## 2023-24 Program Review

Program Name: ESL
Program Contact: Todd Windisch [windischt@smccd.edu](mailto:windischt@smccd.edu)
Academic Year: 2023-2024

## 1. Description of Program

The ESL department offers Writing \& Grammar, Listening \& Speaking, and Reading \& Vocabulary courses in three levels (Levels II-IV), with one transferable Level V Writing and Grammar course. Supplemental courses such as pronunciation and grammar review are offered in select semesters, and Lab-Only Courses focused on vocabulary, listening and speaking, writing and grammar, and reading are offered every semester. The ESL department also offers three certificates of specialization, the Certificates of Academic English (CAE), that students can achieve after completing the three core courses in one level.

The department and the courses align with the College's Mission as we create "access and inclusion" for both domestic and international students of all ages, and welcome students of diverse ethnicities, races, languages, identities, and cultures. Furthermore, language proficiency empowers students, giving them the skills and confidence needed to succeed in future content courses and the workforce. This aligns with the College's value of "empowerment as a means to liberation." Our carefully sequenced program and milestone certificates of specialization also allow students to "[celebrate] both personal and professional accomplishments, milestones, and achievements." Finally, our values are reflected in the College Solidarity Statement; the ESL program is "commit[ted] to creating (and curating) a more welcoming, more inclusive campus" as we strive towards a program culture that is equity-advancing, and making our classrooms a safe space where all students are celebrated and empowered through mindful learning of language skills and independent thinking through diverse content.

Legislation and local initiatives that have impacted our program since the last Program Review include SB893, which has allowed residents of San Mateo County to access courses for free. This, paired with the District MOU allowing classes with enrollment of 10
students to avoid cancellation, has increased enrollment in our program and revitalized our lower-level classes. AB1232, which allows nonresident students to pay resident fees for ESL classes, has also allowed more access for our students and contributed to our increased enrollment. Finally, AB705 and AB1705 continue to place limitations on how we can place students in our program. The ESL program now uses an in-house developed Guided Self-Placement (GSP) tool to place students, allowing students to review examples of assignments and student work from our classes in order to place themselves in their appropriate level.

## 2. Results of Previous Program Review

## a. Goals from 2021-2022 Program Review

i. Enhance consistency of student support from recruitment through completion of our program

- Our 2022 Resource Request for an ESL Program Services Coordinator was approved, and interviews occurred in Summer 2023 with hopes for the candidate to begin in October 2023.
ii. Provide enough sections at each level in a variety of modalities
- A combination of marketing/outreach, SB893, and the District MOU allowing classes with enrollment of 10 students to avoid cancellation has allowed us to run more sections at lower levels. We achieved our goal of running at least one section of each skill in Levels 2 and 3 in Fall 2022 and Fall 2023 (with all but one skill running in Spring 2023). We offered a variety of modalities when courses were permitted back on campus post-pandemic. However, based on student interest/access, second language pedagogy, and F1 visa requirements, we started skewing towards more in-person offerings than distance modalities. As we grow sections, we plan to offer more distance learning options.
iii. Increase enrollment of domestic students
- Our original plan of running mirrored non-credit courses to give more domestic students (particularly undocumented and nonresident students) access to our courses was abandoned in light of new legislation (SB893 and AB1232), which has increased access for those same students. We have achieved this goal, and more detail can be found in Section 3a.


## b. Curriculum or Programmatic Changes Since Last Program Review

The ESL Department has added three certificates of specialization since our last Program Review. Students can earn Certificates of Academic English (CAE) after completing the three core courses in a single level of our program (e.g. ESL 826: Level 2 Writing/Grammar, ESL 856: Level 2 Reading/Vocabulary, and ESL 846: Level 2 Speaking/Listening).

ESL also submitted a certificate of achievement this semester for Curriculum Committee approval. The Proficiency in English for Academic and Career Success (PEACS) certificate of achievement formally recognizes a students' ability to be successful in transfer-level coursework in English and demonstrates the attainment of the English language, communication, and academic skills and knowledge necessary for continued success in college-level courses and the labor market. The PEACS certificate can be earned after completing our highest level ESL writing course, which is transfer-level, along with one communications course and 8 units from other transfer-level courses in college and career readiness from departments such as communications, counseling, literature, and library science.
c. Discipline-level and SLO (Student Learning Outcomes) Findings Since Previous Program Review

No significant strides have been made since our last Program Review in regards to our previous research question of "How are ESL 828 and ESL 400 students faring in the content courses in which they are currently enrolled?" Discussions about co-requisite or co-teaching ESL/CTE courses with other departments (e.g. Dental Assisting, Nursing) have not yet led to concrete results, and we are not sure if there is sufficient demand.

As part of ESL's participation in Guided Pathways and as a result of this SLO project, a chart of recommended content courses for first semester ESL students has been developed and distributed throughout the college (Appendix A).

## 3. Current Program Review

a. Student Population Equity

| Findings | Analysis | Resources | Plans to Address Opportunity Gaps |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 1. $82.2 \%$ increase in overall enrollments (duplicated): <br> - 434 (20-21) <br> - 573 (21-22) <br> - 791 (22-23) | Possible influences: SB893, 6-unit undocumented student fee waiver, AB1232 <br> Enrollment continues to increase semester by semester, without the usual decrease between Fall and Spring: <br> - Fall 21-242 <br> - Spr 22-331 <br> - Fall 22-361 <br> - Spr 23-430 (first semester w/ SB893) | N/A | The ESL department hired four new adjunct professors in Spring 2023 in anticipation of increased enrollment in Fall 2023. <br> Even with new adjunct professors and added sections, many classes had long waitlists, especially in Levels $2 \& 3$, and some students were not able to get into the classes they needed in Fall 2023. <br> The ESL department plans to hire more adjuncts and put in a Resource Request for full-time faculty to staff additional sections, especially as our lower-level cohorts progress through our course sequence and as the Coast-to-College initiative expands. |


| 2. Increase in percentage of domestic students, particularly Hispanic students; however, Hispanic students show lower success rates comparatively. <br> Hispanic student enrollment percentage (duplicated): <br> - $28.1 \%(20-21)$ <br> - $28.8 \%(21-22)$ <br> - $40.6 \%(22-23)$ <br> Overall success rate vs. Hispanic student success rate: <br> - $74.7 \%$ vs. $\underline{72.1 \%}$ (20-21) <br> - $70.3 \%$ vs. $55.8 \%$ (21-22) <br> - $66.9 \%$ vs. $\underline{59.2 \%}$ (22-23) | Hispanic students make up the largest ethnic group in our program, surpassing Asian students, for the first time since before 2016. <br> The low success rates for Hispanic students align with a higher percentage of withdrawals among Hispanic students comparatively and an increase in overall withdrawals. Spring 2023, the first semester with SB893, saw the largest overall withdrawal rate of $15.3 \%$, which may be a result of students feeling empowered to try out classes and withdraw without financial penalty. <br> Overall withdrawal rate vs. Hispanic student withdrawal rate: <br> - $0.9 \%$ vs. $2.5 \%$ (20-21) <br> - $7 \%$ vs. $10.3 \%$ (21-22) <br> - $14.3 \%$ vs. $18.7 \%$ (22-23) <br> Of our three skills classes (writing, reading, listening/speaking), listening/speaking had the lowest overall success rates, and the trends of lower success rates for Hispanic students and higher withdrawal rates remain in line with the analysis of our overall program. <br> 2022-2023 data for listening/speaking classes only: <br> - Overall success rate: $62.5 \%$ <br> - Hispanic success rate: $56.5 \%$ <br> - Overall withdrawal rate: $17.7 \%$ <br> - Hispanic withdrawal rate: $20.4 \%$ | N/A | The ESL department will work closely with our incoming ESL Program Services Coordinator and HSI Math/Science Program Services Coordinator, to support students through matriculation and retention, ensuring they are placed accurately and receive the full benefits and services available to them. |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |

b. Modes of Delivery Equity

| Findings | Analysis | Plans to Address Opportunity Gaps |
| :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 1. Students tend to have higher success rates in face-to-face vs. distance modalities: <br> Student success rates by modality for al classes Spring 2021 - Spring 2023: <br> - Face-to-face: 71.5\% <br> - Distance modes: 68.7\% | The gap in success rates between modalities seems to be particularly acute for Asian and Hispanic students. <br> Domestic Asian student success rates: <br> - Face-to-face: $80.4 \%$ <br> - Distance modes: 73.2\% <br> International Asian student success rates: <br> - Face-to-face: $85.5 \%$ <br> - Distance modes: 74.9\% <br> Hispanic student success rates: <br> - Face-to-face: 65.9\% <br> - Distance modes: 58.9\% <br> Distance modes include our lab-only courses, which have overall lower success \& retention rates compared to general ESL courses. | As we work with our new ESL PSC to develop an action plan to support ESL students, we should consider creating specific interventions to support students working within distance modalities (i.e. workshops for tech support and time management/study skills). |
| 2. Distance mode options have decreased post-pandemic. <br> Percent of classes offered face-to-face vs. distance modes (hybrid, online synchronous): <br> - Fall 21: $17 \%$ vs. $83 \%$ <br> - Spr 22: $42 \%$ vs. $58 \%$ <br> - Fall 22: $55 \%$ vs. $45 \%$ <br> - Spr 23: 61\% vs. $39 \%$ | Student interest/access, second language pedagogy favoring face-to-face modalities, and F1 visa requirements that students must take a certain amount of in-person units have pushed our program towards more face-to-face sections. | Anecdotally, we know that some students were able to access our classes for the first time through distance learning options and that face-to-face options do not always work for them. While that population might be smaller than students who prefer face-to-face classes, it's important to ensure access across the board, and the ESL department will consider prioritizing distance modalities as we add additional sections of classes to the schedule. |

## c. Challenges and Opportunities

Our biggest challenge as a program at this moment is meeting the demand of our increased enrollment, including the prospect of offering additional programming in Half Moon Bay as the Coast-to-College Initiative moves forward, and developing new processes and procedures with our new ESL PSC to ensure wraparound support services for ESL students from matriculation to graduation. We are actively recruiting and hiring new adjunct faculty to support our program's growth, and we look forward to collaborating with the Strategic Initiatives and Economic Development (SVIED) division, where our ESL PSC is housed, to create an effective onboarding process for this new staff position, which is on track to begin after Board approval in October 2023.

## 4. Planning

a. Discipline-level and SLO (Student Learning Outcomes) Assessment

| SLOs/SAOs | Assessment Plan | Resources |
| :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Research Questions: Now that ESL is consistently offering classes in each level of our program... <br> - Are there any persistence roadblocks in our program where students get stuck, halting their progress? Do SLO's need to be re-evaluated to better prepare students for the next level? <br> - How are students who start at the lowest level of our program faring in our upper-level classes compared with those who are placed into those courses? | We plan to address these questions, with an analysis of success rates, retention rates, and persistence rates of students (disaggregated by race/ethnicity) as they progress through our entire course sequence. <br> September, 2023: Meet with PRIE to establish reasonable request and timeline for data (completed) <br> Fall 2023: Submit data request and invite PRIE to ESL department meeting to refine data request <br> - PRIE has suggested looking at three years of data (Fall 2022 - Spring 2025) as three years aligns with AB705 requirements for students advancing through ESL and our window will end just before our next Program Review when we can reflect on our findings <br> Spring 2024: Initial review of data and revision of assessment plan <br> Fall 2024 \& Spring 2025: Student focus groups; consult PRIE for assistance with focus groups <br> Fall 2025: Complete reflection in next Program Review | - PRIE data \& collaboration <br> - Funding to pay students for focus groups |

b. Program Goals

| Goal | Actions | Measurable Outcome | Timeline | Responsible Party | Support Needed |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 1. Provide consistency of student support from onboarding through enrollment, particularly among Hispanic students | Collaboration with new ESL PSC and HSI PSC | Higher enrollment, retention, and success, particularly among Hispanic students | Spring 2024 onward | ```ESL department SVIED division ESL PSC HSI PSC MCCDC``` | - PSC office hours in the ESL Center <br> - Collaboration between PSC and ESL Department/Center <br> - PSCs need training from <br> 1) Welcome Center <br> 2) ACCEL <br> 3) Admissions <br> 4) Financial Aid <br> 5) ESL Center |
| 2. Offer all skills (at least one section each) in all Level 2 courses | Continue to allow offering Level 2 courses | Level 2 courses listed on WebSchedule and staffed consistently | Spring 2024 onward | ESL Department VPI Dean of LAD | - Continued discussions and collaboration with dean and VPI <br> - Continue offering free college <br> - Make programs for nonresident students and undocumented students (6-unit fee waiver \& AB1232) more visible and accessible through outreach and matriculation support (PSC) <br> - Permanently instate the 10 student minimum for all Level 2 courses. |


| 3. Continue developing new certificate pathways and elective courses | Follow through on Proficiency of English for Academic and Career Success (PEACS) Certificate of Achievement submitted to Curriculum Committee in Fall 2023 for review at September 28 meeting <br> Submit new courses for approval through Curriculum Committee with focus on transfer-level coursework | PEACS Certificate of Achievement approved by local Curriculum Committee and articulated with state <br> Offer at least one new course before next Program Review cycle | $\text { Fall } 2023$ onward | ESL Department CSM Curriculum Committee | - Support from articulation officer in ensuring that language in new course outline(s) will be approved for transfer by the state <br> - Possible support from Academic Senate or other governing bodies in petitioning state for clearer guidelines and more transparency in approving ESL classes for transfer |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |

## Appendix A

GUIDED PATHWAYS RECOMMENDATIONS FOR $1^{\text {ST }}$ SEMESTER ESL STUDENTS

| $\begin{aligned} & \text { ESL } \\ & \text { Level } \end{aligned}$ | ESL Courses | Science and Engineering | Health + Wellness | Arts + Media | Language Arts + SS | Business and Public Service | Explorer |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| $\begin{gathered} \text { Level } \\ 3 \end{gathered}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 827 \text { (W/G) } \\ & 847 \text { (L/S) } \\ & 857 \text { (R) } \end{aligned}$ | MATH | FITN, INDV, TEAM (fitness classes) | DANC ( $1^{\text {st }}$ course in any sequence) |  |  | COUN 111 <br> COUN 120 |
| $\begin{gathered} \text { Level } \\ 4 \end{gathered}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 828 \text { (W/G) } \\ & 848(\mathrm{~L} / \mathrm{S}) \\ & 858(\mathrm{R}) \end{aligned}$ | ARCH 100 <br> CHEM 210 <br> ENGR 210 <br> GEO 100/101 <br> MATH | FITN, INDV, TEAM (fitness classes) | ART 350 <br> DANC ( $1^{\text {st }}$ course in <br> any sequence) <br> DGME 103 <br> DGME 110 <br> DGME 113 (video production) DGME119 (radio production: good for L/S practice) <br> MUS 100 <br> MUS 290 | SOCI 100 | BUS 100 COSM 712 MGMT 100 | COUN 111 COUN 120 |
| $\begin{gathered} \text { Level } \\ 5 \end{gathered}$ | 400 (W/G) 848 (L/S)* (dep on placement) | ARCH 100 <br> CHEM 210 <br> CIS 110 <br> ENGR 210 <br> GEO 100/101 <br> MATH | FITN, INDV, TEAM (fitness classes) KINE 101 | ART 350 <br> DANC ( $1^{\text {st }}$ course in <br> any sequence) <br> DANC 100 <br> DGME 103 <br> DGME 110 <br> DGME 113 (video <br> production) DGME 118 <br> (audio production) <br> DGME119 (radio production: <br> good for L/S) <br> DGME 211 <br> FILM 100 <br> FILM 120 <br> FILM 121 <br> MUS 100 <br> MUS 202 <br> MUS 250 <br> MUS 275 <br> MUS 290 <br> MUS 301 | ANTH 110 <br> ANTH 125 <br> COMM 150 <br> GEOG 110 <br> GEOG 150 <br> PSYCH 100 <br> SOCI 100 | ACTG 100 <br> BUS 100 <br> BUS 420 <br> COSM 712 <br> MGMT 100 | COUN 111 <br> COUN 120 |

