for the future and will modify and adjust the curriculum as the industry changes. A Workforce Development grant of approximately \$450,000 has facilitated the rebuilding of a lab and classroom.

There are currently 245 students in the Program. The mean age is 38.1 years. Students are mostly male and 85% are part-time students. Students are primarily Asian or White. The Program is also reaching students who normally do not attend college or do not fit into a specific program. There is also outreach to attract younger students.

Program curriculum is focused on training workers for industries in need of technical support today and in the near future; these include food processing, pharmaceutical, transportation, utilities, biotechnology and alternative energy.

In conclusion, the Electrical Pathways Program has been running for three semesters and 34 students have graduated. Graduates are working at Loral, AT&T, PG&E, Tesla and other technology companies. The Program allows a flexible curriculum in order to stay on the cutting edge. It also utilizes the strengths of both full-time and adjunct faculty.

Trustee Schwarz said this program could present a wonderful new career path for high school students. Professor Brixen said they are attempting to conduct outreach to high schools. Half Moon Bay High School has reinstated industrial arts and one of the programs included is electronics; Professor Brixen plans to make an appointment to speak to the principal next week. He is also looking at outreach to Regional Occupation Programs (ROPs). He said it has been found that a two-year degree is more important than a certificate to younger students.

Vice President Mandelkern said he has heard about bias against older workers, particularly from displaced workers in Silicon Valley. He asked if there is resistance to hire older workers who have completed this Program. Professor Brixen said age discrimination does occur within the industry but he has not seen evidence of it so far with regard to this Program. He said that because there will be such a great need very quickly, companies will hire qualified workers regardless of age.

Vice President Mandelkern asked if the Program conducts outreach to veterans, many of whom have technical and engineering skills. Professor Brixen said many veterans are enrolling in the Program. He said the Program's partners have said they will help with outreach to veterans. Mr. Gonzales added that PG&E and East Bay Municipal Utility

District have links on their websites to the Program and there is a message that counselors are available to students who need assistance with Veterans Affairs.

STATEMENTS FROM THE PUBLIC ON NON-AGENDA ITEMS

Daniel Girard, President of the California Association of the Deaf, said he read an article regarding the decision to eliminate the American Sign Language (ASL) program at College of San Mateo and is concerned that the elimination could be permanent. As clarification, President Claire said the College currently offers two ASL classes per semester and the decision was made to cease the offerings after the next academic year, effective August 2012. He said the fact that Skyline College has a full ASL program was part of the decision making process. He said that because of budget cuts, the District is no longer able to offer all languages at a single College but is attempting to offer comprehensive language programs on at least one of the campuses. The three Colleges in the District have a process by which they look each year at several factors, including where else courses are offered, demand for the classes, and career opportunities. At this time, there is no plan to have ASL classes at College of San Mateo after the next academic year. President Claire said another way to offer ASL classes could be through the Community Education program and they are working to put a course into place for the fall semester, depending on demand. Community Education classes are non-credit.

Mr. Girard introduced Michelle Hughes, Vice President of the California Association of the Deaf. He said they understand the challenges caused by the financial situation, but said the Association is willing to work with the District to figure out ways to help continue ASL programs where possible. He said there are 14,000 deaf people in the Bay Area. ASL is important not only for them, but for interpreters who enable deaf people to secure critical jobs. Without quality interpreters, it is more difficult for deaf people to attend colleges and universities and to be employable as deaf adults. Regarding credit vs. non-credit courses, Mr. Girard said it is important to note that ASL courses taken at community colleges are transferrable to UCs and CSUs to meet Level C requirements. He said he hopes the Board will consider these points in future discussions. As a point of clarification, President Claire said that College of San Mateo's current ASL classes do not meet the Intersegmental General Education Transfer Curriculum (IGETC) Area C requirements but can be used to meet the Language other than English requirement. He said research has shown that the vast majority of College of San Mateo students complete the IGETC requirements while in high school. He said that no College of San Mateo students who have been certified through IGETC have used an ASL course and very few use any foreign language to meet requirements. President Claire said it might be possible to design ASL courses to meet IGETC requirements and this possibility would be considered if it becomes possible to bring back classes.

Mr. Girard thanked the Board for their time.

NEW BUSINESS

APPROVAL OF PERSONNEL ACTIONS: CHANGES IN ASSIGNMENT, COMPENSATION, PLACEMENT, LEAVES, STAFF ALLOCATIONS AND CLASSIFICATION OF ACADEMIC AND CLASSIFIED PERSONNEL (11-9-2A)

It was moved by Trustee Hausman and seconded by Trustee Schwarz to approve the actions in Board Report No. 11-9-2A. The motion carried, all members voting "Aye."

RATIFICATION OF 2010-2013 CONTRACT BETWEEN THE DISTRICT AND THE AMERICAN FEDERATION OF STATE, COUNTY, AND MUNICIPAL EMPLOYEES (AFSCME), LOCAL 829 (11-9-3A)

It was moved by Trustee Schwarz and seconded by Trustee Hausman to ratify the contract as detailed in the report. The motion carried, all members voting "Aye."

APPROVAL OF REVISION TO MINIMUM QUALIFICATION AND FACULTY SERVICE AREA POLICY AND PROCEDURES (11-9-4A)

It was moved by Trustee Schwarz and seconded by Trustee Hausman to approve the revision as detailed in the report. President Bennett said the current Equivalence Review Process was approved by the Board in 2005 and addresses the equivalency review process for current faculty and optional procedures for adjunct faculty. She said the revised policy and procedures covers applicants for all District faculty positions as well as current faculty. The revised document will standardize the policy and procedures across the District for granting minimum qualifications and faculty service area. It will clarify procedures for those who serve on faculty qualification committees and for applicants. President Bennett said the proposed revised policy and procedures was thoroughly vetted with faculty, AFT, the vice presidents and Human Resources. She described two changes in the proposed revision having to do with the composition of the

Faculty Qualifications Committee; they occur on page 5 in the section titled “Procedure: Applicants for Part-Time Faculty Positions.” The Board will be asked to approve the revised version of the document.

Vice President Mandelkern asked if the Faculty Senate has endorsed the proposed document; President Bennett said it has. After this discussion, the motion to approve the revision, including the changes presented at this meeting, passed, all members voting “Aye.”

APPROVAL OF CONSENT AGENDA

President Holober said the Consent Agenda consists of Board Report 11-9-1CA, Declaration of Surplus Property. It was moved by Trustee Hausman and seconded by Vice President Mandelkern to approve the consent agenda. The motion carried, all members voting “Aye.”

Other Recommendations

PUBLIC HEARING OF THE 2011-12 FINAL BUDGET (11-9-101B)

It was moved by Vice President Mandelkern and seconded by Trustee Hausman to conduct the public hearing. President Holober declared the public hearing open. Executive Vice Chancellor Blackwood thanked District Budget Officer Rachelle Minong and the financial staff at the Colleges and District, as well as others who wrote narratives and took photographs. She said the Budget Report was printed entirely by student assistants in the new Campus Copy and Post located in the College Center at College of San Mateo.

Executive Vice Chancellor Blackwood said the Governor signed ABX1 32 today; this will change the effective date of the student fee increase from January to June 2012. The District also received information today from the State Chancellor’s Office regarding how they will address cuts to community colleges should the Tier 1 or Tier 2 triggers go into effect. Tier 1 activation would result in a \$30 million cut to community colleges; the District’s share would be \$586,000. This would be treated as a deficit factor. Tier 2 activation would result in a \$102 million cut to community colleges; the District’s share would be almost \$2 million. This tier would also translate to a workload reduction of 309 FTES. These scenarios were included in the District’s budget projections.

Executive Vice Chancellor Blackwood said the Full Absorption Budget on page 112 is a new item which shows the site allocations to the Colleges, District Office, Facilities and Central Services. The diagram on page 116 shows all deferrals of revenue by the State. Regarding the Full Absorption Budget, President Holober asked if allocations for Facilities, District Office and Central Services get spread among the three Colleges. Executive Vice Chancellor Blackwood said they are tiered, i.e. she split Central Services among Facilities, District Office and the Colleges; she then took the new number for Facilities and split it among the District Office and the Colleges; she then took the new number for the District Office and split it among the Colleges.

President Holober said the San Mateo Athletic Club seems to be operating in the black and he asked if any surplus income is being moved out of the segregated fund. Executive Vice Chancellor Blackwood said the Athletic Club was first funded with money from Redevelopment, so the first call on any surplus will be to pay that money back. The timeline called for the money to be paid back in five years but, being ahead of schedule, it is now projected that it will be paid back entirely by the end of 2011-12.

President Holober said the Child Care Fund seems to be improving but is still running a deficit. He asked what might be expected in the coming year. Chancellor Galatolo said a Study Session is being planned, possibly in October, at which ideas to keep the Child Care Centers operating will be presented.

Vice President Mandelkern asked if the salary and compensation of the Vice Chancellor of Auxiliary Services is contained in Fund 5 or in the general fund. Executive Vice Chancellor Blackwood said it is in Fund 5.

Vice President Mandelkern noted that the overall budget picture is not promising. He asked if thought has been given to whether there is a point at which it will no longer be feasible to support three campuses with three sets of administration and overhead and still provide a minimum level of quality educational services to the community. Executive Vice Chancellor Blackwood said the District is not at that point yet. She said that if there are cuts next year, it is hoped that attaining basic aid status will help protect the District.

A member of the public asked if the budget can be viewed online. Executive Vice Chancellor Blackwood said it will be put online after it is adopted by the Board.

Hearing no further questions or comments, President Holober declared the public hearing closed.

ADOPTION OF THE 2011-12 FINAL BUDGET (11-9-102B)

It was moved by Student Trustee Jointer and seconded by Trustee Schwarz to approve adoption of the budget as presented. The motion carried, all members voting “Aye.”

PUBLIC HEARING ON ADOPTION OF A RESOLUTION TO GRANT A GAS LINE EASEMENT TO PACIFIC GAS & ELECTRIC COMPANY (11-9-103B)

It was moved by Trustee Hausman and seconded by Trustee Schwarz to conduct the public hearing. President Holober declared the public hearing open and asked for questions and comments.

Vice President Mandelkern asked if the gas line easement would serve College of San Mateo only or other portions of the community as well. Vice Chancellor José Nuñez said it would serve only College of San Mateo and would upgrade the existing line to increase pressure. Vice President Mandelkern said that, given the incident in San Bruno and its effect on the Skyline College community, he is concerned with PG&E’s oversight, testing and maintenance of pipelines or lack thereof and would like to make sure these are provided. He asked if automatic safety valves are being installed. Vice Chancellor Nuñez said he will ascertain the answer to this and report back to the Board. Other Board members added that safety is their primary concern.

Hearing no further questions or comments, President Holober declared the public hearing closed.

ADOPTION OF RESOLUTION NO. 11-12 TO GRANT A GAS LINE EASEMENT TO PACIFIC GAS & ELECTRIC COMPANY (11-9-104B)

It was moved by Vice President Mandelkern and seconded by Trustee Hausman to adopt Resolution No. 11-12. The motion carried, all members voting “Aye.”

AUTHORITY TO EXECUTE AN AGREEMENT WITH COMPUTERLAND FOR MICROSOFT CAMPUS LICENSE AGREEMENT FOR 2011-2014 (11-9-105B)

It was moved by Student Trustee Jointer and seconded by Trustee Schwarz to approve authorization to execute the agreement as detailed in the report. The motion carried, all members voting “Aye.”

APPROVAL OF CONSTRUCTION CONSULTANTS (11-9-106B)

It was moved by Trustee Hausman and seconded by Trustee Miljanich to approve the construction consultants as detailed in the report. The motion carried, all members voting “Aye.”

INFORMATION REPORTS

STUDENT PARTICIPATION IN COLLEGE DECISION MAKING (11-9-3C)

Susan Estes, Vice President, Instruction at College of San Mateo, distributed a packet which contained copies of College of San Mateo Institutional Planning Committee Structure and Membership; Student Senate Committee Appointments; District Rules and Regulations Sections 2.05, 2.08 and 2.18; 2010-12 Summary of Agenda Items for College Council, Institutional Planning Committee, CSM Academic Senate Governing Council and Associated Students; and “Implementing Shared Governance” adopted in December 1993. These documents are included in the official record of this meeting.

Jennifer Hughes, Vice President, Student Services at College of San Mateo, said the purpose of the presentation is to provide information about student participation in shared governance, including the recent program discontinuance process at College of San Mateo. The presentation will cover four main topics: review of applicable Board policies regarding student participation in shared governance; review of College of San Mateo’s integrated planning model; discussion of the history of shared governance at College of San Mateo; discussion of student involvement in the recent program discontinuance process.

Board Policies

Vice President Hughes said much of the language in Board policy 2.18, Student Participation District and College Governance, is taken directly from the Education Code. The policy states: “The Associated Student Organizations at each College will have the sole right to make appointments for their student representatives to College and District committees, task forces, or other governance groups through a process which they will develop.”

The process at College of San Mateo can be found in the Associated Students Constitution and Bylaws. Section 4.2 of the Constitution reads: “The President shall be the official representative of the students at all functions and shall serve as liaison to the College, District, and community. The President shall have the power, by and with consent of the Senate, to create committees; to nominate, appoint, and remove all ASCSM representatives to Senate and College committees, and to serve as an ex-officio member of all committees.” Section 2.2 of the Bylaws describes the duties of the Associated Students President. Among them is the appointment of representatives to committees. To facilitate this process, each year the Coordinator of Student Activities (who serves as Student Advisor) and the President of the Associated Students solicit interest from members of the Student Senate to serve on College and District committees. At a subsequent meeting of the Senate, the President, with the Senate’s consent, makes the appointments for representatives to serve on committees for the coming academic year. Vice President Hughes noted that the College administration has no involvement in the appointment of students to committees.

Vice President Hughes said policy 2.18 also states: “Except in unforeseeable emergency situations, the governing board shall not take action on a matter having a significant effect on students until it has provided students with an opportunity to participate in the formation of the policy or procedure or the joint development of recommendations regarding the action.” The policy specifies that one of the matters having a significant effect on students is “courses or programs which should be initiated or discontinued.” At the July 27, 2011 Board of Trustees meeting, the Student Trustee shared concerns that the shared governance process had not been followed with respect to program discontinuance and that Board policy had been ignored. As mentioned earlier, students are appointed to all governance committees, including the Academic Senate Governing Council, through an established process. Because the Academic Senate has primary responsibility for making recommendations in the areas of curriculum and academic matters, it was the Academic Senate Governing Council that discussed the process for program discontinuance. Had there been any objection to the process that was being discussed, it would have been expected that the student representative to that Council would have brought the concerns forward.

Vice President Hughes said College of San Mateo holds retreats and one-day events from time to time. Although these are not shared governance committees and, therefore, there is no formal obligation to include students, the College recognizes the importance of having student participation and input. At the July 27 Board meeting, a question was raised about the selection of a student to attend the November Five in Five Leadership Retreat and the Spring Retreat. Specifically, a question was raised about whether the College administration had extended an invitation to a specific student to attend. Vice President Hughes said she requested that the Student Advisor help find a student to participate in the two events and the Associated Students Vice President attended both.

Vice President Hughes said that policy 2.08, District Shared Governance Process, states that the Board “is committed to a shared governance system which ensures faculty, staff and students the right to participate effectively in district and college governance and the opportunity to express their consideration.” To this end, the Board established the District Shared Governance Council (DSGC). There are 20 members on the Council, including five students – the three Associated Students Presidents or designees from each College, the Student Trustee, and one at-large member. This is the only committee that specifically designates the Student Trustee as a member. The policy also states that the Board “recognizes the Academic Senate as the official body representing faculty in shared governance (Title 5, 53200) and the right of Academic Senates to assume primary responsibility for making recommendations in the areas of curriculum and academic standards. In academic and professional matters, the Board will rely primarily on faculty expertise through the established Academic Senate processes. The Academic Senate is expected to provide an opportunity for students and staff to participate effectively in the formulation and development of policies and procedures that have or will have a significant effect upon them.” Further, the policy states that the Board “recognizes the Associated Students organizations as the official bodies representing students and considers students to be full participants in shared governance on all items pertaining to their interests.”

Vice President Hughes said that policy 2.05 underscores the Academic Senate’s primary responsibility for academic and professional matters. It states that the “College Academic Senates shall represent the faculty and make recommendations to their College administration and to the Board concerning academic and professional matters of

importance at a single College in the District.” It goes on to define the academic and professional matters which are under the purview of the Academic Senate and to state that the “Academic Senate will provide an opportunity for students and staff to participate effectively in the formulation and development of policies and procedures that have or will have a significant effect upon them.” Vice President Hughes said the Associated Students appointed a representative to the Academic Senate Governing Council and the minutes from spring 2011 meetings reflect student attendance at meetings at which program discontinuance was discussed.

Vice President Hughes said there were no violations of policies during the program discontinuance process.

Integrated Planning Model

Vice President Hughes said College of San Mateo has a well-defined, transparent and integrated planning model that has been well-received by the College. She referred to diagrams which identify all of the shared governance committees at the College and list the names of student representatives on each committee. Each committee has representation from all constituent groups – Management Council, Academic Senate, classified staff and Associated Students. The Academic Senate is the recommending body to the College President and, ultimately, to the Chancellor and Board on all curricular matters. By virtue of student representation on the Academic Senate Governing Council, there is opportunity for students to provide input and to participate in curricular matters, including the process for program discontinuance.

Vice President Hughes said the Office of Planning, Research, and Institutional Effectiveness has a website which includes agendas and minutes from all planning committee meetings. This central repository makes it easy for the College community to stay abreast of activities occurring on the campus and the work being done by the various shared governance committees. She pointed to a handout providing a summary of topics that have been discussed at meetings of the College Council, Institutional Planning Committee, Academic Senate Governing Council, and Associated Students.

Concluding this section of the report, Vice President Hughes said College of San Mateo has a robust and well-integrated planning system that is functioning very effectively and which is assessed regularly as required by the ACCJC. The planning process provides for genuine participation of all constituent groups, including students.

History of Shared Governance at College of San Mateo

Vice President Estes referred to the excerpt from a document titled *Implementing Shared Governance* which was ratified and adopted in December 1993 by the Academic Senate, Associated Students, Management Council, and the (then) Classified Senate. Vice President Estes was the Academic Senate President at that time and worked closely with the College President, Associated Students and classified staff to create the shared governance process. The resulting document provides the definition, philosophy and structure of shared governance at the College, as well as the charter for College Council which is the shared governance oversight committee. Shared governance takes place through the committee structure. Each committee has representatives from the four constituencies. It is the responsibility of committee members to take information back to their constituencies and, in turn, bring back information from their constituencies to the committee.

Vice President Estes said there are legally mandated roles that certain constituencies or positions must follow. She quoted the following from *Implementing Shared Governance*: “. . . the college president is responsible for the budget and the fiscal integrity of the institution, and the Academic Senate assumes primary responsibility for making recommendations in the areas of curriculum and academic matters.” It goes on to state that each constituency must include genuine participation in the decision-making process from other affected constituencies.

Vice President Estes said there were multiple opportunities for student and staff participation in the process that led to the recommendation for discontinuance of the programs recently brought to the Board. The criteria used in developing the recommendations grew out of that participation. The institutional priorities of the College were developed by the Institutional Planning Committee based on the Board’s adopted “Core Values” statement, and were approved by College Council. The Associated Students appointed members to both of these bodies. As early as spring 2010, the College formed an ad hoc committee to identify the talking points to serve as a guide in making decisions about what the College would look like in the future, including which programs should be expanded, reduced or discontinued. A student served on this ad hoc committee. As mentioned earlier, a student participated in the Five in Five Leadership Retreat and the spring 2011 Leadership Retreat. The student representative on the Academic Senate Governing Council attended meetings throughout the spring, at which the process for program discontinuance was discussed.

In conclusion, Vice President Hughes said that:

1. College of San Mateo has complied with Board policies, specifically in relation to student involvement in the formation of policies or procedures on matters which affect them.
2. College of San Mateo has established a well-defined, integrated planning process which insures student participation on all governance committees.
3. College of San Mateo has successfully implemented shared governance at the College which, since 1993, has provided the definition, philosophy and structure of shared governance.
4. College of San Mateo has provided a specific avenue for student participation in those areas of curriculum and academic matters for which the Academic Senate has primacy. Specifically, students were involved in developing the process used for program discontinuance.

In response to a question from Trustee Hausman, it was confirmed that Cañada and Skyline Colleges also have processes to insure student involvement in shared governance.

Trustee Miljanich said students face different challenges in attending meetings and asked if there is a process to appoint a third student to a committee should the member or backup not be available. Vice President Hughes said the College makes every effort to schedule meetings at times that are more convenient for students. Currently, there is no process to appoint a third student to committee but this possibility is being discussed. Vice President Hughes noted that the Associated Students President is an ex-officio member of all committees. President Claire added that College Council does not take action on items unless there is representation from each constituency at the meeting. President Miljanich said the students' role in providing two-way communication with the committees is very important.

Student Trustee Jointer thanked President Claire, Chancellor Galatolo and Vice Presidents Hughes and Estes for working on this issue. He said that at both the Spring Leadership retreat, at which potential budget cuts were discussed, and the Five in Five retreat, the student attendee was not selected by the Student Senate or the Associated Students President but was approached by the Student Activities Coordinator. Student Trustee Jointer said this was not in keeping with the letter or spirit of Board policy. President Claire said he understands Student Trustee Jointer's concerns. However, he said it is important to decouple the process regarding program discontinuance from the leadership retreats because no decisions were made about any programs at the retreats. He said that policy 2.18.6(e), providing students with an opportunity to participate in the formation of the policy or procedure or the joint development of recommendations regarding the action regarding courses or programs which should be initiated or discontinued, was not violated. He said there was official student representation to the Academic Senate Governing Council, where the deliberations regarding the procedure for program discontinuance took place.

Student Trustee Jointer said his concern is about how the student who attended the retreats was selected. He believes the execution of the policy needs to be improved. He said he wants to focus primarily on the future and his concern for the future is the issue of communication. Some students have reported that they did not receive communication from committee chairs. Student Trustee Jointer also said that in the future, it would be helpful if students always selected their own representative in order to get the true student voice.

Trustee Miljanich said her understanding is that no regulation exists regarding non-shared governance meetings, although there is wisdom in involving students. She said she has difficulty understanding why the Associated Students Vice President was not an appropriate student to attend events. She said that retreats are not official shared governance meetings and the shared governance process was not violated. Student Trustee Jointer said it appears that there was some discussion at the retreats regarding cuts to programs. He said it would be inappropriate to bypass the president of any other constituency and go to the vice president instead. Trustee Miljanich said students also have a responsibility to communicate with each other and it appears there was a breakdown in communication if no one knew that the Vice President had attended the retreats and there were no reports back to the group. Student Trustee Jointer agreed with this, but said that the Associated Students has a process which in this case was circumvented. Trustee Miljanich stated for the record that she does not believe the shared governance process was violated.

Trustee Schwarz said her understanding is that the Associated Students President is an ex-officio member of all shared governance committees and should either attend the meetings or select a representative. She also noted the apparent breakdown in communication in that a student did not report back to the group after attending events. Vice President Estes said there is an appointment process and the Associated Students President is generally not required to attend meetings. Whoever is appointed to serve has the responsibility to report back to his/her constituency and also to bring back information to the committee. Student Trustee Jointer asked who is responsible for connecting the students with

the various committees. Vice President Hughes said that after a list of committee appointments is completed, email addresses of all committee members are provided to committee chairs, who are responsible for notifying members of meetings. Student Trustee Jointer asked if the Associated Students President is copied on those emails. Vice President Hughes said the President is not copied. She said that at every Associated Students meeting, there is a section of the agenda for committee reports. President Claire added that the College website contains committee agendas and minutes so that anyone can be informed. He also emphasized that retreats are outside of the shared governance process and no decisions regarding program discontinuance or budget are made outside of the formal shared governance process.

Vice President Mandelkern asked what would occur if (1) a new committee was formed or if there was a new event which needed student representation, or (2) the student representative to a shared governance committee does not attend meetings. Vice President Hughes said that if she is informed by a committee chair that the student representative is not attending meetings, she would approach the Student Advisor and ask him to follow up and have the Associated Students President, with the approval of the Student Senate, appoint another member if necessary. In addition, the Advisor is now being copied on all notices so that he can remind the student representatives of the meetings.

Regarding the retreats at which the Associated Students Vice President was the attendee, Vice President Mandelkern asked if there was an attempt to contact the President. Vice President Hughes said this event was not a shared governance committee meeting and there was no obligation to seek representation through the established process. However, it is recognized that this process is the best mechanism to seek representation. In this case, there were some challenges at the College with respect to some of the officers and Vice President Hughes does not know if the President was approached or was unavailable. The Vice President had been active on a number of committees and he was the person that the Advisor spoke with about participating. Vice President Mandelkern said there may be legitimate complaints about how some processes worked or didn't work, but some responsibility must be taken by students to communicate among themselves and to share information. He said it would be paternalistic to expect the administration to make sure notices are received for each meeting and that a representative attends. He said he does not believe students would like to be treated in this manner.

Vice President Mandelkern noted that a student representative was present at the Academic Senate Governing Council meetings; he asked if there was also representation on the subcommittees that made the recommendations regarding which programs would be discontinued. President Claire said the subcommittees did not have student representation. President Bennett said a student representative was present at the Governing Council meetings and did bring back comments from the Associated Students.

President Holober asked if it is correct that program discontinuance is under the purview of the Academic Senate and is not covered by shared governance. Vice President Estes said the College President relies primarily on the Academic Senate for recommendations, while shared governance indicates that all constituencies should provide as much input as possible. President Holober asked if this means the Academic Senate acts on its own and is not required to follow the shared governance process. President Stanback Stroud said that in AB 1725, the Board of Governors developed regulations which identified shared governance responsibilities for faculty, staff and students. Through the Delineations of Functions Agreement, the SMCCCD Board of Trustees agreed to rely primarily on the Academic Senate for academic and professional matters. However, the Academic Senate is not excused from making sure that the other parts of the regulations are followed. Students have a right to participate and provide input on those matters that significantly affect them, including program discontinuance. Chancellor Galatolo said this does not necessarily mean that students must be allowed to participate in every activity or subcommittee throughout the process. There are times when faculty will meet without either administration or students being included. Students must be included to the extent that their participation is outlined in the policies. Chancellor Galatolo said there has been clear compliance with the policies.

Regarding the issue of communication, President Claire said that all-College emails are sent out and there are no secrets at the College. Results of discussions at the Five in Five Retreat and the Spring Leadership Retreat were broadly communicated to the College. President Claire also spoke to students several times during the semester, including a special session regarding the horticulture program and the Edison Lot. President Claire added that he, Vice President Hughes and Student Trustee Jointer had a very productive meeting and each learned something from the discussion.

Trustee Schwarz said she believes that the processes that are in place at College of San Mateo are good. She said communication is very important and will be even broader with additional people being copied on meeting notices.

Trustee Miljanich said it is critical, especially during challenging times, to have communication within organizations and she assumes the Student Activities Coordinator will be involved. She said it is unrealistic to expect the Associated Students President to receive emails about every committee meeting and event on campus. She said has a new-found respect for those who serve on committees and take the time to exchange information.

Trustee Hausman said that while some things may need to be corrected, she believes an excellent policy is in place at the College and students need to take some responsibility as well. She said it is to the District's credit that the issue was discussed in detail at a public meeting.

UPDATE ON 2013 ACCREDITATION (11-9-4C)

Vice Chancellor Luan said the District Accreditation Coordinating Council, with members from the three Colleges and the District, is beginning to work on accreditation self-evaluation activities. The accreditation cycle is set by the Accrediting Commission for Community and Junior Colleges (ACCJC). In an ongoing process, the three Colleges began working on their individual self-evaluation reports almost a year ago. Based on recommendations from a meeting of the District Accreditation Coordinating Council held in May, this report includes timelines developed by the Colleges and a brief description of the committee structures at each College. The Council will coordinate the overall efforts in areas of information sharing and information collection. The Council will meet tomorrow to discuss next steps, including the work plans for the Colleges. Vice Chancellor Luan said he will be reporting to the Board frequently, including a Study Session.

Trustee Miljanich asked if there has been any change in leadership in terms of the accrediting body. Vice Chancellor Luan said that Barbara Beno is still the president. The commissioners change due to term limits.

STATEMENTS FROM BOARD MEMBERS

Student Trustee Jointer said he will attend an upcoming meeting of the California Community College Association of Student Trustees. He said he is looking forward to the College of San Mateo Athletic Hall of Fame event.

Trustee Hausman attended the Foundation meeting at which Len Herzstein was nominated and elected to the Board of Directors. Also at that meeting, College of San Mateo student Luis Alvarez, who was selected as an intern for the San Mateo Arctic Research Telescope Project in the High Arctic, spoke about how he is benefitting from financial support from the Foundation. The Chancellor's Circle event will take place on November 3. Trustee Hausman attended a meeting of the National Red Cross committee which deals with Holocaust and war victims. The committee attempts to reunite family members, some of whom have not seen each other in 50 or more years. They are working with Somalis, Congolese, Ethiopians, Afghans, Eritreans, Hungarians, Sudanese, Bosnians, Bhutanese and others. The committee has material dealing with tolerance which is suitable for community college classes.

Vice President Mandelkern attended the San Mateo County School Boards Association meeting. The guest speaker was Vernon Billy, the new Executive Director of the California School Boards Association (CSBA). Mr. Billy outlined the hopes, goals and challenges for CSBA for the future. He stressed the need for the organization to become a more vocal advocate and to become more politically active in representing the needs of California's public schools from kindergarten through community college. He said this is especially important in light of ongoing and increasing budget threats. Vice President Mandelkern said Laura Rich of Menlo Park is the local member of the CSBA Board of Directors. Vice President Mandelkern also attended the first meeting of the year of the Skyline College President's Council. He said the Council has an excellent plan in place for a successful year. He said he is proud to have been a part of the Council for 14-15 years and he would encourage the other Colleges to consider similar organizations. Vice President Mandelkern attended the Filoli Gardens annual party, at which a retired faculty member of Skyline College commented that the Board of Trustees is doing an excellent job.

COMMUNICATIONS

President Holober said the Board received an email from a community member regarding KCSM-TV.

RECESS TO CLOSED SESSION

President Holober said that during Closed Session, the Board will (1) consider the personnel items listed as 1A, 1B and 1C on the printed agenda and (2) hold a conference with agency labor negotiator Harry Joel; the employee organizations are AFT, AFSCME and CSEA.

The Board recessed to Closed Session at 8:55 p.m.
The Board reconvened to Open Session at 10:15 p.m.

CLOSED SESSION ACTIONS TAKEN

President Holober reported that at the Closed Session just concluded, the Board voted 5-0 to approve the items listed as 1A and 1B on the printed agenda.

ADJOURNMENT

It was moved by Trustee Schwarz and seconded by Vice President Mandelkern to adjourn the meeting. The motion carried, all members voting "Aye." The meeting was adjourned at 10:17 p.m.

Submitted by

Ron Galatolo, Secretary

Approved and entered into the proceedings of the October 12, 2011 meeting.

Dave Mandelkern, Vice President-Clerk