

Program Name: MANA Learning Community  
Program Contact: Fi Tovo  
Academic Year: 2022-2023  
Active Learning Community (ASLT)  
Updated on: 9/15/23

### Expanding MANA 2023: Reimagining Retention at CSM

The goal of this program review is to assess the wellness of MANA's enrollment and retention methods in our classrooms and on-campus engagement.

California is home to the largest Asian American population in the United States with 6,799,259 residents, as well as the nation's second largest Native Hawaiian and Pacific Islander (NHPI) community with 332,371 NHPI residents (Reddy, Lee and Siqueiros, 2022). Representing over 15% of the state's residents, Asian American and NHPI Californians comprise the second largest racial/ethnic minority group in the state. Based on CSM's course enrollment [dashboard](#), there has been a steady decrease of Pacific Islander students enrolling since 2020. In fact, before 2020-2021, the enrollment of Native Hawaiian Pacific Islanders was at an all-time high of 324 in 2019-2020 academic year. Today, dashboard reported 273 NHPI students enrolled in 2022-2023. Although these numbers do not encompass the full campus, these numbers show a pattern that is unique to a population, that our college has fully supported in the last 9 years (we are still shocked that we are coming up in our 10 years of MANA's journey). This program review will assess the data and progress of NHPI students enrolled in Mana at CSM by discussing the following:

- the completion and transition of post pandemic Covid-19 lockdown to 100% in person courses and services
- results of applying student learning-based research into pedagogy + campus engagement
- new challenges or changes to the program.
- Identify resources that MANA will need to improve enrollment and retention of NHPI students at CSM.

This program review will end with the request of a 100% learning specialist/retention specialist to sustain MANA's method and approach to serve the larger Native Hawaiian Pacific Islander (NHPI) students at CSM and perhaps, expanding MANA coordination to offer support to our sister colleges in our district. Finally, in addition to a 100% learning specialist/retention specialist, MANA is advocating for a 100% program services coordinator for the Village learning communities.

## **1. MANA History & Enrollment Trends**

### *Mana, the Journey So Far (2014-2022)*

CSM's Mana Learning Community provides Native Hawaiian Pacific Islander (NHPI) students with a bridge to higher education and a transition support program that centralizes intrusive retention strategies throughout their academic journey in community college. Mana adopted the cohort model in Fall 2014 to guide its students towards degree and transfer success through culturally responsive instruction and academic support. Since that foundational period, Mana has added a certificate in Critical Pacific Islands & Oceania Studies, a Mana advisory board (which includes CSM administration, faculty and staff) that meets monthly, three student led organizations, and hosts culturally responsive campus events.

The MANA program is in its 9<sup>th</sup> year of operation serving as a college "one-stop shop" for Native Hawaiian Pacific Islander students and their families in San Mateo County. MANA is not a traditional

instruction support program that would cohort a course and track students' progress, rather, in addition to that instructional piece, MANA offers a wraparound student service approach that guides NHPI students' transition into community college and then, transition out, when they transfer to their 4-years (or into their career/vocational aspirations). In addition to specialized workshops and activities, MANA provides 2 instructional courses for students to register every semester. For example, Ethnic Studies, Communication, Film, History, and Counseling departments have partnered with MANA to offer general education courses that provide culturally responsive curriculum to MANA students. Working together across departments, divisions and cultural differences, MANA has opportunities to grow and expand while also changing outdated policies that do not equitably fit the current campus (both in person and virtual) climate. Lastly, because MANA is the first of its kind in the California Community College Education system, Mana has also been the model in which other California Community Colleges have replicated in their respective campuses (Mira Costa CC, El Camino CC, Long Beach CC). Other colleges like Chabot College, have benefited in contracting MANA to support their newly established 'Pacific Islanders in America' course, in Ethnic studies.

### *Asian Americans and Native Hawaiians Pacific Islander Enrollment Report*

California is home to the largest Asian American population in the United States with 6,799,259 residents, as well as the nation's second largest Native Hawaiian and Pacific Islander (NHPI) community with 332,371 NHPI residents (Reddy, Lee and Siqueiros, 2022). Representing over 15% of the state's residents, Asian American and NHPI Californians comprise the second largest racial/ethnic minority group in the state. This population is incredibly diverse and includes a mix of US-born and non-native residents and have ancestries and backgrounds from over 48 different ethnicities. Asian Americans and NHPIs have a reputation for being successful students, with data on academic outcomes often painting the portrait of a high-performing group, especially for East and South Asian Americans. These perceptions, however, stem from group averages that mask the variation in both access to higher education and success after college enrollment in our state's educational pipeline, and they have given rise to a common misconception that Asian Americans and NHPIs attending our nation's colleges and universities are all succeeding without a need for better or more targeted support. Not only does this model minority myth harm students, but it also hamstring college leaders and policy makers in ensuring practice and policy decisions reflect their constituents' needs.

Failing to disaggregate the data and understand the variations that exist within the Asian American and NHPI communities will result in educational practices and policymaking that fails to fully understand or address the needs of California's Asian American and NHPI residents. Data shared in Reddy et. Al.'s (2022) Campaign for college report show the wide variation in college preparation, attendance, and success for the state's Asian American and NHPI students. For example, although enrollment for Asian Americans and NHPIs at the California State University (CSU) and University of California (UC) systems held steady or rose between 2019 and 2021, Asian American and NHPI enrollment at the CCCs plummeted by 20% due to the COVID-19 global pandemic. Contextualizing the pandemic's impact revealed the fluctuating enrollment that Mana experienced amidst the intersecting health and financial challenges.

## **2. Results of Previous Program Review 2012-2022**

In our previous program review (Tovo, 2022), we discussed the impact of connecting MANA students to the campus and community, increasing the NHPI representation in CSM's curriculum, diving deeper into CSM's equity plan, and inserting the MANA model into statewide conversations and programming. More specifically, we aimed to increase NHPI representation in curriculum including the CSM equity plan, establish MANA as a statewide resource hub for Pacific Island Studies in California, and improving institution capacity in supporting NHPI students in college. This review then became our vision for

MANA's retention and enrollment assessment for 2021-2022. For example, MANA staff and students started to join on campus opportunities and off campus large webinars to share their academic experiences. With the help of our MANA students, we completed specialized on campus/off campus activities:

- Student Equity Student Survey 2022
- California Community College Chancellor's Webinar
- Asian Pacific American Higher Education Conference
- Community Engagement on campus events
- High school outreach presentations by Vakatasi Student Org

With CSM transitioning back from fully remote to fully in person instruction and support, 2021-2022 was a very difficult year for students. Without the proper guidance, CSM students who were often first in their families to attend college, did not have experience in how they were suppose to navigate through a campus which different courses had different modes of instruction delivery (ie: hybrid, asynchronous, in-person, online). MANA students relied on MANA's specialized workshops, student leadership organization (Vakatasi), MANA's classrooms to help push them through the transition. This was the reason why Vakatasi joined PRIE in a focus group discussion on their experiences in re-joining CSM and the transition. In addition, MANA staff joined thousands of California Community College professionals to share MANA's lived experiences as transitioning back to on campus was happening in real time. Speaking to the Chancellor's webinar and at APAHE allowed for the narrative of improving NHPI's representation to be contexed in MANA's program to offer recommendations and policy connections. Working together as students and staff, MANA and Vakatasi brought back non-profit organization collaboration, MANA family night, MANA Graduation, and our weekly high school outreach and presentations. These activities, although small, pieced together a new foundation of MANA's role to both its students, CSM campus and its family.

It is not a coincidence that MANA, resource hub for NHPI scholarship and research, must re-think our role to our students, campuses, and families in our communities (both in the Bay Area and Oceania). MANA has become a key player in every part of understanding the NHPI student experience and has many opportunities to grow and extend our help to our campus. However, because we are the first of our kind, we have also carried a lot on our plate as a resource hub and as an ethnic studies-based learning community. After our 2021-2022 academic year, MANA is climbing as a model for NHPI College Success as MANA received an astonishing e-mail after participating and writing in the APIA Scholars Research Project:

*Hello Fi and team,*

*We have some great news! The Department of Education reached out to us for input on speakers for the Raising the Bar summit (May 1, 2023) focused on effectively using data to improve student outcomes. We highlighted the NHPI report, and they were interested in the Mana Program and the Oceania Certificate program.*

*The Department of Education sent Dr. Taylor-Mendoza an invitation to attend a one-day summit on Monday, May 1, 2023, at the U.S. Department of Education headquarters in Washington, D.C. In the invitation, Dr. Taylor-Mendoza was encouraged to bring a team that included the following: 1) a representative leading your student success/support initiatives, 2) a representative leading your institutional research/effectiveness efforts and 3) a faculty member as part of your team if they support either your student success or institutional effectiveness efforts.*

We are reaching out to ensure that this team connect with Dr. Taylor-Mendoza to take advantage of this opportunity to bring more visibility to College of San Mateo and your work. Dr. Teranishi has offered his time to help prep the team for this opportunity. Please reach out to him directly to schedule time this week or next. Thank you all and I look forward to your response.

Warmly,

Florie

**Florie Mendiola, Ed.D**

*Pronouns: She, her, hers*

Senior Director, Research & Pacific Island Partnerships

1850 M Street NW, Suite 245, Washington, D.C 20036

Donate today by texting “APIASCHOLARS” to 44-321

Office: (202) 715-0788

[florie.mendiola@apiascholars.org](mailto:florie.mendiola@apiascholars.org) / [www.apiascholars.org](http://www.apiascholars.org)

This e-mail shows the endless opportunities for NHPI College success, when the team (students, faculty, staff, administration) moves together for a common purpose and goal. This e-mail brought tears to everyone involved’s eyes. MANA is so proud to be part of a campus that allowed NHPI students and families to shine through the fog of data invisibility. MANA students, staff, and local community in San Mateo County has worked together in the last 9 years to get to this space of impact: The U.S. department of education. Although administration attending *Raising The Bar* Summit in person did not choose to take a MANA staff representee to this summit, this demonstrate the impact that MANA’s story at CSM is valued and seen at the federal space of Education. This e-mail also re-affirms that MANA programming has two roles: 1) We are NHPI college success experts that are recognized at the state-wide and federal level of education data and policy discussions 2) We are still a learning community providing retention success to students on campus. Both roles, although very powerful and important, allows is not sustainable with just 1 classified staff and a few adjunct faculty. A 100% MANA retention specialist will allow MANA to solidify both roles in contributing to federal and national policies and increase NHPI enrollment and retention at CSM, simultaneously. MANA does the work, and therefore, supporting MANA is supporting the critical work that is happening outside our campus walls.

**3. Current MANA Program Review (Data/Profile)**

College Stats 2022-23	Ethnicity	First Gen	Age	Gender	Total
<b>Enrollments (duplicated)</b>	Latinx 35% White 26% Asian 16% Filipino 6% Multiracial 8% Black 3% <b>Pacific Islander 3%</b> Unknown 3% Native American 0%	47% of enrollments were by students who are the first in their family to go to college.	76% 24 yrs. and under 13% Ages 25-34 11% over 35 yrs.	48% Female 50% Male 2% Non-disclosed or non-binary	37,014 enrollments

<b>Headcount (unduplicated)</b>	Latinx 32% White 26% Asian 20% Filipino 7% <b>Multiracial 7%</b> Black 3% <b>Pacific Islander 2%</b> Unknown 3% Native American 0%	45% of our students are the first in their family to go to college.	66% 24 yrs. and under 18% Ages 25-34 17% over 35 yrs.	49% Female 48% Male 3% Non-disclosed or non-binary	13,180 students
<b>Unduplicated Headcount for Mana (2022-2023)</b>	Latinx 3.7% White 0.0% Asian 0.0% Filipino 0.9% <b>Multiracial 12.1%</b> Black 2.8% <b>Pacific Islander 79.4%</b> Unknown 0.9% Native American 0%	43.2% of our students are the first in their family to go to college.	Age >18 10.3% Age 18-22 77.6% Age 23-28 11.2% Age 29-29 .9%	41% Female 59% Male Reported	94 Cohort Students
<b>Unduplicated Headcount for Mana (2021-2022)</b>					77 Cohort Students
<b>Unduplicated Headcount for Mana (2020-2021)</b>	Asian 3.7% Filipino 3.7% Hispanic/Latino 3.7% <b>Pacific Islander 85.2%</b> <b>Multiracial 1.9%</b> Unreported 1.9%	98.1 % of our Mana students reported as degree/transfer students.	Age Under 18 3.7% Age 18-22 90.7% Age 23-28 5.6% Unreported 1.9%	46.2% Female 51.9% Male 1.9% Unreported	158 Cohort Students
<b>Unduplicated Headcount for Mana (2019-2020)</b>	Asian 3.8% Filipino 1.9% Hispanic/Latino 3.8% <b>Pacific Islander 84.6%</b> <b>Multiracial 1.9%</b>	88.5% of our Mana students reported as degree/transfer students	Age Under 18 26.9% Age 18-22 71.2% Age 23-28 1.9%	46.2% Female 51.9% Male 1.9% Unreported	52 Cohort Students

<b>Unduplicated Headcount for Mana (2018-2019)</b>	Asian 5.6% Filipino 2.8% Hispanic/Latino 8.3% <b>Pacific Islander 75%</b> <b>Multiracial 8.3%</b>	100% of our Mana students reported as degree/transfer students	Age Under 18 22.2% Age 18-22 75.0% Age 23-28 2.8%	55.6% Female 44.4% Male	36 Cohort Students
--	---	--	---	----------------------------	--------------------

**a) Student population equity:**

Looking at the patterns of enrollment for MANA (in comparison to the larger campus), there are a few new connections as a result of assessing Figure 1's table. In the context of enrollment and retention, there is a clear decline of females registering at CSM and MANA. In fact, since 2018-2019 with 55.6% females and 44.4 males enrolled in MANA's cohort, MANA has seen the decline in numbers with 2019-2020, (enrolling 46.2% females, and 51.9% males, and 1.9% unreported) to 2022-2023 (enrolling 41% females and 59% males). This is alarming because when looking to the main campus, females represent almost half of the 13,180 students at CSM. When thinking about MANA's enrollment and retention process, MANA should acquire support to look more into this. Another interesting discussion is the increase of multiracial students who identify as Pacific Islander and another race that is not White, Asian or native American. PRIE reported that for MANA, there were 79.4% students who identified as Pacific Islander and 12.1% students identified as multiracial, exclusively. Using the reported demographics, there was a correlation of a MANA student being Pacific Islander and multiracially connected to Latin X, Black, and Filipino. This new insight is very important to note that as a Learning Community who is grounded in Pacific Epistemology and ontologies of college success, how are we effectively addressing a new conversation of multi-racial students at CSM. This new demographic insight needs to be addressed and supported by the college in understanding supporting multi-racial students at CSM. Plans to address this is seeking professional development to increase MANA's staff, faculty and students' understanding of being multi-racial or "mixed" race.

<b>Findings</b>	<b>Analysis</b>	<b>Resources</b>	<b>Plans to Address Opportunity Gaps</b>
<b>1.</b> There is a decrease of females enrolling and retained in MANA	Steady decrease of females enrolling and completing in MANA. This is alarming because as the campus has reported almost half half female and male, there has been a decrease in females enrolling in MANA.	PRIE's disaggregated data that cohorts MANA and its comparison to the larger campus	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Creating a plan with MANA advisory to better understand the connection of data and experiences of females in MANA and in college.</li> <li>• Increase the engagement with on campus programs that support females</li> </ul>
<b>2.</b> There is an increase of multi-racial students in MANA	There is an increase of multi-racial students in MANA (12.1%) which is an increase from years prior by a wide gap. This is interesting as CSM's campus	PRIE's disaggregated data allowed MANA to see which races do MANA students identify with; results were LatinX, Filipino, and Black.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Share this information with our CSM Village LC coordinators</li> <li>• Seek professional development in understanding multi-racial students and their lived experiences.</li> </ul>

reported only 7% multi-racial students. This means, there is a correlation between the multi-racial discussion at CSM and the multi-racial discussion in MANA.	
--	--

AA&NHPIs are the fastest growing racial groups in the U.S. and U.S. Affiliated Pacific Islands. The U.S. Census Bureau projects that the AA&NHPI population will increase to nearly 40 million people (about twice the population of New York) by 2060, which is a 100% growth for Asian Americans and a nearly 50% increase for Native Hawaiians and Pacific Islanders.<sup>2</sup> This significant and celebrated rise in population is expected to correspond with AA&NHPI student enrollments in higher education. Indeed, the U.S. Department of Education estimates that AA&NHPI postsecondary enrollment will grow by 12% over the next four years.<sup>3</sup> Given this major increase in population and college attendance, AA&NHPI students are more likely to attend an AANAPISI. Thus, heightened attention towards AANAPISIs is essential to ensure that equitable access to educational opportunity and success exists for the increasing number of AA&NHPI students that are expected to enroll in postsecondary education. In order to equitably respond to our Mana Students and all Learning Community students, there has to be a shift in the way our Learning Community visions and missions are carried out inside the institution. As research continues to influence policies and systems in our community college spaces, our learning communities' unique programs have an opportunity to become a hub of where we produce and reproduce our communities' epistemologies and ontologies through research, curriculum and collaborations. First, there is a need to sit with PRIE (Planning, Research, Innovation, and Effectiveness) and better understand how to read our retention/persistence data so that we can have a better understanding of what the data shows and does not show. Second, there needs to be an instruction department that unites all learning communities' needs for a culturally responsive instruction design, research seminars and finally, attaching certificates, degree and transfer opportunities to our "department".

Currently, MANA has 1 full time staff coordinator, 1 shared counselor and 2 adjunct faculty that directly supports MANA students. For the amount of programming that the MANA Learning community offers to both campus and off campus, there is a need to sustain the Learning community approach of retaining students and supporting them through CSM into 4-Year Transfers. Some colleges call it retention specialist while others call it a transfer success specialist (San Francisco State University) or learning specialist (Cal Berkely). As a public college, CSM MANA is the representation that ALL NHPI college students need at the local Community Colleges because of its ability to braid NHPI culture and identity into the academic profile of our student lived experiences. This MANA only retention success position has the opportunity to build both capacity and support to sustain its role as an ethnic studies based learning community and still be the leading NHPI retention model in California Community colleges. Lastly, the last point to this section is that there is a lack of permanent positions in the MLC overall support structure. There is room for our ASLT division to innovate the MANA brand to extend further than the classroom and campus, but to other colleges in California and across the country. This is an opportunity to protect MANA's boutique cohort model and support the larger equity discussion of the newly diverse population of our college campuses all over the country.

<b>Changes since last Program Review</b>	<b>Analysis of Gaps</b>	<b>Plans to Address Opportunity Gaps</b>
<b>1.</b> Changed LCTR 240 to offer IDST 110 (College 1)	Shifting into research-based learning/reading comprehension created more opportunities for MANA's culturally responsive curriculum and delivery mode	Working with College 1 Educators to implement a new IDST 110 Syllabus for MANA College 1`  <b>Goal Continuing</b>
<b>2.</b> Hired a MANA (student) Mentor as part of our ANNAPISI co-op project with SFSU	Increasing the research-based pedagogy in looking into MANA's data on transfer completion rates.  Creating a pipeline from CSM MANA to SFSU.	Building a Mentor process for MANA's programming and instruction  <b>Goal Continuing</b>
<b>3.</b> Hired a counselor to specifically support MANA amongst other LCs	MANA students required specialized support in transitioning from remote into in-person classes, and coming to campus	Creating a Counseling Process for MANA's transfer and academic requirement support  <b>Goal Continuing</b>

**(c) Challenges and Opportunities:**

CSM Mana has become a resource hub for multiple stakeholders. In the process of being a leader in advocating for NHPI representation in our college, we have also sacrificed the local services that MANA was first celebrated and elevated for. It is very important to note that MANA faculty, staff, students and non-profit organizations has been pushing policy, increasing statewide and federal funding for ALL NHPI students and community, and leading in on campus committees and events. Because of this, our quality of delivering retention services is non-existent. We are not providing the normal services that we use because we do not have enough staff to keep up with the new Collee world we have re-imagined as CSM and MANA. There is an opportunity for CSM to invest in MANA's need to provide quality and authentic work by hiring a position that can come and support the student-to student daily tasks (homework, campus resources, transfer opportunities) and allow the coordinator of the program to take on the larger discussion of data disaggregation and policy advocacy, professional development and overall vision and mission of MANA programming and implementation. With the recent state and federal increase of funds that has been awarded to the college success of NHPI students, CSM has been placed with a great understanding of our statewide priorities of providing a quality and equitable education. CSM Mana is preparing to celebrate its 10 years of Advocating for NHPIs experience and the wide success that we, as a program, have been able to accomplish, together. Without this position, the program is at risk of mental burnout and not sustaining the hard work that has been done by many CSM administrators, faculty, staff and students.

**4. Planning**

<b>SLOs/SAOs</b>	<b>Assessment Plan</b>	<b>Resources for SLO/SAO assessment</b>
------------------	------------------------	---



1. MANA students will be monitored for persistence, retention, and completion in MANA courses in 22Fa and 23SPR	90% of MANA students in IDST 110 will complete the course with a 'C' or better  90% of MANA students in ETHN 104 will complete the course with a C or Better	Continue to monitor guidance courses throughout the year. Monitor Mana student success in both MANA course and non-MANA courses  <b>Goal Continuing</b>
2. MANA program will participate in the ANNAPISI plan and hire a Mana student Mentor 23 Fa and 24 SPR	Mana will have a mentorship component added to its retention model	Mana Coordinator + Student mentor will draft together a MANA Mentorship guidebook for Mana Advisory to finalize and approve.  <b>Goal Continuing</b>
3. MANA program will organize/participate in on-campus activities for students and faculty.	100% of MANA students enrolled in IDST 110 or ETHN 104 will participate in at least 1 campus activity at CSM.	IDST 110 Talanoa Series, Fall NHPI Family Night, Fall Dia De Los Muertos, Fall Mana Research Showcase Fall World Gala, Spring Earth Day, Spring ETHN 104 Talanoa Series, Spring Film Festival, Spring Mana Conference, Spring Pacific Islander Violence Prevention Conference, Spring  <b>Goal Continuing</b>

b) **Program goals**

Goal	Actions	Measurable Outcomes	Timeline	Responsible Party	Support Needed
1. Re-establishing Ethnic Studies into MANA' cohort courses	Approved by Dean  Application process is progressing	What are the experiences of connecting Ethnic Studies back into MANA as a cohort course?	By Summer 2024	Mana Coordinator	Already in motion:  Supported by: Tarana, Jean Marie, and ES department
2. Participation in the ANNAPISI grant and program requirements	Inserting MANA's model into the ANNAPISI grant and conducting research to display results	Survey MANA students in attending ANNAPISI events (APAHE conference, SFSU college tour, AAPI leadership seminars)	By Fall 2024	Mana Coordinator	MANA needs an ANNAPISI coordinator to tell us how to move forward both as an individual learning community and as an AANHPI collective. We are a bit delayed on what is going on with the full

					ANNAPISI research progress.
3. Seeking Rugby as the vision for MANA retention	With the increase of state funds, this is an opportunity to support the discussion of rugby and mana retention	Proposing a Budget for rugby support in MANA retention	By end of Fall 2023	Mana Coordinator	I need support from the business office that help educate me on budget building and discussion on the process of accepting money from outside campus into csm mana programming.

**5. CE Only**

- a) Review the program's available labor market data, as applicable, and explain how the program meets a documented labor market demand. Here are two relevant links:
  - [State of California Employment Development Department, Labor Market Information Division](#) (the official source for California Labor Market Information):
  - [Employment data](#) (by Program Top Code) from the State Chancellor’s Office
- b) Summarize student outcomes in terms of degrees and certificates. Identify areas of accomplishments and areas of concern.
- c) Review and update the program’s Advisory Committee information. Provide the date of most recent advisory committee meeting and outcomes of the meeting (updates, changes, new members, etc.).
- d) What strategies have you discussed in your recent Advisory Committee’s meetings to meet the needs and challenges of getting people retrained and back to work?